

Futures of Education in emergencies and crisis situations

Second expert consultation



Futures of Education
LEARNING TO BECOME



NORRAG
Network for International Policies and Cooperation in Education and Training
RESEARCH FOR INNOVATION AND TRANSFORMATION
IMPROVING QUALITY AND EQUITY IN EDUCATION

Introductory remarks

This initial segment of the programme featured a series of short presentations to set the stage and the context for this Second Expert Consultation on Education in Emergencies (EiE). [Moira V. Faul](#), Executive Director of NORRAG, welcomed participants and presented the contribution of this expert consultation in helping the Futures of Education team thinking through some questions with regards to their Progress Update Report published in April.

Next, Yvonne Diallo-Sahli, [Advisor of Migration](#)/Education in Emergencies at the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation, shared the SDCs engagement and understanding at a strategic level, and support for the Geneva Global Hub on Education in Emergencies. [Vincent Defourny](#), Director of UNESCO Geneva Liaison Office, then reinforced the importance of EiE to education and other development and humanitarian actors in Geneva and worldwide. He stressed the importance of the moral obligation to ensure that, especially in situations of emergency: no one is left behind; all kinds of situations and forms of diversity are taken into account; and all dominant systems or practices that are reserved for only one part of the population are decolonized.

Our final speaker, [Noah W. Sobe](#), Senior Project Officer for [UNESCO Futures of Education \(FoE\) initiative](#) and Professor at Loyola University, Chicago, gave a brief overview of the FoE initiative. This multiyear UNESCO project has the objective of reimagining how knowledge can reshape the future of humanity and the planet. The initiative can be traced back to the Faure Report (1972) "[Learning to be: the world of education today and tomorrow](#)". This latest iteration of this process is led by an independent [International Commission](#) chaired by the President of Ethiopia that is developing a global report on the Futures of Education to be released in 2021. The Commission is highly reliant on knowledge from education experts, therefore this second online consultation will serve as a useful resource in the development of their report. The overall goal of the project is to generate an agenda, which will mobilize and catalyze an ongoing discussion about the Futures of Education. Finally, Noah provided some information on some of the analysis that was done during previous public consultations, which were leveraged by a unique broad public consultation engagement.

After this introduction, Moira Faul presented the three key questions that would orient the discussion:

- Question 1: What elements are missing in the Progress Update Report, regarding EiE?
- Question 2: Which elements need further development, with regards to EiE?
- Question 3: What is most novel and promising, for EiE, in the forthcoming Report?

Method

28 experts participated, from academia, civil society organisations, the European Commission and UN organisations. In the online meeting, we invited the experts attending to add suggestions individually to the discussion board ([padlet](#)). After reading through all of the suggestions, experts had the opportunity to vote (or not) for each, giving a score from 0-5. To support the voting, experts were asked to speak to their suggestions or ask questions of clarification. Finally, they were given the opportunity to change their vote (up or down) on each suggestion, after which, attention turned to the following question.

Thus, data was collected on the scoring of each suggestion (0-5) by each expert, and the number of experts who voted for that suggestion (see figures in each section for the raw data). We multiplied the strength of the vote (0-5) by the number of votes received to produce a ranking. The results reported below show first the ranking and then the image of the discussion board.

Questions discussed

Question 1: What elements are missing in the Progress Update, regarding EiE?

Rank	Suggestion
1	Refugee-blind. Very little focus on refugees in the document or what happens when persons fall outside of state systems (including refugee teachers).
2	The well-being of the learner.
3	Consider proportion of world's systems in emergency or emergency-like situations. Huge proportion of the world's children are currently in places where education access is very limited and precarious. Universal access is very limited. Long way to move to achieve envisaged futures.
4	Use of alternative learning pathways to ensure learning continuity/ reaching larger numbers of out of school children.
5	Student-focus. I love the idea of thinking in scenarios and I wondered what this might look like if we think about the scenarios from students' experiences.
6	Focus on "fragility" and weak governance needed.
7	Centrality of protection. Report suggests the physical space of the "school" might become less important. How can education continue to be protective during emergencies/ crises?
8	Limited general reference to crises, emergencies and conflict.
9	Strengthen focus on government system strengthening, preparedness and response plans/ mechanisms

- 10 Change "climate change" to "climate CRISIS".
- 11 Diversity and Inclusion of historically marginalized. Could these groups be clearly pointed out: refugees, migrants, persons with disabilities, Indigenous Peoples, IDPs
- 12 Accountability to affected populations and community participation.
- 13 Measuring learning outcomes
- 14 How can education as a public good be reconciled with increasing engagement of private sector?
- 15 Global responsibility sharing/ solidarity
- 16 Financing schemes for ensuring public education, especially for the marginalized like refugees.
- 17 A focus of what structures afford and prohibit in education: how can regenerative education take place within existing structures, power hierarchies, lack of access?
- 18 Teacher's well being
- 19 Obligation of states to deliver. Frame in a way that recognises and continues to hold states to account for their obligations to provide education under UDHR and convention law (e.g Refugee Convention).
- 20 Voice of the pupils/ students.
- 21 Cross-sectoral coordination.
- 22 Strengthen focus on remedial learning strategies and teacher development.
- 23 Resources (finance, human, technical)
- 24 When talking about the "World of Today", a strong emphasis is put on the pandemic while the enormous number of displaced populations is not emphasized.
- 25 Stronger focus on barriers to education in EiE contexts, disproportionate number of OOSC living in countries affected by crisis.
- 26 Stronger focus on learning in EiE settings/ measuring learning and use of formative assessments
- 27 Providing links with protection; thinking in a more integrated approach to education.
- 28 "Architecture". To me, the assumptions underlying the ways these scenarios might play forward are quite similar to the ones we currently operate within. I wondered how we might rethink ideas of "actors and factors" to question these underlying assumptions, e.g. that localization involves "flows" of resources and ideas that move in specific directions; what might a collective organizing vision perhaps bring to our ways of thinking?
- 29 Community Role. One of my doctoral students just completed her dissertation on community based education in Afghanistan. She develops ideas of community as asset and community as obstacle, both operationalized often in International development and EiE. I

wonder how we might further problematize the ways in which community and “others” (non-community) are conceptualized quite rigidly as either one of these (asset or obstacle) and instead bring many dimensions together.

- 30 Little consideration to how proposals will be implemented given the learning poverty and how/ who the future teachers will be.
- 31 Greater flexibility. Flexible systems that expand and contract with population movements (forced and voluntary).
- 32 Rapid Response Mechanisms and early recovery strategies/ strengthening coordination.
- 33 Pathways. Links for pathways after each phase of education.

Figure 1: Image of discussion board for Question 1: What elements are missing?

NORRAG NETWORK • 16 • 8d

FUTURES OF EDUCATION: What elements are missing, particularly with regards to EIE?

Anonymous 8d

Resources (finance, human, technical)

★★★★ (4) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

Refugee-blind

Very little focus on refugees in the document or what happens when persons fall outside of state systems (inc refugee teachers)

★★★★ (14) RATE 2

Sarah Dryden-Peterson 8d

Student-focus

I love the idea of thinking in scenarios and I wondered what this might look like if we think about the scenarios from students' experiences.

★★★★ (9) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

Change 'climate change' to 'climate CRISIS'

★★★★ (5) RATE 1

Anonymous 8d

The well-being of the learner

★★★★ (11) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

voice of the pupils/students

★★★★ (5) RATE 1

Anonymous 8d

Diversity and Inclusion of historically marginalized

Could these groups be clearly pointed out: refugees, migrants, persons with disabilities Indigenous Peoples, IDPs

★★★★ (4) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

Use of alternative learning pathways to ensure learning continuity/ reaching larger numbers of out of school children

★★★★ (10) RATE 0

OkKleigh 8d

A focus of what structures afford and prohibit in education: how can regenerative education take place within existing structures, power hierarchies, lack of access?

★★★★ (3) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

Rapid Response Mechanisms and early recovery strategies/ strengthening coordination

★★ (4) RATE 2

Anonymous 8d

pathways

links for pathways after each phase of education

★ (3) RATE 1

Sarah Dryden-Peterson 8d

'Architecture'

To me, the assumptions underlying the ways these scenarios might play forward are quite similar to the ones we currently operate within. I wondered how we might re-think ideas of "actors and factors" to question these underlying assumptions, e.g. that localization involves "flows" of resources and ideas that move in specific directions; what might a collective organizing vision perhaps bring to our ways of thinking?

★★★ (3) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

Stronger focus on learning in EIE settings/ measuring learning and use of formative assessments

★★★ (5) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

Measuring Learning Outcomes

★★★★ (5) RATE 2

Anonymous 8d

Obligation of states to deliver

Frame in a way that recognises and continues to hold states to account for their obligations to provide education under UDHR and convention law (e.g Refugee Convention). Jennifer

★★★ (6) RATE 2

Anonymous 8d

Little consideration to how proposals will be implemented given the learning poverty and how who the future teachers will be

★★★ (4) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

When talking about the 'World of Today', a strong emphasis is put on the pandemic while the enormous number of displaced populations is not emphasized.

★★★ (4) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

Strengthen focus on remedial learning strategies and teacher development

★★★★ (1) RATE 0

Barbara Zeus 8d

centrality of protection

report suggests the physical space of the 'school' might become less important. how can education continue to be protective during emergencies/crises?

★★★★ (7) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

How can education as public good be reconciled with increasing engagement of private sector?

★★★★ (5) RATE 1

Anonymous 8d

Consider proportion of the world's systems in emergency or emergency-like situations.

Huge proportion of the world's children are currently in places where education access is very limited and precarious. Universal access very limited. Long way to move to achieve envisaged futures.

★★★★ (10) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

providing links with protection; thinking in a more integrated approach to education

★★★ (3) RATE 0

Sarah Dryden-Peterson 8d

Community role

Zuhra Faizi, one of my doctoral students, just completed her dissertation on community based education in Afghanistan. She develops ideas of community as asset and community as obstacle, both operationalized often in International development and EIE. I wonder how we might further problematize the ways in which community and "others" (non-community) are conceptualized quite rigidly as either one of these (asset or obstacle) and instead bring many dimensions together.

★★★★ (4) RATE 1

Anonymous 8d

Greater flexibility

Flexible systems that expand and contract with population movements (forced and voluntary).

★★ (3) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

Teacher's well being

★★★ (5) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

Stronger focus on barriers to education in EIE contexts, disproportionate number of OOSC living in countries affected by crisis

★★★ (5) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

Financing schemes for ensuring public education especially for the marginalized like refugees

★★★★ (4) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

Global responsibility sharing / solidarity

★★★★ (7) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

Limited general reference to crises, emergencies and conflict.

★★★★ (7) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

Accountability to affected populations and community participation

★★★★ (5) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

Strengthen focus on government system strengthening, preparedness and response plans/ mechanisms

★★★★ (7) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

Focus on 'fragility' and weak governance needed

★★★★ (9) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

Financing schemes for ensuring public education especially for the marginalized like refugees

★★★★ (4) RATE 0

Anonymous 8d

Limited general reference to crises, emergencies and conflict.

★★★★ (7) RATE 0

Lisa Sabot-Schmid 8d

Cross-sectoral coordination

★★★ (5) RATE 0

Question 2: Which elements need further development, with regards to EiE?

Rank Suggestion

- 1 Early childhood development. ECD is too often deprioritized in emergency response, but research and evidence have shown the importance of ECD in ensuring children reach their full potential.
- 2 Peace and peacebuilding. Peace and peaceful societies are mentioned repeatedly, but without the nuance often articulated by research and evidence from EiE.
- 3 Consider causes of inequality, exclusion and emergency.
- 4 Stronger focus on barriers to education in EiE contexts, disproportionate number of OOSC living in countries affected by crisis.
- 5 Gender aspects could be more explicitly addressed and strengthened in the report.
- 6 Consider continuum of educational contexts and different roles state/ non-state providers play across this continuum.
- 7 Stronger focus on learning in EIE settings/ measuring learning and use of formative assessments.
- 8 Consider including role and impact of protracted crises and emergencies - this can be linked to the governance and democracy aspects.
- 9 Strengthen and go beyond rights-based approach. Great emphasis on rights-based approach which is key for EiE; important to also highlight education's life-saving and life-sustaining character in emergencies / crises; how education builds resilience and bridges to durable solutions and development.
- 10 Use of alternative learning pathways to ensure learning continuity/ reaching larger numbers of out of school children.
- 11 Elaborate further on the role of the private sector when talking about education as a "common good".
- 12 Shifting demographics and human mobility. This is a point where displacement can be a focus - also the inclusion of lifelong learning could also focus on diverse pathways in education.
- 13 Strengthen focus on remedial learning strategies and teacher development
- 14 Greater emphasis on human capital development - i.e. how education/ health are two sides of the same coin and how it can help to mitigate the impact of emergencies on the child.
- 15 "How we approach our interdependencies". To me, this seems like a place where the ideas around responsibility sharing and the obligations of individuals and nation-states could come in – both how we think and learn about interdependencies (as a key role of what and

- how learning happens) and how we act on those interdependencies (governance, financing).
- 16 Some granularity when talking about regenerative education related to EIE, crises and displacement.
 - 17 COVID highlighted digital divide; future should not have a skills/ quality divide. Considering learning poverty, systemic inequalities etc - how can a future ensure more equitable education access?
 - 18 Connecting students/ learning across borders. Collective learning, engagement, thinking about social justice and anti-racism movements not just within nation-states (as currently within nation-state centric curriculum) but across. This could be emphasized perhaps.
 - 19 Link the COVID pandemic to other crises (including other health crises) and how they impact education.
 - 20 Peace element in education.
 - 21 Use of digital technologies and supporting learning.
 - 22 Protective role of education. It was mentioned however the need for young FDPs to have a safe space free of threat.
 - 23 Frame in a way that recognizes and continues to hold states to account for their obligations to provide education under UDHR and convention law (e.g. Refugee Convention).
 - 24 A focus of what structures afford and prohibit in education: how can regenerative education take place within existing structures, power hierarchies, lack of access?
 - 25 More focus on alternative education
 - 26 Corruption, governance, use of resources from donors and state budget.

Figure 2: Image of discussion board for Question 2: Which elements need further development?

NORRAG NETWORK + 12 @ 8d

FUTURES OF EDUCATION: Which elements need further development, particularly with regards to EIE?

From previous Padlet:
Strengthen focus on remedial learning strategies and teacher development

★★★★ (4) RATE

From previous Padlet:
Stronger focus on learning in EIE settings/ measuring learning and use of formative assessments

★★★★ (6) RATE

From previous padlet:
Use of alternative learning pathways to ensure learning continuity/ reaching larger numbers of out of school children

★★★★ (5) RATE

From previous Padlet
Stronger focus on barriers to education in EIE contexts, disproportionate number of OOSC living in countries affected by crisis

★★★★ (7) RATE

From Previous Padlet:
A focus of what structures afford and prohibit in education: how can regenerative education take place within existing structures, power hierarchies, lack of access?

★★★ (2) RATE

From Previous Padlet
Frame in a way that recognises and continues to hold states to account for their obligations to provide education under UDHR and convention law (e.g Refugee Convention).
Jennifer

★★★ (2) RATE

Shifting demographics and human mobility
This is a point where displacement can be a focus - also the inclusion of lifelong learning could also focus on diverse pathways in education

★★★★ (6) RATE

Protective role of education
It was mentioned however the need for young FDPs to have a safe space free of threat

★★★★ (1) RATE

Consider causes of inequality, exclusion and emergency

★★★★ (9) RATE

Link the covid pandemic to other crises (including other health crises) and how they impact education

★★★★ (2) RATE

Use of digital technologies and supporting learning

★★★ (3) RATE

Strengthen and go beyond rights-based approach
great emphasis on rights-based approach which is key for EIE; important to also highlight education's life-saving and life-sustaining character in emergencies / crises; how education builds resilience and bridges to durable solutions and development.

★★★★ (7) RATE

Peace and peacebuilding
Peace and peaceful societies are mentioned repeatedly, but without the nuance often articulated by research and evidence from EIE.

★★★★ (11) RATE

COVID highlighted digital divide; future should not have a skills/ quality divide
Considering learning poverty, systemic inequalities etc - how can a future ensure more equitable education access?

★★★★ (4) RATE

Greater emphasis on human capital development - i.e. how education/health are two side of the same coin and how it can help to mitigate the impact of emergencies on the child

★★★★ (4) RATE

Corruption, governance, use of resources from donors and state budgets

★ RATE

"How we approach our interdependencies"
To me, this seems like a place where the ideas around responsibility sharing and the obligations of individuals and nation-states could come in - both how we think and learn about interdependencies (as a key role of what and how learning happens) and how we act on those interdependencies (governance, financing).

★★★★ (4) RATE

Consider continuum of educational contexts and different roles state/non-state providers play across this continuum

★★★★ (6) RATE

Early Childhood Development
ECD is too often deprioritized in emergency response, but research and evidence have shown the importance of ECD in ensuring children reach their full potential.

★★★★ (12) RATE

Connecting students/ learning across borders
Collective learning, engagement, thinking about social justice and anti-racism movements not just within nation-states (as currently within nation-state centric curriculum) but across. This could be emphasized perhaps.

★★★★ (4) RATE

consider including role and impact of protracted crises and emergencies - this can be linked to the governance and democracy aspects

★★★★ (5) RATE

Elaborate further on the role of the private sector when talking about education as a 'common good'.

★★★★ (5) RATE

Some granularity when talking about regenerative education related to EIE, crises and displacement

★★★★ (3) RATE

peace element in education

★★★ (3) RATE

More focus on alternative education

★★ (1) RATE

gender aspects could be more explicitly addressed and strengthened in the report

★★★★ (6) RATE

Question 3: What is most novel and promising, for EiE, in the forthcoming Report as currently envisioned?

Rank	Suggestion
1	Importance given to teachers. Teachers play a critical role in shaping the future of their students, teacher training is even more important in EiE.
2	The Common/ Commoning. These ideas – the noun and the verb – seem really productive in re-framing how we think about collective responsibility, which is so essential in EiE and for non-citizens, including refugees.
3	“A decolonization of the curriculum, and the unlearning of any number of things that have contributed to our current challenges”. This is an important aspect.
4	Adult education. Given the gaps in education in EiE, children grow to be adults who missed out on formal schooling. This has been a critical gap in our programming and policy – it’s nice to see it highlighted.
5	Regenerative education emphasis. This seems particularly relevant to transformative learning in EiE.
6	A new/ stronger social contract between education and society.
7	The idea of education as a common good (collective global responsibility, co-construction, bottom-up approaches).
8	Solidarity: I appreciated the ideas around solidarity that framed the progress report and see how these ideas could be central to re-thinking how we see.
9	Attention given to content and methods of teaching and learning.
10	“Pedagogical modes that foreground the relational and collective aspects of teaching and learning.”
11	Centring of the climate crisis and breakdown.
12	Importance and core role of the teacher and the teaching profession.
13	Teacher education and professional development has been highlighted as critical in provision of quality education.
14	Collaboration is key among all stakeholders.
15	The concept of regenerative education has the ability to open us deeper discussions in EiE.

Figure 3: Image of discussion board for Question 3: What is most novel and promising?

The discussion board features several key posts:

- The Common/ Commoning** (Sarah Dryden-Peterson): Discusses the productive re-framing of collective responsibility in EIE.
- Importance given to teachers** (Lisa Sabot-Schmid): Notes the critical role of teachers in shaping the future.
- The concept of regenerative education has the ability to open up deeper discussions in EIE** (Anonymous): A central theme connecting to other posts.
- Regenerative education emphasis** (Anonymous): Highlights its relevance to transformative learning.
- "a decolonization of the curriculum, and the unlearning of any number of things that have contributed to our current challenges"** (Anonymous): Points to an important aspect of the curriculum.
- A new/stronger social contract between education and society** (Anonymous): A key conceptual point.
- importance and core role of the teacher and the teaching profession** (Anonymous): Focuses on the teacher's role.
- Collaboration is key-among all stakeholders** (Anonymous): Emphasizes the need for collaboration.
- Centring of the climate crisis and breakdown** (Anonymous): Addresses the climate crisis.
- attention given to content and methods of teaching and learning** (Anonymous): Discusses pedagogical methods.
- The idea of education as a common good good (collective global responsibility, co-construction, bottom-up approaches)** (Anonymous): Explores education as a common good.
- teacher education and professional development has been highlighted as critical in provision of quality education** (Anonymous): Focuses on teacher development.
- Adult education** (Anonymous): Discusses gaps in education for adults.
- Solidarity** (Sarah Dryden-Peterson): Appreciates the ideas of solidarity framing the progress report.
- "pedagogical modes that foreground the relational and collective aspects of teaching and learning."** (Anonymous): Discusses pedagogical modes.