



What “Good” Is Schooling? The New Edu-Philanthropies and Education Reform

	Source of Wealth	Types of Interests
Broad	Developing, investing	Charters, Incentive Pay, Training, Prizes
Dell	Tech	Charter schools, Ed Tech (US, RSA, India)
Fisher	Retail	Charter schools (KIPP), TFA
Gates	Tech, Investing (Buffett)	Charters, Teacher Effects, Ed Tech, (Int'l)
Robertson	Investing	Vouchers, Charters (Success), Information
Walton	Retail (2 nd generation)	Vouchers, Charters, Research, Campaigns
Emerson	Tech	Ed Tech, Secondary Schools, Charters
Chan/Zuckerberg	Tech	Charters, Private Schools, Ed Tech (Int'l)

Diagnosis:

“ineffective schools - driven by unaccountable school administrators and elected officials”

Remedy:

“all children have access to high-quality educational opportunities.” ...foster “competition by supporting the development of charter schools, voucher programs, and resources that enable

“It would be great if our education stuff worked, but that we won’t know for probably a decade”

--Bill Gates



The school-choice community has done this very effectively. In Wisconsin, [two smaller edu-philanthropists] were instrumental in getting the Milwaukee Parental Choice Program passed — the first real voucher model in the country. They were then instrumental in providing political air cover for the program. They found and supported researchers to document it, and they helped promote it nationally. The Walton Foundation has done the same thing with charter schools... —Rick Hess



What “Good” Is Education?

- Search goods
- Experience goods
- Credence goods
- Positional goods
- Communal goods
- Consumer goods



Indianapolis

- Reform success story (in implementation)
- Largest city in most reformed state (open-enrollment, charters, vouchers)
- Mayoral prerogative
- 2 major policy advocacy orgs (supported by edu-philanthropy)
- Formed model coalitions with Mitch Daniels and Mike Pence
- 52 charter schools



Terms Used to Indicate Community & Business/Individual Consumer Orientations

COMMUNITY	CONSUMER
Community Service (in community sense) Civic Citizens Democracy Responsibility	Excellence Achievement Success Opportunity Best CEO Services (available to consumer) College (Preparatory) Career, Employability Credential (Tuition)“Free” (implying education should cost) Personalized Full potential



Carpe Diem Charter School:

We will empower scholars by developing their character in an effort to ensure that they are productive members of the community. Finally, we will equip our students for life including attention to 1) health and wellness, 2) the capacity to be productively employed, 3) the skills necessary to fully engage in business and community life...



Christel House Academies:

Building aspirations and dreams is the fuel for success. Our aim is not to sort students — it is to transform them into more intelligent, poised and thoughtful individuals. We've not succeeded unless we are producing graduates who are employable, good neighbors, active and concerned citizens who seek to establish positive family relationships.



Indiana Math & Science Academy:

Our schools provide many resources to prepare students for ACT and SAT, college applications, scholarships, and grant programs.



Excel Center Charter School:

The Excel Center® is a free public high school that gives adults the opportunity to earn an Indiana Core 40 high school diploma. While earning a high school diploma, students earn college credits and a variety of industry-recognized certifications.



Indiana Connections Career Academy:

...has a strong focus on career readiness. [I]t is a comprehensive and integrated fully online high school that combines career exploration, career planning and work based experiences to provide pathways to employability, career, or study at a college or trade school. Students interested in starting a career immediately after graduation can pursue a program of study in one of five in-demand career clusters.



KIPP charter school:

Our goal is to help students develop the knowledge, skills, and character strengths they need to succeed throughout their education and in the competitive world beyond.



Purdue Polytechnic High School:

PPHS is a FREE Public Charter School that fully integrates STEM and Design Thinking. Students who attend Purdue Polytechnic High School will:

LEARN THROUGH STEM AND DESIGN THINKING IMMERSION:

PPHS curriculum fully integrates STEM and industry standard Design Thinking.

BE INSPIRED TO LEARN (PERSONALIZED LEARNING):

Students are exposed to a wide variety of careers to help them find passions inside and outside the classroom. Teachers and students work together to schedule individual and group learning with a range of formats.



Purdue Polytechnic High School: (continued)

LEARN BY DOING: Our learn-by-doing environment inspires students to achieve their full potential.

UNDERSTAND REAL-WORLD APPLICATION OF THEIR EDUCATION: Students see first-hand how their education [sic] is applicable in real-world settings through our industry partnerships.

EARN DIRECT ADMITTANCE TO PURDUE/ COLLEGE/WORK: Students who graduate and successfully meet requirements are guaranteed direct admission to Purdue University. Graduates are also prepared to be successful in other universities or in their chosen technical profession.

PAY NO TUITION TO ATTEND PPHS:

Tuition to attend PPHS is FREE!



Indianapolis Charter Schools

- 246 value propositions from the 52 charter schools
- 7.72%: public or community purpose for education
- 92.28%: individual/consumer purposes for education
- 40 focused only on private advantages
- 12 mentioned both public and private purposes
 - in those cases, statements of private purposes significantly exceeded statements of public purposes in all but one case (where they had equal frequency)
- No public charter school mentioned only the public or community value of education



Issues:

1) Good Intentions?



Issues:

- 1) Good Intentions?
- 2) Business Approaches



this approach “has been centered on a *reconfiguration* of the role of the State from its traditional responsibility of *provider* of education to a new one as *enabler* of a strong and viable (profitable) market “education industry”

—Neves, 2018 (parentheses & italics in original)



Private Good? (So what?...Labaree)

- Pressures on curriculum
- More competition, less collaboration in learning
- Credentials over knowledge
- Learning to the test
- Stratification of individuals and institutions
- Perpetuating (dis)advantage
- Enclosures of public good, or exit to private systems
- Delegitimizing public space



Issues:

- 1) Good Intentions?
- 2) Business Approaches
- 3) Privatized Public Policymaking



Issues:

- 1) Good Intentions?
- 2) Business Approaches
- 3) Privatized Public Policymaking
- 4) Expertise?



The Gates Foundation soon became the world's third biggest financier of global health research, outstripped only by the U.S. and U.K. governments, and one of the world single largest donors to the WHO. Today it's the privately run Gates Foundation that sets the global health agenda, not the WHO. In 2007, the foundation announced that resources should be devoted to the eradication of malaria, contrary to a long-established consensus among scientist in and outside WHO that controlling the disease was safer and more feasible. Nevertheless, the WHO immediately adopted the Gates plan. When the agency's malaria director, Arata Kochi, dared to publicly question it, he was promptly put on "gardening leave," as one malaria scientist put it, never to be heard from again.



The well-intentioned people at the Gates Foundation have no particular private interest that directly conflicts with their ability to promote global health campaigns in the public interest, or at least none that we know of. But if they did there'd be no mechanism to hold them accountable for it. Powerful private interests unfettered by public controls, even when they have charitable intentions, are like royalty. We've ceded control to them and now we must simply hope that they are good.

—Sonia Shah



Issues:

- 1) Good Intentions?
- 2) Business Approaches
- 3) Privatized Public Policymaking
- 4) Expertise?
- 5) Accountability



Considerations

- Tax structures
- Scale
- Regulation
- Public Accountability
- Expertise



Thank you!

clubiens@iu.edu

Twitter: @club_edu

