

NORRAG NEWS

NORTHERN RESEARCH REVIEW ADVISORY GROUP

NUMBER 9

DECEMBER 1990

**SPECIAL SECTIONS:
TECHNICAL VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING
NORRAG RESEARCH PROPOSAL ON BASIC EDUCATION
LATEST JOMTIEN FOLLOW-UP**

EDITORS

Kenneth King and Wim Biervliet

Consulting Editors:

Michel Carton, IUED, Geneva.

Oscar Corvalan, CIDE, Santiago de Chile.

Wim Hoppers, CESO, The Hague.

Editorial Addresses

Kenneth King, Department of Education, University of Edinburgh
10 Buccleuch Place, Edinburgh EH8 9JT, Scotland, U.K.
Telephone 0316671011 Telex 727441 UNIVED G Telefax 0316677938

Wim Biervliet, CESO
Centre for the Study of Education in Developing Countries
P.O. Box 90734, 2509 LS, The Hague, the Netherlands
Telephone 070 3510606 Telex 33565 NUFFIC NIL Telefax 070 3510596

CONTENTS

EDITORIAL

K. King and W. Biervliet

1-

by Claudio de Moura Castro	11-12
Women and TVET: addressing the challenge,	
by Gretchen Goodale 13-15	
UNDP European Regional Project,	
by George Kalushev	15-16
Commonwealth Secretariat and African Development	
Bank, by Kenneth King 16	
TVET Publications: Recent, Current, Imminent,	
by Kenneth King	16-17
Basic Education or basic schooling and training?	
by Michel Carton	18
Bibliography of Items mentioned in the previous	
sections	18-20
IIEP Study by Francoise Caillods	20
Pre- Announcement on Policies on Higher Education	21
<i>BILATERAL DEVELOPMENTS</i>	22-
34	
Introduction by Wim Biervliet	23
Vocational Training projects in German technical	
co-operation by Gerhard Heintze	23-26
IDRC by Daniel Morales-Gomez	27
ODA by R. Skelton and G. Jones	27-28
SIDA by B. Troedsson 28-29	
USAID project to improve technical education in Chile	
by Oscar Corvalan Vasquez	29-30
Donors to African Education: Working Group on Vocational	
Education and Training by Kees van de Bosch	30

EPTA East and Southern Africa by Donatus Komba and Wim Hoppers	31-32
EPTA-REPORTS	33-34
FOLLOW-UP TO WCEFA	34-66
<i>MULTILATERAL FOLLOW-UP</i>	34-42
Introduction by Kenneth King	34
Primary education: a World Bank policy paper by M.Ed.class on 'Education in Developing Countries', Edinburgh University	34-36
UNESCO's Action Plan Education for All by Kenneth King	36-37
Commonwealth Ministers discuss quality in basic education by Kenneth King	37
UNDP and OECD by Kenneth King	38
ICE, 42nd Session and Recommendation no.77	38
Meetings on WCEFA follow-up	39-40
World Bank Policy Paper: Primary Education 1990, Comment by Caroline Dyer	41-42
<i>BILATERAL FOLLOW-UP</i>	43-50
Introduction by Wim Biervliet	44
Federal Republic of Germany by Udo Bude	44-45
IDRC by Daniel Morales-Gomez	45
NORAD by Tove Nagel	46
The Netherlands by Leo Dubbeldam	46
United Kingdom by Myra Harrison	47
SIDA by Christine McNab	47-48
Policy Update: The Netherlands by Wim Biervliet	48-50
<i>RESEARCH FOLLOW-UP</i>	51-66
Introduction by Wim Biervliet	52
NORRAG by Ingemar Fagerlind, Kenneth King, Michel Carton and Wim Bierliet	52-57
SEARRAG by Arfah A. Aziz and Zainal Ghani	58-59
DICE and CESO by Wim Hoppers and Angela Little	59-60
CESO by Wim Biervliet	60
France by L. Cousin	60-61

IDS by Christopher Colclough	61
IIEP by Ta Ngoc Chau and Gabriel Carron	61-62
<i>SHORT RESEARCH OUTLINES</i>	
DSE by Udo Bude	62
IDRC by Daniel Morales-Gomez	62-64
IIE by Vinayagum Chinapah	64-65
NORAD by Tove Nagel	65-66
<i>RRAG IN ACTION</i>	
Introduction by Wim Biervliet	67-76
NORRAG Meeting by Kenneth King and Wim Biervliet	68
NORRAG transition phase by Wim Biervliet and Kenneth King	68-72
NORRAG goes ERASMUS by Leo Dubbeldam	72-73
News from SEARRAG and SEABAS by Arfah A. Aziz and Zainal Ghani	73-74
NORRAG cluster in the United Kingdom by Kenneth King	75-76
MEETING LIST by Pravina King	76
Note on NORRAG NEWS dissemination	77-81
	81-82
ANNOUNCEMENTS/MAIL BOX	83-84

EDITORIAL

SPECIAL ISSUE: THE WORLD OF TECHNICAL & VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING (TVET); JOMTIEN FOLLOWUP; NORRAG DEVELOPMENTS

This year has given quite unusual attention to literacy and primary education. ILY and EFA don't need translation any more. They've become part of the aid dictionary. Similarly the great themes of the world conference located at Jomtien, Thailand, appear to have begun to put down some roots.

Educational achievement, new partnerships, especially with NGOs, concerns with quality and priorities for basic education have all entered the vocabulary of conferences, policy papers, and even of new research projects. Towards the end of the year, the World Bank's own preference for primary education as the core of basic education found its expression in

Primary education: a World Bank policy paper (September 1990). There is naturally a hope in many quarters that as 1990 ends, the priority interest in primary education and literacy doesn't also. It is for this reason we give some attention to the evidence for continuing interest in basic education amongst the multilateral and bilateral agencies. What is much harder to gauge is the extent of enthusiasm for primary education and for adult literacy in different kinds of developing countries.

But early in the New Year a new contender for agency attention will enter the lists. The Bank's new policy paper on TVET is expected to go to its board in January 1991. This new document, and its associated volume, have been in preparation since 1986, and whatever its final form, it certainly looked carefully at what agencies, and national governments think they have learned about this enormously important sub-sector. It's hardly fair to call it a sub-sector, since it straddles what happens in schools, training centres, in NGO projects, in the informal sector and in industry and commerce themselves. We pay some attention here to the 'prehistory' of the Bank's TVET sector paper, but not to the document itself. That will happen in our next, Spring, issue. In the meantime, we seek to give some airing to what other donors are doing in the TVET arena, and what are some of the developments internationally that are happening in this field.

A third theme in this issue is the further development of NORRAG as a network of researchers and agency personnel involved with and committed to educational research for development. The network is in transition, not only in terms of its funding but also in terms of a rethink of its original mandate and future prospects. Apart from information exchange and dissemination to target groups in the North and the South, the network is planning co-operative activities related to research and education. It is now planning to undertake a major piece of research on basic education policies of donor agencies and of national governments. A pilot study of Tanzania and certain major donors involved there is anticipated. Although the proposal is the product of a fascinating process of joint design in various centres of NORRAG activities, we would welcome comments related to its feasibility and relevance for agencies and national governments, and also in terms of willingness to contribute to its implementation. There are also plans for an ERASMUS programme involving some centres active in the NORRAG framework.

Based on the need within a network to share responsibilities for coordination, CESO has agreed to accept the role of joint co-ordinator together with Edinburgh. Kenneth King and Wim Biervliet will now jointly share co-ordination and editorship of NORRAG NEWS.

In order to involve more people associated with the network directly into the planning and editing, we will call upon consulting editors. For this particular issue, we have sought assistance from other RRAG members with a special interest in TVET - Michel Carton, Oscar Corvalan and Wim Hoppers. Apart from their own contributions, none of these should be held responsible for the contents of this issue.

Our next task will be to rethink the dissemination of NORRAG NEWS. We have some doubts about the feasibility and effectiveness of sustained broad and tree distribution. Cost considerations should also be taken into account in this respect, given the fact that for the time being costs of NORRAG NEWS are shouldered by SIDA and CESO and editing and production depend on voluntarism and commitment of only a few people in the network. We have to further our thinking related to modes of sharing costs and benefits, if this information service is to fulfil a useful function.

As an initial way of escaping somewhat from the rising cost-spiral and from a situation in which too few people provide information to too many passive information consumers, we are aiming for this issue to reach the following audiences. 1. the officers responsible for education and training policy in the multilateral and bilateral agencies. We send it to the Chief of Division, or to someone in the agency who has been given or taken on the task of liaising with NORRAG. Our assumption is that the departmental head will circulate it to his/her staff if it is felt to be useful. 2. it also goes to major education research networks in the South, and especially those such as ERNESA, SEARRAG, REDUC which have a link to the notion of research review and dissemination 3. Finally it is sent selectively to contact points of national clusters of educational researchers in OECD countries. Ideally this latter distribution is meant to target key people who are themselves at the centre of other networks - not just to ensure that knowledge can be repackaged within that network but so that the NORRAG cluster in that country can in turn receive information, and pass it on to us.

Kenneth King, University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh
Wim Biervliet, CESO, The Hague

Kenneth King has taken primary responsibility for reports on the multilaterals (TVET and WCEFA follow up); Wim Biervliet on the bilaterals. Wim has co-ordinated the section on research follow-up, and both have worked on the Norrage Developments.

TECHNICAL AND VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING (TVET)

MULTILATERAL DEVELOPMENTS IN TVET

[In this first section on developments in the multilateral section, we discuss some initiatives within the World Bank, ILO, OECD, the Commonwealth Secretariat, and the African Development Bank. We are particularly grateful to NORRAG contacts in some of these agencies, such as Nadia Ebel and Claudio de Moura Castro, and to Bernard Salome in the Bank (previously OECD).]

1. The 5 year safari towards a TVET policy paper by the Bank

Early in 1991 - if all goes according to plan - the board of the Bank will consider a policy paper on technical and vocational education and training (TVET). This will shortly be followed by a book by Bank staff members on the same topic. It may be useful to lay out a little of the archaeology of these publications, as both go back a long way. Whatever their eventual merits or demerits, they have at least not been executed in what Americans call the 'quick and dirty' mode. The origin of this particular Bank paper is no less than 5 years back, in 1986, at an initiating meeting in Annapolis near Washington, where 10 experts from aid agencies and Northern universities came together with about 20 Bank staff to 'brainstorm' about some of the possible TVET priorities.

But the Bank wasn't discovering TVET in September 1986. The year before had seen the publication of the controversial volume by Psacharopoulos and Loxley on Diversified secondary education and development which had raised a major question mark around the wisdom of vocationally-diversified schooling (which the Bank had been funding liberally through the previous decade). Psacharopoulos had translated the findings of the book into easily accessible papers like 'To vocationalise or not to vocationalise ? That is the curriculum question.' (June 1986) Also that year Swedish SIDA had funded a really major meeting on vocational education in the London Institute of Education, since it had just completed its studies on diversified secondary education in Kenya. This produced a useful volume two years later: Vocationalising education* an international perspective (1988). John Middleton who was to be the task leader of the Bank's study attended the London meeting, as he would many other TVET meetings in the next 4-5 years.

The first issue of NORRAG NEWS (Nov. 1986) carried an account of the initiating meeting at Annapolis.

Naturally, the **cost-effectiveness** of different kinds of technical and vocational training was of central interest to the World Bank. Unlike some academic subjects a field like carmechanics or carpentry can be offered in school, training centre, on the job and off the job. So it was perhaps inevitable that a bank should be interested in the comparative advantage of these different modes. Indeed during 1986 Chris Dougherty of London University had already been hired by Psacharopoulos as a consultant to look at this question, and his work was later incorporated into the larger policy development process of the Bank. In March 1987, a draft of his major paper 'Cost-effectiveness of training delivery modes: a review' was presented at another technical meeting of the advisory group on the Bank paper, this time in ILO, Geneva.

By this point it was becoming clear that the Bank was anxious to draw into the TVET policy process research and evaluation findings from many different agencies. The earliest to be involved, either through shared studies or shared findings, were Germany's GTZ, the ILO, and

the OECD. Others also became involved like the IDRC and CIDA, and the Asian Development Bank.

Another element that had gone into the earlier mix had been Charles Benson's work on 'Taxonomies of skill development'. But soon this could be seen as just one of an enormous range of papers, research studies, reviews, and meetings that were becoming part of the 'VET policy paper knowledge base'.

There was a good deal of Northern industrialised country influence on the paper, not only through Bank visits to a country such as Germany with its distinguished vocational training system, but through participation in major academic meetings, such as that in UCLA on performance contracting (Nov. 1987). It would be possible to trace the changing insights of the key actors in the Bank team working on the VET project in some of the papers delivered on such occasions:

Antoine Schwartz, 'The dual vocational training system in the Federal Republic of Germany' (July 1986)

John Middleton, 'Changing patterns in World Bank investments in vocational education and training: implications for secondary vocational schools' (Nov. 1987)

It is also possible to see what the Bank thought it had learnt through its review of its own earlier investments in TVET:

John Middleton and Terri Demsky, 'World Bank investments in vocational education and training' (July 1988)

John Middleton, 'Changing patterns in vocational education' (July 1988).

Bank studies related to developing countries

En route to the development of a policy paper, the Bank team could profit from studies being carried out also in developing countries. There had already been studies of Colombia and Tanzania through the analysis of diversified secondary education. (1985) Then there had been a review of TVET policies in 8 North African and Middle East countries (Dec. 1986). A good deal of Bank interest surrounded the series of insights that came from Latin America where many countries had a national training agency. Consequently a major review of this experience was commissioned from Maria Angelica Ducci of CINTERFOR, Montevideo:

'Regional review of vocational training in Latin America' (March 1989)

In the Ivory Coast, **too, where** there had been a strong training agency, there was a study done by Christian Grootaert:

'Cote d'Ivoire's vocational and technical education' (1988)

And in China, John Middleton himself looked at China's technical and vocational training system. This was an important country to study since it had fairly recently declared for a policy of 50:50 between general secondary and vocational secondary schools. and thus seemed to be at odds with the Bank's criticism of vocationally diversified schooling:

Harold Noah and John Middleton, 'China's vocational and technical training' (June 1988)

Other countries where studies were carried out included Israel, Thailand, Korea, Zimbabwe, Malawi and Egypt. In different ways, all such countries were important in providing evidence of specific traditions of TVET, which the Bank team were seeking to make sense of within a larger conceptualisation:

Chingboon Lee, 'Financing technical education in LDCs: economic implications from a survey of training modes in Korea' (1985)

Van Adams, 'A study of the economic policy environment's influence on human capital formation in Korea and Egypt' (1989)

John Middleton, 'Vocational training in Malawi' (June 1988)

John Middleton, 'Vocational training in Korea' (1988)

John Middleton et al. 'Vocational education in a changing economy: the case of Thailand' (1989)

A somewhat different perspective came from the several countries where work was going on in a linked OECD/ILO/World Bank interest in the informal sector. This mechanism not only allowed some major reviews of what was already known about the informal training sector, but by 1989 results were arriving from the first case studies to look at the impact of education on 'success' in the informal sector:

J.S Birks and C Sinclair, 'Education and training for skills and income in the urban informal sector in Sub-Saharan Africa: the case of Ibadan, Nigeria' (Jan 1990).

TVET and macro-economic policies

By November 1988, there was already a synopsis of the major 'story-line' of the Bank paper. Like other Bank policy papers the analyses and recommendations were related to different levels of economic development: middle income, industrialising countries; policy-constrained industrialising; and agriculture-led low income countries. But at this stage in the process of policy paper development, perhaps one of the most powerful influences was the notion of the relationship between macro-economic policies and the VET system. It was argued that a country's income policies, technology policy, fiscal policy, labour market policy, and trade policy were all quite central in affecting the internal and external efficiency of VET policies. These ideas were drawn initially from two Bank staff whose work has been closely associated with the policy paper:

Arvil van Adams and Antoine Schwartz, 'Vocational education and economic environments: conflict or convergence?' (1988)

This paper was one of many sources that lay behind the story-line of the policy paper itself. There was still not a version of the latter but the storyline gave some strong indications of its possible shape:

'Policies for flexibility and efficiency in vocational education and training: Synopsis' (Nov. 1988)

August 1989: a first major ***draft of the policy paper***

In preparation for a major review meeting in ILO with agencies and key policy makers from developing countries, there was produced the first monograph length study of the VET paper:

'Vocational education and training in developing countries: policies for flexibility, efficiency and quality' (August 1989).

There were already evident in this draft some chapters that showed the potentially very close connections between the economic environment and skills development. This dependent relationship between the character of skills development and the larger economy gave shape to the paper. But there were some very sharp comments on the situations where it was unlikely that VET could be effective, and some valuable schematisation of situations where government could consider providing or financing training. One chapter was missing in this draft, and that was the final chapter on Policy Strategies. It was mentioned that it would be written 'after consultations with developing country policy makers and experts, and assistance agency representatives'.

In many ways the volume was a tour de force. It brought into the debate about TVET a set of issues that had not been thoroughly related to TVET before: in the process it linked TVET to productivity objectives, but raised major worries about whether TVET could meet equity objectives, or increased employability for youth and the disadvantaged. There were also major chapters on the role of government and on VET in the modern and informal sectors.

However, at the end of the September meeting, and after detailed criticism of the coherence of the draft, it was decided that there was at least another year's work to be done.

In January 1990 what was effectively a synthesis of the main arguments of the policy paper was put forward by Middleton, Adrian Ziderman and Arvil van Adams at a regional meeting on TVET organised by the Asian Development Bank in Manila:

'Skills training for productivity: strategies for improved efficiency in developing countries' (Jan. 1990).

We have already reported in NN8 that in Turin in May 1990 there was a further dissemination seminar with agency personnel and ministers from developing countries. And there have been other such meetings in the final run-up to the development of the policy paper. A near to last draft of the paper that should go to the Bank's board in January will be available to the meeting of European aid donors to education in Berlin, 3-4 December 1990. By that stage, donors can scarcely say that they have not had an opportunity to comment at various points over the past 4-5 years. This is especially true of agencies such as ILO, GTZ, and OECD that have been very close to the study.

TVET Policy Paper and the Developing World Perspective

In earlier Bank papers - notably the Sub-Saharan Africa education policy volume - the Bank has incurred very considerable criticism for allegedly paying scant attention to the views of local scholars, or using them as consultants. Certainly the long gestation cycle of the TVET paper has allowed scope for extensive consultation. There have certainly also been a number of third world scholars involved in the process, though perhaps the majority of these had already become agency employees - whether of the World Bank, ILO (and its associated centres), or of other agencies.

Perhaps more important than the number of resident third world scholars who have made up the 'VET knowledge base' of the policy paper is the question of the extent to which the Bank can empathise with the very powerful local rationales for investment in versions of vocationalism. In the late 1980s and early 1990s, these local versions of the vocational must be sensitively understood, even if they may seem to be based on rather crude assumptions about attitude change, creation of self-employment or enterprise. The danger with the Bank perspective is that by the time the TVET paper has reached its final form, a degree of confidence and certainty about its conclusions is hard to avoid. In the course of five years of searching, reviewing, synthesising, and developing a coherent storyline, it would be surprising if the Bank did not feel that it had sorted out some of the wheat from the chaff. The sheer scale of the cross-national data on TVET, and the need to identify and explain examples of good practice in TVET at different levels of economic development are likely to produce a conceptual map of TVET that cannot give a great deal of attention to the local culture and context of TVET in the individual country.

The acid test of the policy paper, when it finally goes public, will be if policy advisors in different kinds of countries recognise the analysis and the diagnosis as describing their own situations, even if the implications of the Bank review are politically unacceptable to some countries. The danger may be that the interconnectedness of the Bank's analysis of TVET with a particular kind of supportive macro-economic environment will suggest that many, perhaps even a majority, of national VET policy initiatives will appear as secondbest, inadequate or even flawed.

But this is premature. The final version of the paper is not yet available. The Bank staff closest involved have been anxious to take on board reactions from the South in their most recent set of meetings. (53 different countries represented in such meetings to date) At the end of all consultations, however, there may still be a rather large gap between ministers and other politicians who in many countries see TVET as having an independent effect on the labour market, and the World Bank which is likely to identify with Philip Foster's position of 25 years ago on the vocational school fallacy in development planning. To quote the August 1989 draft of the paper:

It is quite clear that a large supply of vocationally trained graduates has not led to economic growth where other factors and conditions have not been present. A supply of skilled labour has not created its own demand.(pp.1 7-18)

In the next issue we shall carry some commentary on the final board version of the policy paper, hopefully by the overall task manager of the TVET exercise, John Middleton. We turn now to look at other elements within the multilateral framework.

2. World Bank/OECD Devt. Centre/ILO research informal training

Training in the small enterprise and informal sector is certain to find an important place in the Bank's TVET paper, and in the accompanying volume. One reason there is the option to give coverage to training in the informal sector is that several streams of interest in the potential of the informal sector have come together since 1986. The ILO Training Department held a meeting in April 1987 which constituted its first major interest in **training** for the informal sector. as opposed to employment in the informal sector. This Initiative led to a book edited by Fred Fluitman:

Training for work in the informal sector (ILO, 1989)

At the same time the OECD Development Centre was examining inservice training, including training for small enterprises. It decided critically to review what had happened to employment policies over the previous two decades, and included in this review an analysis of informal sector employment. This took place in 1987. A further meeting a year later, **September 1988**, looked quite specifically at what had been learnt in different regions about the informal sector. The aim of the seminar was also to sharpen a research proposal which would launch new studies on 'education and training for skills and income in the urban informal sector'. By this point, the lead agency on the set of informal sector studies was the World Bank - through its Africa Technical Department - but there continued to be close collaboration in the work with the ILO and the OECD. The multilateral collaboration is evident in the authorship of the book *which* came out of the 'revisited' seminar:

David Tumham, Bernard Salome, Antoine Schwartz, The informal sector revisited (OECD, 1989)

Shortly, Salome had moved from OECD to be task manager for what was intended to be a series of 6 case studies that would seek to tease out the connections between education & training on the one hand and productivity and income in the informal sector on the other. Nigeria was one of the first case studies to have material available, and we are glad to publish here a short report by Bernard Salome on the state of the informal sector project. There continues to be substantial ILO interest in the project, with Fluitman drawing together a separate cross-national study on the apprentices who have been interviewed.

Some Initial Results from WB/ILO/OECD Study on Informal Sector

by Bernard Salome, World Bank

With a view to better understanding the processes of skill acquisition in the informal sector, a study was launched by the World Bank, the International Labour Office and the OECD Development Centre entitled *Education and Training for Skills and Income in the Urban Informal Sector in sub-Saharan Africa*. The study seeks to systematically analyze the relationship between education and training and participation in the informal sector throughout the region. Through this study it is hoped that more thorough information can be made available on the informal sector that is important in designing interventions within the sphere of education and training.

Case studies have been implemented in cities in Niger (Niamey), Nigeria (Ibadan), Senegal (Dakar), and Togo (Lome). The synthesis of these four case studies has revealed numerous interesting characteristics, patterns and myth-breakers regarding the relationship between the informal sector and education, training and income. The following is a brief summary of the primary conclusions reached so far as well as a preliminary conceptualization of the structure of an intervention policy.

AS was suspected, informal sector entrepreneurs typically have low or no exposure to formal education and although the percentage having education experience appears to have increased

in the early and mid-1980s, data suggest this increase has slowed in recent years. Better educated individuals practice the more lucrative informal sector activities. These activities, such as auto mechanics, tailoring and wood furniture making, typically apply higher technologies, reap higher incomes, and require more advanced skills compared to the more traditional informal sector activities such as meat selling, leather shoe repair and cloth weaving. A lack of basic reading and writing skills on the other hand virtually eliminates all possibilities of individuals accessing many of the more modern activities in the informal sector. In addition, better educated entrepreneurs are more aware of the availability of outside training and place a higher value on their skills.

Analysis of the labor markets in the country studies also revealed that many formal sector workers can no longer make enough money through their wage employment and that they, or their spouses, take up informal sector activities to supplement their incomes. In the Nigeria study this group consisted of mostly educated females practicing more traditional trades such as hair dressing, soap making or meal preparation. Because these individuals tend to be relatively well-educated, they engage in a more modern version of these traditional activities and are quite successful.

The role of education for the informal sector is immediately apparent. Without an education individuals are relegated to the most basic of informal sector activities. If enrolment in education continues to decline as it has in some of the countries under study (Nigeria, Niger) there could be a concurrent decrease in the number of enterprises engaged in "modern" trades and services as well. It is recommended that education and training budgets be protected from further cuts which have become fairly common in recent years under national austerity plans.

Training

Apprenticeship is overwhelmingly the most common form of training in the informal sector. Where apprenticeship has not been experienced, the individual is almost certain to have been an unpaid family helper. In interviews with entrepreneurs and apprentices, the apprenticeship experience is credited as the most useful education/training experience during which most skills, technical as well as managerial, were acquired. Formal technical and vocational training appears not to be a replacement for the apprenticeship/family helper experience. No one surveyed in the case studies managed to establish an enterprise in the informal sector without first becoming either an apprentice, family helper or wage worker. Finally, the better the prospects offered by an apprenticeship for a successful career, the more difficult it is to attain the position. Additionally, the small wages or in-kind benefits in these apprenticeships do not reflect the higher earnings of the entrepreneurs.

Despite the obvious importance and success of the apprenticeship system in the informal sector, many weaknesses have been discovered. The inefficiency of apprenticeship becomes obvious through the interviews. The desire to acquire additional skills was expressed by at least half the interviewed population in each country suggesting that apprenticeship is by no means perfect. Perhaps its most significant flaw is its inability to teach apprentices the latest methods and affordable technologies because the master is typically unaware of them. Thus the system tends to pass down the same sets of skills and methods from **one generation** to the next with few opportunities for other techniques to be introduced. The perpetuation of outdated skills, methods and technologies has an effect on the rate at which informal sector enterprises enter new markets, design new products and services, and on the quality of managerial skills as well.

The percentage of informal sector entrepreneurs who have formal training experience has proven to be quite low as was expected. In the Nigeria survey 17.6 % reported having

experienced pre-service technical or vocational training and 15.4 % acknowledged having a formal in-service training experience. The principal reason reported for not having in-service training experience was that none was available. This suggests a lack of training services that are focussed towards informal sector needs. Unexpectedly, entrepreneurs and apprentices both expressed a preference for additional training in an institution. Only a small minority expressed interest in such training techniques as on-site assistance, correspondence courses and manuals.

The lack of spare parts combined with a lack of knowledge on maintenance and repairs among most entrepreneurs leads to severe declines in productivity when machines they use break down or else they are forced to incur the high costs of having them replaced. In either case, training in the area of repair and servicing would be very useful in many informal sector trades.

The policy

From this data the following conclusions can be reached:

1. Apprenticeship is a cost-effective and socially acceptable method of transferring skills yet the quality and quantity of training provided appears to be inadequate, suggesting a role for outside assistance.
2. The nature of training intervention in the informal sector must be trade-specific in most if not all cases. Training should be designed to teach skills that are known to be desired by the target group and which can be used almost immediately; short-term, modular training courses would be ideal.

The ability of African governments to provide the necessary training to the informal sector to satisfy the wide variety of trade-specific needs of the informal sector is limited. Indeed, if training systems are to be dynamic and adaptable to changes in labor supply and demand, then national training systems which perform all the functions of research, administration, financing and training would be over-burdened and would likely be unable to provide the type of modular and trade-specific training that is needed at a reasonable cost. A more fruitful approach would be for governments to focus on monitoring training needs of the informal sector through surveys and be responsible for administration, oversight and financing of training. Actual training provision would be allocated to interested training organizations or individuals. Funding would be available to those who could demonstrate a capacity to meet the demands of a group (s) within the informal sector. Criteria for funding would be based upon discussions with informal sector participants and their expressed needs. This takes into consideration the many previous training efforts intended for the informal sector *which have* failed due to the lack of understanding of the needs of the intended beneficiaries. These criteria would by necessity be both strict and dynamic, changing as the nature of economies and the informal sector changes. Once trainers had qualified for assistance they would receive financial assistance in establishing a training program. Renewal of assistance would then be based upon proven success and application of the skills taught within the targetted group.

Initially, the World Bank and other development agencies could be involved in supporting a financing mechanism for training. The existing format sector training taxes that are in place in many countries would provide a steady source of funds for informal sector training, particularly as significant sums often go unspent under the current system.

Training is not the only element which effects informal sector performance. Changes in the regulatory environment to alleviate some of the restrictions placed on the informal sector would be highly significant to the success of any program intended to promote what is largely a sector operating outside the law. Further, issues of credit provision and access to markets and raw materials should also be addressed. Finally, economic policies may have to be modified if the informal sector is to receive full support at a national level, particularly export and import policies, both of which have been noted as having indirect effects on the informal sector.

[We turn now to examine another example of multilateral collaboration, this time in checking the fallout of macro-economic adjustment policies on education and training provision. Ed.]

3. ILO, Unesco, and World Bank collaborate to study the impact of adjustment on education and training

by Claudio de Moura Castro (Chief, Training Policies, ILO)

For a few years relations between the ILO and UNESCO turned lukewarm. In the last two years there has been a rapprochement between the two agencies and, as a result, a joint research project has taken place.

Both agencies took notice of the unwelcome consequences of crisis, stagnation and structural adjustment on education and training. At the same time, some areas of the World Bank also became very concerned with the same problems. As a result, the three agencies joined efforts to examine the issue. Given the lack of sound information at the country level, as well as the lack of a streamlined methodology to study the consequences of crisis and structural adjustment, it was decided that a set of country studies would be the most appropriate path to follow. Between eight and ten case studies will be conducted, each agency taking care of one third of them. Each agency will study the situation of both education and training. The watertight division of labour between Unesco and ILO, by common accord will not be respected.

Brazil, Costa Rica and Ghana have already been chosen for the case studies. Morocco, Hungary, Madagascar and Senegal are probable choices. The remaining two or three are still under discussion. Chile, Pakistan and Tanzania have been mentioned.

Several studies have been completed on the consequences of structural adjustment on the social sectors and an even bigger crop is on the way. Beginning a new set of studies now, what are the questions that should be asked?

Designing a methodological approach to these studies consumed a significant amount of time. But as we reviewed the existing literature two sets of issues emerged. The first related to the different patterns of reactions of training to adjustment. The second focuses on the decision-making processes that are engendered when the economic situation gets tight.

When approaching training issues, our first reaction was to suppose that training expenditures would behave more or less like education when facing the tightening of belts. Educational budgets are very often hurt by a deterioration in the economic situation and in some cases they may suffer more than other public expenditures. However, some of the papers we commissioned from outside consultants surprised us. Training is organized and financed differently from one country to another and even inside any one country it has multiple faces and modes of functioning. Therefore, when crises come, the reactions can be very different. Furthermore, some societies see training as a solution to unemployment and

low export productivity. Therefore, our initial findings suggest that training may suffer in some cases but it may grow in others.

That being the case, one of the important tasks of the research is to map this heterogeneity of reactions to crisis and adjustment. Just describing this pattern promises to be a most instructive exercise in itself.

The other issue could be called the politics of policy or the political economy of budget cuts. The case studies will carefully examine variations in budgets and the impact of adjustment on human resource preparation. In that sense, they will be a conventional exercise in which we will avoid cutting corners on the quantitative and financial analysis. However, we want to go one step further.

Three hypotheses seem to be suggested by a casual analysis of the available evidence. First, the impact of the cuts does not seem to be random or homogeneous. Who gets hurt is neither a lottery nor the result of a flat cut across the board. Second, cuts often seem to hit the politically weakest groups. Neither efficiency nor equity seem to gain with such cuts. Third, implementation seems to diverge from decisions taken at higher echelons.

We want to understand how those decisions are made. Who decides? Who are the constituents and how powerful and organized are they? How are initial decisions progressively distorted by the bureaucracy and its clients?

Ms. Jailade from Unesco is working with Prof. J. Samoff from Stanford University, Claudio de Moura Castro and FR. Carlsson from the ILO team, working with Prof. J. Camargo and Prof. E. Amadeo from the Catholic University of Rio de Janeiro. Mr. A Schwartz and Prof. Gall Stevenson are responding for the World Bank.

Case studies should be ready before the end of 1991. Analysis of the cases **will** then follow, with the possibility of ending up with a joint paper by the three agencies.

The following papers have already been produced:

E. Amadeo, J. Camargo and C. M. Castro: The political economy of budget cuts: a suggested scheme of analysis (unpublished)

Mafia Angelica Ducci: New angles on the financing of vocational training in Latin America (CINTEFOR/ILO, Montevideo), Sept. 1990

Kenneth King: The impact of structural adjustment on technical and vocational education and training (TVET). (ILO, Geneva), Training Policies Branch Discussion Paper No. 64 (forthcoming)

F. Orivel: Quelques elements de reflexion sur l'impact des politiques d'ajustement structurel dans le domaine de la formation professionnelle (unpublished)

M. Woodhall: Education and training under conditions of economic austerity and restructuring (Unesco, Pads), 1989

4. Women and TVET: addressing the challenge'

by Gretchen Goodale (Training Policies, ILO)

Getting women into technical fields, especially those customarily dominated by men, is no easy task. The ILO is particularly concerned with this problem, since the sectors and occupations in which women are most represented are those which are especially vulnerable in times of austerity and adjustment and offer limited opportunities for skill and wage enhancement and career mobility.

With financial assistance from the Government of Norway, the ILO has been collaborating with the Commonwealth Association of Polytechnics in Africa (CAPA) to promote the entry of girls and women in technical fields.

As a network of technical institutions committed to the improvement of technical, vocational and professional training and education in Africa, CAPA has undertaken in the last decade several major programmes in pursuit of its aims and objectives. When reviewing their performance however, a persistent and marked gender imbalance among participants was noticed. In certain activities such as management development programmes, the participation of women has been virtually nil.

To redress this situation, the Association proposed an action research project, undertaken with technical assistance from the ILO. The project, which began in late 1988, aims at identifying the factors which impede women's entry, retention and performance in technical and vocational training and employment. A substantial amount of data has been generated through research conducted by faculty of 20 CAPA member institutions in 9 African countries. The findings are presented in three regional syntheses, and analysed in their entirety in a bookie entitled "Women in Technical Trades" for principals and directors of primary and secondary schools and polytechnics; employers, and senior government officials in the education and training sector. In addition, the project produced a short video on the same subject for promotional and training purposes.

The studies clearly demonstrate that while there is near parity between boys and girls at primary levels, the percentage of girls at the polytechnic level in general is approximately 25% or less of the total enrolment, and of those enrolled in technical programmes in polytechnics, girls represent but a minute fraction of the total. A similar pattern may be seen among teaching staff, while the situation in technical jobs in selected enterprises is even worse.

A range of factors were found to act as barriers, both formal, or related to institutional policies and practices, and informal, linked to attitudes and beliefs about women's and men's roles and capabilities. These were found to exist equally across the different institutions, countries and regions and comprise:

In the educational and training system

The poor background of girls in maths and science and their lack of exposure to technically oriented subjects in the primary level limits their participation and influences their performance in these subjects at secondary school and subsequent levels. Due to the small number of women teaching science and technical subjects at secondary level, girls also lack the necessary role models.

Technical subjects (such as metalwork, woodwork and technical drawing) are not offered in most girls secondary schools.

There is a lack of effective career guidance and counselling in both single sex and mixed schools and a lack of exposure to employment opportunities for females in technical fields.

Some parents are reluctant to send their daughters to polytechnics if accommodation is not assured.

Due to the low levels of female teaching staff in polytechnics, female students at this level also lack role models.

In employment

Stereotypes held by employers regarding women's ability and competence in technical jobs result in women not always being given the opportunity to prove their worth. Silent stereotyping exists within many employing organisations which limits women's career prospects.

Supportive facilities (part-time and flexible working hours, job sharing, child care, transport) are not provided by employers for women employees with child rearing responsibilities. There is an absence of legislation regarding the provision of such facilities.

There is a lack of financial support or sponsorship which would enable women to undertake further training in technical fields which is seen as necessary for promotion and career development.

Legislation concerning night work, shift work and other types of work (ie. mining) designed to protect women can act as a barrier to their employment opportunities in the technical fields.

In education training and employment policies

There is an almost total lack of specific policies in Education, Training and Labour Ministries on increasing the participation level of women in technical education, training and jobs.

The lack of formal structures with Education, Training and Labour Ministries with the mandate to promote women in technical education, training and employment, contributes to the lack of systematic positive action to counteract the present imbalance.

There is an absence of Women's Bureaus or Councils in some countries to ensure a focus on the advancement of women.

There is an absence of systems and structures to monitor progress in the integration of women into technical education and training. Institutions are not evaluated in terms of their performance in this regard. Annual reports from institutions rarely provide data disaggregated on the basis of sex.

Employment policies reflect discrimination in the area of personal taxation, whereby the husband is seen as the sole breadwinner and therefore the main recipient of tax relief on children.

Socio-cultural barriers and constraints

Attitudes and sex stereotyping by parents and society at large, promote the view that technical jobs and technical education and training programmes are the exclusive preserve of males.

Women's attitudes about their own roles and capabilities also influence their entry into certain technical fields. From an early age many females lack confidence in, and have a negative attitude towards, science and technical subjects and careers in science or technology. There is an expectation and acceptance by women of themselves of failure in these areas. The purpose of the project however was to go beyond research, and review the findings with those key persons from the CAPA member countries who are in a position to bring about change. As a result, a major policy seminar was organised from 24 - 28 September in Mombasa, bringing together some 90 persons including senior government officials, CAPA institution directors and faculty and employers. The week provided a forum for the reviewing of the project outputs and an open and frank exchange of views on concrete steps which may be taken by the various interest groups to redress the situation. The major output of this seminar will be a proposal for a second phase of activities, at the national, sub-regional and regional levels, aimed at enhancing the participation of women in technical fields.

For further information contact:

Gretchen Goodale
Women's Training
Training Policies Branch
International Labour Organisation
CH-1 211 Geneva 22

See also, ILO/CAPA, Women in technical trades (ILO, Geneva, 1990)

5. UNDP European Regional Project

The ILO is not just concerned with aspects of the Bank policy paper, or with the informal sector in developing countries, or again with the situation of lack of opportunity for women and girls in technical trades. There is a whole new vista for training opening up in the new Europe, and not least in respect of the vocational training systems of Eastern Europe. This is part of the reason that UNDP has made funds available for a vocational training project in Europe, to improve existing systems, not exclusively in Eastern Europe, but including such countries as Cyprus, Malta, Turkey as well. Indicative of the new emphasis is a workshop in Hungary on its vocational training policies, 10-14 December 1990. It is evident that there is potentially an enormous change implied for training systems by the introduction of new economic structures in the economy generally. The talk is all of adopting the 'tried-and-true solutions of the market economies'.

In a way, the radical changes being planned in the macro-economic environments of Eastern European countries, and indeed of the Soviet Union itself, make for an interesting parallel to some of the logic of the World Bank's thinking about TVET **and the economies of the developing world**. In a number of the latter, the changes that the Bank and the IMF are hoping for from structural adjustment are not so very different from the following list from Hungary:

Its (Hungary's) measures included a curtailment of the state's role in the economy, a reduction of state subsidies to industry, scope for the forces of the market and competition, the legalisation of enterprise shut-downs and unemployment, and the promotion of entrepreneurship....

For further information on the European project. contact George Kalushev, c/o Training Policies, 1 ILO, or c/o ministry of Employment and Social Welfare, 1 Levski St., 1000 Sofia, Bulgaria.

On other developments in the ILO's training policies branch, see the newsletter:(ILO Vocational Training News., especially no. 2 August 1990, obtainable from ILO), C H 1211, Geneva

6. COMMONWEALTH SECRETARIAT AND ENTERPRISE SKILLS

One of the outcomes of the Tenth Commonwealth Education Ministers Conference in Nairobi in 1987 had been a 'Survey of vocationally-oriented education in the Commonwealth' (London, 1988). This report, edited by Carol Coombe, out of the country papers presented in Nairobi, does very much give the impression that the majority of Commonwealth countries have in some way gone down the road of TVET-for-employability objectives, the very thing that the World Bank studies have raised major doubts about. A strong generalisation from the country reports went as follows:

Many countries expect that teaching pre-vocational or vocational skills will somehow alleviate school leaver unemployment. Although the employment/unemployment situation was rarely spelled out in the contry papers... it seems clear that this is the prime catalyst that impels governments towards education reform and vocational innovation in schools. (p.7,1988)

Part of the response of the Secretariat to the Conference was to develop enterprise development materials specifically for technical and vocational institutions. The desire to make such institutions more enterprising has been at the heart of many national commissions - from Latin America to Africa. Kenya, for example, has recently declared that ail 'vocational and training institutions should include the teaching of entrepreneurship skills in their curriculum as an essential component of their training programme'. (Sessional Paper no. 6 of 1988) The materials just developed by the Secretariat sound as if they were designed with just such a requirement in mind:

T.V. Rao, Cream Wright, and Hena Mukherjee, Designing entrepreneurship skills development programmes: Resource book for technical and vocational institutions (June1990)

7. African Development Bank

As a small new initiative in VET, the ADS has been identifying and preparing some quite tiny projects for the development of economic opportunities for women. These are a new departure since they involve a composite approach to income generation, labour saving activities, training and also credit. They may involve the use of NGOs as consultants or implementing agencies. Otherwise. Steve Doherty reports no other new developments in VET.

TVET PUBLICATIONS: RECENT, CURRENT, IMMINENT

Clearly, one of the most obvious sources for VET publications, especially those that derive

from major donor agencies and from research centres in the industrialised and developing world will be the selective bibliography accompanying the TVET policy paper of the Bank. And then the presumably much more extensive apparatus that will accompany the published book that will follow the policy paper in due course. Already the 1989 draft had some 30 pages of studies, special studies, meetings and consultations. Within this bibliography there are some items which are themselves individual treasure-houses of relevant material, some of it very usefully and critically analysed. Chris Dougherty's 'Cost-effectiveness' study, mentioned above, would be one.

Aid and education in the developing world (Longman 1991). This volume (by Kenneth King) has a detailed chapter on the development of agency policy on TVET from 1960 to 1990, and another chapter with parallel development in education and training in the informal sector over a similar period.

Dag Hammarskjöld Foundation seminar on Education & Employment Although this seminar on education and employment in Southern Africa was not explicitly concerned with TVET, it was inevitable that in discussing the 'timebomb' of open, educated unemployment, the Ministers of Education should discuss enterprise, the informal sector, TVET, and education -with-production. The report of the conference was published by the International Foundation for Education with Production, box 20906, Gaborone in June 1990 (pp. 330):

Education and Employment in Southern Africa: Defusing the timebomb

Supplementary volume 11, and Second Edition of International Encyclopedia of Education

In the supplementary volume ii of the international Encyclopedia, there are a set of new short articles written by John Middleton (on aid to VET); Ducci (-on the Latin American model); Layton (on the connections between science and technology education); Hoppers (on education-with-production); Kelly (on cost effectiveness); King (on VET & self-employment); Jonathan (on the philosophy of vocationalism); Sako (on Japanese experience); Selli (on VET equivalences and recognition); Meyer (on VET in the USA and its labour market consequences); and Grant (on VET in Eastern Europe). This group were jointly edited by Kenneth King and Hilary Steedman.

In the Second Edition of the Encyclopedia which starts its commissioning process at the end of 1990, there will an extended section of some 40+ articles on TVET. Kenneth King will be the section editor for this.

After the selective bibliography of items mentioned in the above text, we move to consider the followup of Jomtien. But it may be useful to have a few comments now on the missed opportunities of Jomtien. Was its conception of basic education broad enough to encompass basic skills or basic training? Michel Carton, who is one of the NORRAG contact points in Switzerland, and works in IUED in Geneva raises some pertinent questions about the scope of basic education.

Basic education or basic schooling and training?

by Michel Carton

In No. 8 of Norrag News devoted to What happened at Jomtien, Kenneth King noted a 'tendency within the Conference not to pay attention to the work and employment relations of schooling or literacy for all'. The World Bank is soon going to propose a new policy for vocational education and training much more largely depending on non state structures and resources than in the 70s and 80s. This implies that the quality of formal primary schooling, still largely depending on the state policies, and means will be the key to the success of training in firms, farms, associations.... But we also know that quality improvements will be hard to achieve - as stated at Jomtien - on the one hand, and that universal schooling is wishful thinking for many countries. All that means that millions of children will get (no) schooling on the one hand, and that many of them will] get no training or, on the job training only on the other hand.

During the 70s, many of us dreamed of an educational world" where education, training, production and research would be closely connected, where formal and informal education would be the two sides of the same coin, where permanent education would be the key to development.

Vocationalization of general education, school production, community school, functional literacy, on the job training, traditional apprenticeship, were some of the answers to this integrative approach. State budget crises, structural adjustments, market ideologies, state legitimacy questioning, youth unrest or apathy led to a more clear cut approach to education: basic general schooling is today the key for the social integration of youth - as it has been the case in 19th century industrializing countries.

Are integration efforts between schooling, training and production definitively meaningless? Is basic education (Jomtien version) the only possible answer from the part of international agencies dealing mainly with governments (apart from ILO)? What are the mechanisms foreseen to allow basic general education/schooling to be a good preparation for productive life? Is HRD, now being up to date again, the new integrative approach to development? Is educational planning being revisited? These are some of the questions the educational research community should answer for contributing to a new conceptualization of basic education.

BIBLIOGRAPHY OF ITEMS MENTIONED IN THE PREVIOUS SECTIONS

The following are some of the items that have been mentioned in the sections on multilateral TVET or multilateral *WCEFA follow-up*:

W. Blervliet, Inventory of Dutch capacity (SWIDOC/CESO), Amsterdam, 1990)

G. Psacharopoulos and W. Loxley, Diversified secondary education and-development (Johns Hopkins, 1985)

Jon Lauglo and K Lillis (ed), Vocationalising education (Pergamon, Oxford, 1988)

G. Psacharopoulos, 'To vocationalise or not to vocationalise' Educ. and Training Dept. World Bank (EDT31), June 1986, World Bank.

Charles Benson, 'Taxonomies of skill development' Policy division, Education and

training Dept., World Bank, Feb. 1987.

'Regional review of alternative modes of vocational training and technical education', Education and training Dept., (EDT 41), World Bank, Dec. 1986.

John Middleton, 'Changing patterns in World Bank investments in vocational education and training: implications for secondary vocational schools', UCLA conference, November 1987.

Harold Noah and John Middleton, 'China's vocational and technical training' PPR working papers (WPS 18), PHREE, World Bank, June 1988.

John Middleton, 'Changing patterns in vocational education', PPR working papers (WPS 26), PHREE, World Bank, July 1988.

CINTERFOR/IL0 'Regional review of vocational training in Latin America: Synopsis', March 1989.

'Policies for flexibility and efficiency in vocational education and training: synopsis' Education and Employment Division, PHREE, World Bank, Nov. 1988.

John Middleton et al., 'Skills training for productivity: strategies for improved efficiency in developing countries', paper presented to the regional seminar on TVET, at Asian Development Bank, Manila, January 1990.

Adrian Ziderman, 'Financing skills for development: an evolving role for the public sector', paper presented to ADB seminar op.cit., January 1990.

David Turnham et al., The Informal sector revisited (OECD, Paris, 1990,

ILO/CAPA, Women in technical trades (ILO, Geneva, 1990).

Commonwealth Secretariat, 'Survey of vocationally oriented education in the Commonwealth' (Ed. Carol Coombe, London June 1988.)

Patricia Ellis, 'Measures increasing participation of girls and women in technical and vocational education and training: a Caribbean case study' (Commonwealth Secretariat, January 1990).

T.V. Rao et al., Designing entrepreneurial skills development programmes@ a resource book for technical and vocational institutions (Commonwealth Secretariat, June 1990).

Republic of Kenya, Ministry of Education, Sessional paper no 6 of 1988 on Education and manpower training (Nairobi, 1989)

International Foundation for Education with Production, Education and employment in Southern Africa: defusing the time-bomb? (IFEP, box 20906, Gaborone)

World Bank, 'Vocational education and training in developing countries: policies for flexibility, efficiency and quality', draft, August 1989.

Fred Fluitman (ed.), Training for work in the informal sector (ILO, Geneva, 1989)

K. King, Aid and education in the developing world (Longman, UK, 1991, forthcoming)

Chris Dougherty, 'The cost effectiveness of national training systems in developing countries', PPR WPS 171, PHREE, World Bank, 1989

Antoine Schwartz, 'The dual vocational training system in the Federal Republic of Germany', Education and Trg. Dept., EDT 36, World Bank

World Bank, Primary education@ a World Bank policy paper (Washington, 1990).

Eleventh Conference of Commonwealth Education Ministers, 'Improving the quality of basic education' a) background paper, b) an overview of country papers. (Commonwealth Secretariat, 1990).

UNESCO, 'Education for all: an action plan by UNESCO to follow up on the World Conference in Jomtien', 1990

'Guidelines for UNESCO cooperation with member states: annexe: UNDP's EFA follow-up strategy' (August 1990).

IBE, Literacy Lessons. (IBE, Geneva, 1990).

Literacy Research Centre, Pennsylvania, 'Papers to conference on World Literacy in the Year 2000', October 1990.

Papers of UIE/UNESCO/OECD conference on Functional literacy in Eastern and Western Europe', November 1990, Hamburg.

IIEP

The International Institute for Educational Planning has launched a comparative study of technical and technological education in developing countries. The purpose of this study is to analyse and compare the organisation of technician education and training in a range of developing countries and to identify major patterns of change with regard to the relative importance of technical education at secondary and post secondary levels, to curriculum organisation and content, administration and financing, and links with industry. This study tries to review existing evidence regarding cost-effectiveness of different forms of provision of technical and technological education as well. National monographs have been prepared on 3 Latin American countries (Argentina, Colombia, Mexico), 3 African countries (Cameroon, Zimbabwe), 2 Arab States (Algeria and Oman) and 3 Asian States (Hong Kong, India, Thailand). The synthesis report is being prepared. Preliminary results show i) the difficulty of defining technical education at secondary level and to a lesser extent at post secondary level: country monographs show considerable overlap between vocational and technical courses; ii) the importance of the guidance process at the secondary level which almost consistently guide less successful students towards technical studies; iii) the dynamism of technical programmes at post secondary level. This last constitutes a response to labour market requirements, a way of bypassing entrance restrictions at university level, and is also a strategy adopted by lower-middle class families for getting further education and preparation for work.

F. Caillods

Policies on higher education

Though this issue is concerned with TVET and with WCEFA follow-up, it is worth noting that a number of key developments are underway in the area of higher education.

The World Bank is beginning the development of what will be a policy paper on the higher education theme.

Ford and Rockefeller Foundations have funded a major investigation of higher education in 6 countries of Anglophone Africa, and it is expected that Trevor Coombe of London University who has been the consultant on the project will have completed a first version of his recommendations before the end of 1990.

The Commonwealth Secretariat also has continued to encourage strengthening of capacity in higher education. Its Commonwealth Expert Group reported on 'Strengthening capacity for sustainable development' under the Commonwealth Higher Education Support Scheme (CHESS). At the Ministers meeting in Barbados in November 1990, it was agreed that a Commonwealth Higher Education Support Scheme should be established, with attention in the first instance given to books, materials and libraries; improved systems of management in institutions; and staff development.

TVET: BILATERAL

GTZ
IDRC
ODA
SIDA
USAID

NETWORKS: EPTA

TVET: BILATERALS

Introduction

Both GTZ and SIDA present overviews of their involvement in support to TVET. Even though the system approach opted for is quite dissimilar, there are broad similarities in support patterns viewed from an historical point of view:

Initially support is focusing on TVET institutions in terms of infrastructural development, construction, equipment procurement and installation, teacher and instructor training, learning material development.

A second phase concentrated on making a better match between the education and training system and the labour/employment market. In this phase, there is a further emphasis on training standard setting and approaches towards combining institutional training with training on-the-job. SIDA apart from continuing with institutional support and project related training concentrated within a multilateral project with ILO on the development of a methodological approach to vocational training and learning material development Modules of Employable Skills. Based on occupational analysis, it was attempted to prepare learning material which could be packaged in such a way that it would prepare trainees for job-entry in well-defined jobs. The German dual training approach, based on a direct co-operation between well organised educational institutions and training on-the-job, having been a success formula in the past, was adapted to fit into developing countries lacking in many cases the institutional framework and capacity for such a formula. Initial attempts for enhancing private sector contribution to VET were made with regard to support to apprenticeship schemes, training levies and training contracts.

Presently, there seems to be no high priority for expanding the infrastructure for VET in developing countries, when frequently training capacity utilization is not optimal given problems in meeting recurrent costs for training. This aspect is stressed by both ODA, GTZ and SIDA. The comment made by SIDA related to WCEFA follow-up, indicating the critical role of teachers and instructors, whose low salary and status may seriously impinge on the effectiveness of innovative measures, is equally valid for TVET.

Emphasis in all support reported upon is now on strengthening institutional and managerial capacity for training infrastructures in developing countries; on assessing further the scope for strengthening liaison between private and public sector for training. The general emphasis is on improving efficiency, effectiveness and equity/ access aspects to TVET. Given the restricted absorption capacity of the formal employment sector there is further emphasis on the development of approaches and methodologies for training for the informal sector and small scale enterprises and on the development of multi-sectoral and disciplinary approaches combining training with other intervention mechanisms for support to small-scale enterprises such as extension services, loans and technology development.

Certain reports, refer to a high degree of impact of the TVET support intervention. In a next issue of NORRAG News we hope to be able to assist in sharing information on innovative approaches to project and programme support to TVET, with a multi-sector approach, combining different intervention mechanisms and applying combinations of institutional and on-the-job training. Apart from tracer studies, reversed tracer studies and the excellent evaluation by Jon Lauglo referred to in the contribution by SIDA, there seems to be a lack of qualitative in-depth studies on the workforce, providing further insight into skill generation and utilization.

wb

EXPERIENCE TO DATE WITH VOCATIONAL TRAINING PROJECTS IN GERMAN TECHNICAL CO-OPERATION

1. First Approach Vocational Schools

Since the beginning of development co-operation, vocational training has been a priority of Technical Co-operation programmes in the Federal Republic of Germany. In the 60s and 70s a large number of training centres (vocational schools) were set up to impart largely in-school vocational training up to skilled worker level. The training often incorporated a component of in-plant practical training, although this could not always be conducted.

The German approach to support to technical vocational education and training was characterised

by:

seeking correspondence between training provision and needs of industry;
heavy emphasis on practical training in own workshops and laboratories;

a shift from formal technical vocational education under the education ministries to nonformal vocational training under the labour ministries;

these vocational training centres aimed at meeting skilled workers manpower requirements of small and medium scale industry and as models for system-wide implementation.

Later, in the mid-70s it became apparent that although these in-school training centres imparted effective training, were recognised and often led successfully to post-training employment commensurate with their qualifications, the model function of the approach seldom took effect.

Bottlenecks perceived include the problem of recurrent costs - the danger of overtheorizing and becoming divorced from real working conditions - the problem of the transition from school to firm, the sustained motivation of trainees to pursue further training, etc.

2. System-oriented Approaches

Partners in developing countries (ministries, autonomous vocational training organizations, etc.) increasingly introduced their own ideas and expectations into the project planning with greater emphasis on existing local structures, traditions and mentalities. As a consequence vocational training projects became very disparate and difficult to fit into standard project classifications such as teacher's training, technician and master craftsman training, programmes for the development and dissemination of training media.

An important criterion for project identification hallmark in the large majority of vocational initiatives became the degree to which they contribute to the emergence of a future, comprehensive vocational training system in the countries concerned. This system approach requires direct co-operation between German advisers and education/training policymakers in ministries. In nearly all cases, though, system consultancy is combined with concrete projects for putting the new training concepts into practice. After the completion of a project there is often a subsequent, complementary project that adds further components to the vocational training system.

Examples of a new project approach aimed at contributing a key component to a vocational training system are dual or co-operative vocational training programmes that have been applied in a number of countries in Latin America, Africa and Asia with remarkable success. The idea is not to copy the German model, but to develop dual vocational training programmes geared to the country's needs and conditions based on German experience with and concepts of in-plant and institutional vocational training. Characteristic features of this approach are apart from catering for a better match between training and employment needs, the requirement of private sector contribution to the costs of training.

3. Enhancing the Efficiency of Vocational Training Systems

In response to the shortcomings of existing vocational training systems support to vocational training has in recent years been increasingly aimed at efficiency improvement. There is a shift from support to infrastructural development to improving quality and efficiency of capacity utilization. There seems to be a requirement for German expertise related to:

- further development of training concepts;
- introduction of standards of qualification;
- improvement of **management**;
- **upgrading of instructor qualifications**;
- **development** of private training institutions with the participation of industry;

increasing the share of responsibility of private enterprise for training and enlarging their participation in decision-making;

institution building for the co-ordination of vocational training;

more attention to the informal sector;

promotion of employment in connection with vocational training.

It is seen as of particular importance to strengthen the capacity of executing agencies to cope competently with the enlarged managerial practical and specialists requirements related to the administrative, financial and personnel preconditions which in many cases have already been met.

4. *Limits to the Planning and Implementation of Vocational Training Projects*

Like all projects in Technical Co-operation, the planning and later implementation of vocational training projects are determined and constrained by a number of factors, the main ones being:

Determinants in the partner country:

Conceptual project perception and project implementation by the partner institution,

Potential and limits of the executing agency
(specialist, financial and administrative competence)

General conditions at the outset
(socio-cultural environment, tradition and behaviour patterns, economic and political situation, general education system, business structure, available technology and standards etc.)

Changes in the course of the project
(staff changes in important posts, in economic and political conditions)

Determinants In Germany:

- The financial parameters or extent of promotion
- Terms set by commissioning institution (usually the Ministry for Economic Co-operation

(BMZ) specifications as to content and sometimes procedures)

- The appraisal and planning method for new projects
- Availability of qualified appraisers, experts and know-how.

The final project plan of operations is the outcome of a protracted and multilevel process of consultation on the part of the partners involved, including the target groups. To a large degree the GTZ avails itself of external expertise - education planners from higher education and vocational training practitioners from vocational schools, firms and consultancy firms - to obtain sophisticated, well-considered and soundly reasoned solutions. Further, increasing use is being made of local know-how in universities and advisory institutions in the partner countries.

5. *Conceptual Focus and Experience in Actual German Support to Developing Countries*

The technical planning of vocational training projects is based on the sector concept of the Ministry for Economic Co-operation (BMZ) for development co-operation in Vocational Training and Technical Education. The policy paper of July 1986 is at present being modified. The vocational training and technical education concept is being enlarged to include components and instruments that are specially geared to the needs of the informal sector. The cross-section analysis of August 1984 provided a systematic and broad survey of support to vocational training up to that date.

- 5.1. The main trainee target group are *school-leavers*. We are trying to reduce training entry requirements to a minimum commensurate with the occupational profile. In addition to initial training further training for workers or basic vocational training for unemployed adults is included. There is a growing emphasis on *girls and women* as target groups for vocational training projects.
- 5.2. The indirect target group for training are the *firms* as the clientele of vocational training. Vocational training promotion is mainly geared to small and medium business. This policy line has not prevented a large group of qualified trainees from finding employment in large industrial plants, but it has ensured that many also work in the informal sector. The trend in vocational training projects is to gear activities even more closely than hitherto to the possibilities and needs of craft businesses in the *informal sector*. Special projects to promote the informal sector, however, must be conceived quite differently and at best include vocational training as one amongst many components.
- 5.3. Support to vocational training is geared to needs. The training requirements of industry are usually an important argument to warrant a new project. Less often the rationale for projects is the training demand of youth or the like, because the danger of unemployment is great despite qualification.
- 5.4. Vocational training projects are concentrated on the occupational areas, *metalwork, electrical engineering and automotive engineering*, reflecting the perception of needs by our partner countries. Only in recent years and mainly in conjunction with dual training concepts has it been possible to include other occupational areas such as services and farming. The occupational profiles and curricula are tailored to the repair and maintenance of plant and equipment (commercial vehicles, roadbuilding machinery, power stations, etc.) and are aimed at ensuring a long-term utilization of available resources and the protection of the environment.
- 5.5. Up to now most projects have been located in *urban areas*. Only in recent years patterns of support to training has been increasingly directed towards *provincial and rural areas*.
- 5.6. *Co-operation with industry* has long been a goal but it has only been successfully achieved on a broad scale since the implementation of dual vocational training projects. Experience shows that even in countries with unbalanced business structures (e.g. Honduras or Botswana) dual or co-operative vocational training conceived to cater for national conditions can be effective.
- 5.7. The *executing agencies* of vocational training projects in the past were for the most part government institutions (ministries), which often caused serious problems (financing, pay scales, flexibility, etc.). For some years now successful collaboration schemes are apparent with *private training agencies* (chambers of industry, commerce and crafts, foundations, autonomous training institutions).
- 5.8. Emphasis will be placed to a greater degree in future on projects combining support to vocational training with instruments enhancing employment generation.
- 5.9. The long-term impact and hence the sustainability of vocational training projects is almost always ensured and exceeds that of many projects in other sectors.
- 5.10. A very high percentage of those trained in vocational training projects find employment in firms commensurate with their qualifications or are self-employed.
- 5.11. A systemic impact of German vocational training promotion, in the sense of developing elements that make an essential contribution to an operational vocational training system

Gerhard Heintze
GTZ, Division for Vocational Training and Technical Education

IDRC

The work of the Population, Education and Society Programme on TVET is carried out primarily in Latin America through the Latin American Network on Education and Work. The purpose of this network is to establish and co-ordinate a regional mechanism to facilitate communication among researchers and research institutions working in education and work and technical/vocational education. The aim is to facilitate exchange of information on research results, to encourage research collaboration, to undertake reviews and evaluations, and to identify critical problem areas for future research.

The network is co-ordinated from CENEP (Centro de Estudios de Población) in Buenos Aires, Argentina. It brings together researchers and institutions from Argentina, Brazil, Chile, Colombia, Costa Rica, Cuba, Dominican Republic, Ecuador, Guatemala, Jamaica, Mexico, Panama and Paraguay, and various international organizations. Twice a year, the network publishes and distributes free of charge a *Newsletter* reporting on current research, relevant events, and provides researchers with a forum for exchange of information. The co-ordination centre of the Network offers the services of a Documentation Centre on Education and Work that includes 1500 references. Members of the Network meet annually in a regional seminar to present research findings and identify research priorities.

For further information on the Network, contact: Dr. Maria Antonia Gallart, Co-ordinator, CENEP, Casilla de Correo 4397, Buenos Aires 1000, Argentina.

Other activities supported by the Programme on TVET include a recently completed project carried out by CINTERFOR-IL0 on Vocational Training on the Threshold of the 1990s with joint support from IDRC, GTZ, IBRD and the IDB. Among the research projects supported by IDRC in the field of Education and work are: "Education and Work. Problems and Research Trends for the 1990s". (Argentina); "Workers' Education in Uganda"; "Alternative Education for High School Graduates" (Dominican Republic); "Education and Work in Uruguay"; and "Workers' Education and Union Participation" (Chile).

Daniel Morales-Gomez, PhD.
Associate Director
Social Sciences Division

ODA

ODA's projects in Technical and Vocational Education continue to concentrate on institution building in the formal sector of education, working through the local Ministry of Education in order to maintain a government-to-government approach. Universities, polytechnics, technical colleges and technical teacher training institutes have been mainly involved, the latter to give a very desirable multiplier effect while extending support in appropriate cases for craft training and secondary technical teaching.

These institution-building projects include the supply of consultancy staff on either short or long-term contracts, the training of local staff in Britain, locally or in a third country and the supply of a comprehensive range of teaching equipment. Increasingly the projects have been operated on a link basis with institutions in the UK with project coordinating staff at both ends. Examples of such projects are the Khartoum Polytechnic, the Kenya and Mombasa Polytechnics, Swaziland College of Technology, the Nigerian Polytechnics and the Bangladesh Technical Teacher Training College.

Most developing countries find the recurrent costs associated with Technical and Vocational

Education to be unacceptably high. Considerable attention is being given in recent projects to the offsetting of these costs by income from consultancy, manufacturing, testing services and short courses to local industries, also by the more efficient use of buildings, equipment and staff.

The problems of equipment maintenance have been addressed in recent institution building projects with consultancies and training programmes in preventative maintenance and repair together with the provision of a comprehensive package of spares.

Using the sustainability criterion further, the importance of effective management and resource utilisation is recognised through training not only for managers of individual institutions but also for those who manage Ministry systems. MIS systems and performance indicators have been established and in some cases supporting computer facilities have provided with considerable efficiency gains reported.

Dr. R. Skelton and
Dr. G. Jones (ODA)

SIDA

Swedish official development assistance started in the 1950s with vocational and technical training support to the Institute of Building Technology in Addis Ababa and the Institute of Technology in Karachi. These interventions passed through different phases of adaptation and development. Both turned out to be 'success stories' and became a model for many subsequent development projects as well as a breeding ground for a generation of Swedish development workers. The decisions to start in this field were based on very sound considerations regarding requirements in the developing countries concerned and resources in Sweden.

Gradually over the years the world of development co-operation has changed as have of course the developing countries. Sweden, like other donors, has learned sometimes at high cost that establishment of training institutions is a risky undertaking which very often does not fulfil its objectives.

Vocational training, nevertheless, has remained a priority area in Swedish development cooperation. A rethinking started, however, in the mid-seventies and during the last 10-12 years no more training institution projects of the traditional type have been initiated.

One early development was directed towards achieving better multiplying effects by training of trainers and development of training material and methodology (e.g. ILO/Modules of Employable Skill) (MES).

Another development was the realisation that development projects in industry, transport, infrastructure etc. often lacked skilled manpower despite the heavy investments made in institutional skill training. As a consequence efforts were directed towards establishing and supporting *project related training*. During the last ten years increasing emphasis has been put on competence building and sustainability in the preparation of new projects as well as in the revision and strengthening of ongoing projects. To guarantee action in this area SIDA has established an "in-house consultant" placed at the Education Division but serving all sector divisions in matters regarding competence building. A network of external resource persons is **being created and project funds are available for methodology** development, sensitization workshops etc. Interesting and useful experiences have been drawn from a number of projects with different approaches and results with regard to competence building.

Parallel to this a few more traditional institutional training projects have received continued support. The major one is the Vocational Training Centre in Moshi, Tanzania, for which preparation started already in 1977. Thanks to heavy Swedish involvement it has become and still remains a model training centre of high standard. Starting from the Moshi VTC the Swedish support has gradually spread into other parts of the vocational training subsector, such as instructor training, central planning, educational management, stores management, rehabilitation of other VTCs etc. So far about 200 Million SEK have been invested. Is this a worthwhile undertaking for Tanzania and for Sweden? What will happen in the future? What should Sweden's

role be? Useful comments on this have been obtained through an ambitious evaluation (by Jon Lauglo, SIDA Education Division Documents No. 48. July 1990)

As can be seen from this brief summing-up the 'rethinking' within SIDA referred to above has resulted in some adaptation to experiences made and to new realities. Seminars, evaluations and studies have contributed to our base of experience (e.g. "Vocational Education in Developing Countries" by Mats Hultin, SIDA Education Division Documents No. 34, August 1987). SIDA has, however, found it difficult in the present situation to establish a strategy or guidelines for support to vocational and technical training. The World Bank/ILO initiative to work out policy options in vocational education and training is of course very interesting in this context. It must be born in mind, however, that SIDA cannot and should not apply the same global approach. SIDA operates in a small number of countries and does not want to have a dominant role in them. Ideally SIDA should contribute with essential inputs to support an economy or a system where policy options have been analyzed and priorities established by the countries themselves.

B. Troedsson SIDA, Education Division

USAID

Project to improve technical education in Chile

Programme Goal and Purpose

The goal of this programme is to establish the basis for a more effective technical- vocational education (TVE) system with an increased capability for improving the technical skills and productivity of young adults and workers and, thereby, their opportunities of gainful, productive employment. This goal **will** be achieved through the four programme purposes described below:

- A. To generate a series of policy recommendations having a broad consensus of support for changes in the structure, coverage, and financing of TVE;
- B. To develop and test modern, innovative technical training programmes, drawing on updated materials and curricula, and specially trained TVE instructors and administrators;
- C. To demonstrate, through carefully selected pilots and training activities, that quality improvements in technical education can be made rapidly and efficiently through approaches that integrate public and private sector interests and abilities; and
- D. To bring about a more collaborative and interactive working relationship on TVE between the private enterprise sector, educators, instructors, administrators, and government authorities, leading in turn to greater private sector support and participation for TVE.

Activities

Policy Studies - Approximately ten studies **will** be carried out during 1991-92 directed at assessing the policies causing the deficiencies of the current TVE system and developing programme proposals and policy recommendations for improving TVE. CIDE **will** organize a national TVE conference during the last quarter of 1992 to help disseminate the findings and conclusions of the studies.

Documentation and Information Center - CIDE will organize and establish a center to document, classify and store information needed to support the improvement of TVE in Chile, including, but not limited to competency based curricula design, teaching methodologies, impact evaluations, sector analysis and assessments, etc.

Curricular Modernization - CIDE will undertake the modernization of curriculum in approximately 15 to 25 local training institutions. To achieve this, it will organize workshops and courses for TVE instructors and administrators, assist in developing new teaching materials and curricula, and test and evaluate proposed changes.

Private Sector Commitment - CIDE will undertake a series of special efforts to encourage greater involvement and support by Chile's private enterprise sector in improving the quality of TVE. Exchanges with U.S. private sector organizations such as the U.S. National Alliance for Business will be carried out with the participation of leading Chilean business leaders. Institutional support will be provided to up to six schools in conjunction with private sector led efforts in coordination with local communities to serve as demonstration pilots.

Oscar Corvalan Vasquez
CIDE/REDUC

MEETINGS

Donors to African Education: Working Group on Vocational Education and Training

In the framework of a donor meeting on the World Bank's policy paper "Education in SubSaharan Africa" in Paris in January 1988, it was decided to initiate a Task Force of Donors to African Education. The Task Force has set up a number of working and action groups around themes, issues and sub-sectors which were considered important.

One of these groups is the *Working Group on Vocational Education and Training*, in which the following donor agencies participate: World Bank, African Development Bank, CIDA, IDRC, ODA, The Netherlands (DGIS) and the ILO. The first meeting of the working group was held in May 1989 in Washington followed by meetings in Geneva, September 1989 and in Vienna, July 1990. The next meeting will be on 3 December 1990 in Berlin in conjunction with the European Education Aid Donors Conference (3-4 December).

In Vienna it was agreed that the ILO would take over as Lead agency from the World Bank.

During the first meeting in Washington information on donor activities was exchanged and two main issues were identified; viz:

- articulating national VET policies around which donor support can be co-ordinated.
- entrepreneurship and the informal sector.

It was discovered that more information and dialogue was needed on VET policy of national governments and donor agencies. A priority need identified was to provide a forum for African VET policymakers to review african experiences and learn of the experiences of other regions regarding VET strategies and systems.

For that purpose a ministerial level "Policy Seminar on VET strategies and Systems for SubSaharan Africa" was held in Turin from 14-17 May 1990, jointly financed by ILO and Switzerland. This seminar was attended by 40 participants from 15 african countries, 3 experts from other developing regions and representatives of 12 donor agencies.

The objectives of the seminar were:

- to identify major issues and priorities in the formulation of vocational training policy, strategies and systems in the region
- to explore the implications of new training policies for future donor co-operation
- to propose a framework for sub-regional and national strategies to improve co-ordination between the requirements of national policy and donor inputs to vocational education and training.

The seminar was considered highly successful by the participants and it was strongly recommended to replicate the seminar at the sub-regional level.

In Vienna the working group agreed that two sub-regional seminar should be held, one in Togo for francophone countries and one in Mauritius for the anglophone countries. For each seminar ministerial level policy makers will be invited from 15 countries. At present programmes are **being drawn up** and funding is requested. It is hoped that these seminars will assist in building consensus on VET-issues between Governments and donor agencies.

Other items in the agenda of the working group for further consideration are:

- to establish a capacity for training African staff in policy analysis related to vocational training

NETWORKS

EPTA EAST AND SOUTHERN AFRICA: REPORT ON OUTCOMES AND PROPOSAL FOR TRANSITIONAL PHASE: DECEMBER 1st, 1990-JUNE 30, 1991.

SIDA has approved in principle a transitional phase for EPTA in East and Southern Africa. Don Komba and Wim Hoppers are now preparing a detailed workplan.

1. Objectives of the transitional phase..

Overall objective

To consolidate the work carried out in the first Phase of EPTA by analysing and reporting on the overall results and constraints as a basis for the compilation of a workplan for a second phase of EPTA activities in East and Southern Africa.

2. Background and Justification:

The network started five years ago as a small informal grouping of researchers working in the field of vocational education and training but with a specific interest in Education with Production. The network initiating workshop organised by CESO, The Hague, in February 1985 identified a range of common issues and problems affecting EWP programmes.

Through SIDA funding the EPTA network in East and Southern Africa became operational in Tanzania, Kenya, Ethiopia and Zambia covering state of the art reviews that were discussed at national seminars organized in each of the four countries. The network opts for a regional approach including intra-regional dissemination. In order to enhance the regional dimension of EPTA in East and Southern Africa, a regional EPTA coordinator was nominated(Dr. Donatus Komba), funds were allocated for two regional seminars and a small co-ordination point was vested at CESO.

3. Outcomes of EPTA East and Southern Africa Phase 1: 1986 to 1989:

In all participating countries State of the Art Reviews were executed and reported upon. In all countries national seminars were organized and reported upon.

Regional Seminars were organised in Harare, Zimbabwe (August 1986) and Dar es Salaam, Tanzania (June, 1988).

A synthesis report on EPTA East and Southern Africa based on an analysis of data originating from the state of the art reviews and the national and regional seminars is still lacking.

Such a report could build upon major points of interest for E and P research expressed in the launching workshop such as:

- the intra-institutional relationship between education and production: how are the two combined within the school system, or production systems?
- the intentionality behind the combination of E and P the balance between pedagogical, social and economic benefits;
- the variety of actor groups involved in E and P, their motivations, interest and influence on the dynamics of the programmes;
- the curricular issues: the interrelationships between the production activity and other educational/ training activities, the pedagogical value and possibilities for integration;
- the assessment of actual outcomes (cognitive, affective, psycho motor learning outcomes) and different impact on youth and society; particularly what are the pedagogical and social gains of production?
- the specific experiences in E and P programmes of girls in contrast to those of boys: the different value of E

4. *The need for a transition phase*

As indicated EPTA phase 1 has been strong in outputs, but these have been disseminated to a small audience and little opportunities were built-in to systematically analyse and report on the overall results of EPTA phase I in the region.

This lack of opportunity for consolidation and critical reflection has hampered the development of a proposal for further activities of EPTA in the region building on such a sound analysis of EPTA outcomes and constraints.

In the Report of the Second Regional EPTA meeting in Dar es Salaam, the rapporteur George A. Malekela noted the following:

- The first phase of EPTA depended on individual researchers; the institutional linkage was poor if any. For its growth and continuity in the future, EPTA *will* need to have both an institutional base in each country as well as committed individuals who *will* serve as its animators.
- EPTA should encompass researchers, policy makers and practitioners for a better realization of its objectives. Currently researchers tend to dominate.
- EPTA should enlarge its regional membership.
- A regional synthesis of country reports should be made which should be published.

The discussion paper 'EPTA: Where are we and what next?' by Wim Hoppers explores the experiences and current needs of the EPTA network with a view of identifying options for further development of the network and for supportive inputs from donor agencies and Northern research institutions, in particular CESO, The Hague. The paper identified several critical needs for improving the network. They include material support for developing the research environment, facilities for communication; more access to information, documentation and publication outlets; training in research skills; work on research methodologies; linking research to concrete activities in curriculum development and programme design.

5. *Activities and Responsibilities*

A. Synthesis report on EPTA phase 1 (January/ February 1991)

It is proposed that Dr. Kornba and Dr. Hoppers will analyse and report on EPTA 1 data. CESO is prepared to provide Dr. Kornba with office accommodation in order to enable a two-month intensive processing and reporting activity yielding into a manuscript for publication.

Moreover, the two month research fellowship of Dr. Kornba at CESO will enable close cooperation of the two co-ordinators in drafting a workplan for follow-up activities.

B. Strengthening the network co-ordination.

One of the main bottlenecks in effectively communicating in a regional network both within the region and North-South is the weak communication infrastructure in the office of the regional co-ordinator. It is proposed to accommodate this communication problem somewhat by the procurement and installation of a fax in the office of the regional co-ordinator in the University of Dar-Es-Salaam and to provide a budget for office overhead and communication costs.

C. Organisation of a Regional EPTA Seminar in Nairobi. (May/June 1991)

It is proposed to organise a regional seminar in Nairobi to discuss the draft synthesis report and the workplan. Participants should consist of one EPTA representative of all 4 participating countries in phase I and of 1 senior policy-maker from each of those countries.

Given the emphasis on consolidation of the EPTA network rather than on growth in terms of scope placing a too heavy burden on coordination mechanisms, it is envisaged to extend the scope of the network with one country e.g. Botswana. In that case a representative of that country *will* equally be invited to participate in the Seminar.

Donatus Kornba and Wim Hoppers.

EPTA-REPORTS

- Research programme on education and production in theory and action (EPTA). Report of a Workshop on Education with Production, held in The Hague, The Netherlands 21-24 February, 1985.
- Hoppers, W. Education with Production in Theory and Action. A Report of the network activities during 1985.

Education with Production, Vol. 5. no.1, 1985.

- Research programme on Education and Production in theory and action (EPTA). Education with production in East- and Southern Africa: a bibliography The Hague; CESO, bibliography no. 8, 1986.
- Sekhamane, T.M. Report on the African Region EPTA meeting, held in Harare, Zimbabwe, August 1986.
- Kornba, D.R. and Temu, E.B. State of the Art Review of Evaluation of Education for Selfreliance Implementation. Dar-es-Salaam; Department of Education, University of Dar-es-Salaam, 1987.
- Report of the Lusaka National seminar on Education with Production SHAPE Secretariat held at the University of Zambia, November 22-25, 1987.
- Report on education for production: national seminar, May 13-14, 1988. Addis Ababa, 1988.
- Dibaba, B., D. Mokuria and K. Mellese. A preliminary survey of the state of education for production in Ethiopia (with international background). Addis Ababa, 1988.
- Proposal (submitted to SIDA) on the study of the status of education for production in secondary schools of Ethiopia, Addis Ababa, 1988.
- Sifuna, D.N., J.O. Shiundu. Education and production in Kenya, An Overview. Nairobi, Kenya University, 1988 (mimeo).
- Haamujompa, P.M. and E.K. Waddimba. Education with production in Zambia: a state of the art/practice review. Lusaka, Educational Research Bureau, ReSearch Reports, 1988.
- LEFEP-Lesotho. A Report of the Second Education with Productive theory and Action (EPTA) meeting held at Village hotels, Dar-es-Salaam, June 1988.
- Hoppers, W., Education and Production in Theory and Action (EPTA): learning from networking in East and Southern Africa.

Education with Production, vol. 6, no.2, 1989.

- Education and Production in Theory and Action (EPTA). A Report on a meeting of network members, held on Sat. 14th December 1988 in Soesterberg, Netherlands, as part of the CESO Symposium on "Education, Culture and Productive Life in Developing Countries".

Education with Production, vol. 6, no. 2, 1989.

Note: EPTA reports are available for loan from the CESO library.

THE FOLLOW-UP TO WCEFA (WORLD CONFERENCE ON EDUCATION FOR ALL)

Introduction

In this section we shall examine some of the elements of what may be called loosely the 'follow-up' to Jomtien. Loosely because some of the items discussed are in no sense part of the official follow-up to the World Conference. They were planned earlier than WCEFA, but happening after it, they have acquired an extra significance. This is true of the 11th Commonwealth Education Ministers Conference which considered 'quality in basic education' in Barbados in November 1990. The same is true of the World Bank's Primary education policy paper which appeared in September 1990.

In the next issue we intend to look more closely at what the particular agencies have actually been doing in the field, but for most it is still premature to do so. We are instead at the stage of talking about action, revising policies, waiting to see what pressure is being put on donors to switch moneys from their traditional fields. For example, one of our correspondents has written from Africa to say 'Regarding your question about the in-country enthusiasm for EFA, I have not noticed any change at all. The francophone countries particularly seem keen to pursue high level education and VET.' Elsewhere, one could point to evidence of action at the national level in favour of EFA. For the moment, however, we'll look at some of the written materials and consider their impact on EFA.

1. Primary education: a World Bank policy paper

This 68 page paper is really the essence of the book length study that was available at Jomtien and which will appear shortly under the title Improving primary education in develop' countries by Marlaine Lockheed and Adriaan Verspoor. The policy paper booklet will presumably be very widely disseminated. But its arrival is important since it is the first sub-sectoral policy paper that the Bank has produced in the area of education. The fact that the paper relates to primary education reaffirms the statement from the Bank's President at Jomtien that 'Support for basic primary education will be the dominant priority' in moving toward education for all.

As the paper will be available very readily to those who wish to obtain a copy, we shan't take up our space in reproducing any part of it. What maybe useful is to give some impressions and reactions to it. We offer here two different kinds of commentary. First, a reaction from a group of professional teachers, some of whom have worked in the developing world, some in Britain. *(See: World Bank Policy Paper: Primary Education 1990, Comment by Caroline Dyer, Edinburgh University, page 41 of this issue)

Some Teacher reactions to Primary Education: a World Bank policy paper

The document gives a distinct sense that the Third World, especially the poor countries, has failed. At the same time, these poor countries are represented almost as a laboratory in which new experiments and initiatives can be tried out. A judgement has been made about the schools of the developing world; they have been tried in the balance, and have been found wanting. But the judgement is made in terms that generalise dryly about poor countries, and give little feeling for the pupil or the teacher. The school and the teacher are just figures, just percentages:

In contrast, students in many low income countries attend shelterless schools or ones

that are poorly constructed and ill-equipped. There are typically only 500 hours of actual learning time annually, 1.70 US worth of material inputs per student, and a poorly designed curriculum. Teachers are likely to have less than ten years of education, and classes may consist of more than 50 children, many of whom are chronically undernourished, parasite -ridden, and hungry. (p.14)

Primary education as a panacea, education isolated from its context Several things here. The document suggests that primary education can 'deliver the goods'. It seems to be almost a panacea, with so many things listed that are the result of sitting in primary school, from higher agricultural productivity to 'positive effects' on fertility (though it is not clear whether positive might mean more or less children). There is also the suggestion that if only a country can get itself universal or near universal primary education it could emulate Hong Kong, Israel, Japan, Korea or Singapore, all of which achieved this 'just before rapid economic growth'. (p.1 1)

Although this example does connect education with the economy (in a fairly mechanistic way), in general, education in the policy paper is quite isolated from the rest of the influences upon children and communities. Primary schooling seems almost to be treated as a single manipulable variable, whose inputs and outputs can be altered, without regard to what is happening outside. Hence there is little or no discussion about the wider politics of primary education, the impoverishment of rural communities, the kind of work and jobs that are available, the way the economy is operating. And there is no discussion of third world indebtedness, or of the adjustment measures that are in some way making life harder for rural institutions, including primary schools.

Primary education seems to be about some deepening of human capital, but the process is remote from culture and from communities. Literacy, numeracy and some problem-solving skills are for 'development', but there is no mention of there being a purpose for literacy such as entering the culture and tradition of a nation, in fact no reference to culturally- relevant literacy.

Modelling good primary education The argument seems to be about getting more through-puts through the system called primary school. This means improving completion rates by reducing dropouts and repetition. But the issue is not just completion; it must be completion + achievement. Hence the emphasis upon assessment and national testing. The latter is mentioned with little regard for the politics of 'accountability through achievement testing'. The illustration from Thailand (p.30) suggests that the introduction of national testing was quite unproblematic:

Districts in turn started their own testing systems and began to rank schools and individual classroom teachers according to the performance of their students on tests.

Whereas it can be seen from the UK at the moment that national testing of primary school children is politically and pedagogically a highly sensitive matter.

The emphasis, therefore, seems to be very much on the processing of much larger numbers of primary school children, at greater speed, but with better quality control. What appears to be left out of the equation are children who are academically weaker or who have learning difficulties.

The teacher: to be leaner, cheaper and more effective Obviously teaching needs to be at the heart of better primary education. There is some

valuable discussion on the current motivation of teachers, their low and decreasing salaries, poor conditions, poor promotion possibilities, and absence of effective inservice provision. But many of the suggestions for teachers are likely to result in lower status, and harder work. Thus teacher training colleges spend too much time on general education as opposed to teacher training. Money can be saved by doing the education in secondary schools. At the same time, it is acknowledged that salaries are so low that absenteeism and involvement in alternative jobs are commonplace for teachers. Yet many countries cannot afford to pay higher salaries. There is a catch 22 in this somewhere: Many of the suggestions in the policy paper point to more work for teachers, in more accountable settings (e.g. through national testing). Teachers will have to teach better for longer hours in classes that will certainly not get smaller. They may need to adopt multiple shifts and/or multigrade class teaching. There is a suggestion that programmed learning and interactive radio instruction could help the quality of classroom teaching, along with inservice training (including through distance education).

Primary education vs. further education Finally, although it is stated that primary education should be conceived of broadly as the producer of a literate and numerate population, and as a foundation for further education, the text gives little hint that most primary school products could aspire to further or higher education. Not only is primary education cut off from the wider world of health, agriculture, employment and poverty, but it is also separated from higher education. Indeed the latter is scarcely mentioned at all, except as a source from which finances may need to be reallocated to primary.

Summary note The above comments target some of the objections to the paper. It should be said in concluding that the booklet is extremely accessible, an easy read, laid out with the problems clearly stated. There is a kind of populism also in the Bank's concern with the disadvantaged, the out of school girls, the rural children, who make up the bulk of the unschooled. The Bank clearly wants all young people to profit from this basic level of schooling, but it treats the primary school world in far too self-contained a manner to succeed in its plans for its improvement.

[M.Ed. class on 'Education in Developing Countries', Edinburgh University]

2. UNESCO DISCUSSES ITS ACTION PLAN ON EDUCATION FOR ALL

Colin Power, assistant director-general for education, gave a statement on post-Jomtien developments at the Oct 29 - Nov. 2 Conference of Education Ministers of the Commonwealth. Salient among UNESCO's own actions for follow-up are the following:

The articulation of an Action Plan on Education for All, laying down the activities with which UNESCO can hope to be engaged. This specifies what help UNESCO plans to offer in respect of expertise on needs assessment, assistance with education sector analysis, EFA project development, and coordination of donors for possible funding.

Some 60 countries have indicated that they are taking some action on Jomtien (37 in Africa, 16 in Asia & Pacific, and 9 in Latin America and Caribbean). Actions typically are the setting up of task forces, commissions on EFA, roundtables etc in many of which UNESCO was ready to play a facilitating role.

Coordination amongst the heads of the four Jomtien sponsors will continue, and the plan is for

UNESCO to bring together a major consultative meeting of the interested agencies and NGOs as in Jomtien. This had been planned for one year after Jomtien, in March 1991, but this has recently been postponed to December 1991.

UNESCO is to host a series of meetings in early 1991 to allow regions to discuss their progress on educational quality and learning achievement. An international meeting on this topic of 'ensuring successful learning for all in basic education' will be held in Portugal in May 1991.

[n.b. 'Education for all: an action plan by UNESCO to follow up on the World Conference in Jomtien' is a 17 page document laying out the detail of UNESCO's plans for follow-up.

Another source of information on multilateral (and other) follow-up is the [EFA 2000 Bulletin](#) which is now in its second issue. Ed.]

3. COMMONWEALTH MINISTERS DISCUSS QUALITY IN BASIC EDUCATION

As part of an attempt to link the Commonwealth theme of improving quality in basic education with the World Conference theme, both Colin Power of UNESCO (see above) and Wadi Haddad of the World Bank had been invited to attend and address participants. A great deal of innovative material on quality improvement had been made available to the Conference from country papers. And a very useful overview of these is:

'Improving the quality of basic education: an overview of country papers'

Ministers further elaborated some of these innovative strategies, but it is important to note that on several occasions Ministers faced a trade-off between quality improvement and economic pressures associated with indebtedness and structural adjustment. This was a theme which had been very much to the fore in Jomtien itself, and had produced some of the strongest interventions of any. It may be appropriate to quote here the relevant part of the communique on this central issue:

Progress towards reaching the objectives set at Jomtien would depend mainly on countries' own efforts but the success of these would be largely determined by developments in the international economic environment. Many countries throughout the Commonwealth faced severe economic pressures caused by their acute balance of payment difficulties and their international indebtedness. Structural adjustment policies, often introduced under agreements with international financial bodies, gave little room for manoeuvre in designing programmes to improve educational quality at the basic level. There was a need for dialogue on these issues both at the national level between ministries of education and ministries of finance, and internationally by Commonwealth Education Ministers with the major international agencies including the International Monetary Fund. It was urgent to explore how vital investments in the improved quality of basic education could be protected in the course of structural adjustment. The Commonwealth Secretariat was asked to **take appropriate follow-up** action to bring about a dialogue of this kind. (Commonwealth News Release, p.2.)

The Secretariat will shortly make more formally available the outcomes of the discussions on improving the quality of basic education, along with the overview paper mentioned above and some of the other supporting papers (e.g. by K. King on 'Aid and education for all')

4. 'UNDP EFA Follow-up Strategy'

It would appear from a brief note under this title that UNDP is pushing hard for innovative ideas in EFA. Of particular concern are initiatives that cross traditional educational sectors. The 'partnerships' mentioned in the Jomtien declaration suggest that there is a good deal of potential energy for EFA waiting to be tapped outside the confines of education. This is likely to involve community groups, the private sector, non-education ministries, NGOs. It is interesting to note that whilst the World Bank's policy paper emphasises the key areas of literacy and numeracy over other curricular areas, UNDP appears to be talking with enthusiasm about possibilities of 'broadening the scientific, technological and operational aspects of the schooling experience', as well as fostering environmental education'. It should be stressed that such indications are still a long way from being realised in projects.

5. OECD'S DAC EXAMINE IMPLICATIONS FOR AID DATA OF WCEFA

As a result of Jomtien, the Development Assistance Committee of OECD is currently planning a major meeting in 1992 to examine the effectiveness of current DAC aid in assisting recipient countries pursue the WCEFA agenda. The 1992 meeting will seek to document the extent to which DAC donors have indeed adjusted or changed their priorities and practices in respect of basic education.

6. International Conference on Education, 42nd Session: and Recommendation No 77

Another source of documentary support for the movement towards Education for All could be the 'Draft Recommendation No 77 to Ministries of Education concerning the struggle against illiteracy: policies, strategies and operational programmes for the 1990s'. As part of the tradition of the International Bureau of Education and its series of comprehensive recommendations, the International Conference certainly contributed to maintaining the momentum of Jomtien. By the next Conference, all participating countries will need to give some indications of how they have responded to the 'practical measures and programmes at the national level'. Some of these measures are very general, but others are really quite specific and directive:

set specific time-bound targets for the present decade, giving the most urgent priority to the task of ensuring access to, and improving the quality of, education for girls and women and removing every obstacle that hampers their active participation. (para. 8.e)

The International Bureau of Education (IBE) was itself encouraged by conference to disseminate more widely its boxed sets of Literacy Lessons. Also, as the repository of conference documentation from WCEFA, it was in a position to assist on surveys and monitoring of progress towards EFA. We shall be talking more about research related to Jomtien later in this issue, but here it is worth remarking that both IBE and DAC may play an important role in documenting the Northern and Southern dimensions of impact (on agencies as on national member states).

++Apology to IBE++

In NORRAG NEWS 8, we mentioned that we had not noticed in Jomtien the very useful boxed

sets of Literacy lessons produced by IBE. I have since been told by John Fox of IBE that no less than 1500 copies (well over 1 tonne) were distributed in English and French at Jomtien. This is some testimony to their popularity, since some 1500 people must have got there before me!

MEETINGS RELATING TO FOLLOW-UP OF WCEFA

This is not an anticipation of the meetings section (See below), but a note on some of the meetings and networking that have kept the momentum up on EFA, even if they were planned at some point before the World Conference was known about.

1. International Conference on World Literacy in the Year 2000: research and policy dimensions, Oct. 4-7,1990, Philadelphia

This was organised by the Literacy Research Centre (LRC), of the University of Pennsylvania, and directed by Dan Wagner and his staff. Timing was good, not only because of the positive fall-out from Jomtien, but also because the LRC had just been made a national (US) centre for literacy.

The conference was organised around presentation of papers and workshops. The latter were partly oriented to the development of project proposals to present to a notional donor. No over-riding priority for literacy research emerged, but what was evident, perhaps particularly to those whose primary occupation is not literacy research, was how diverse was the provenance of expertise on literacy. Research on literacy is by no means restricted to departments of adult and continuing education in universities and ministries.

2. Functional literacy in Eastern and Western Europe: a UIE/UNESCO/OECD-CERI seminar in collaboration with the Commission of the European Communities__, 20-22 November, Hamburg

This particular conference built on a whole series of meetings that the Unesco Institute in Hamburg has convened on different aspects of literacy and especially post-literacy. The title of the seminar might have been widened to include North America, since it would seem that a number of the key background papers to the meeting draw on some of the relevant Canadian experience on literacy. Apparently one of the important new developments at the conference was a much greater readiness on behalf of Eastern European representatives to describe the shortcomings in literacy achievement in their own national situations.

3. NGO leaders suggest the development of a global NGO Network to promote Education for All, (meeting, 16-17 July 1990)

The proposal to form such a 'Education for all network' is contained in a document signed by the presidents of the various standing committees of NGOs attached to UNESCO, the World Bank, UNICEF, as well as by the NGO vice-president of the Jomtien Conference Bureau. What they are proposing is a further meeting in January 1991 to carry the idea of a global NGO network forward. This globalisation of the NGO component of the WCEFA follow-up partly relates to an NGO determination to be part of all formal structures for the implementation of EFA at all levels. In other words, at Jomtien the NGO voice very conspicuously came in from the cold and sat on equal terms with agencies and national governments. There is clearly an interest in sustaining this new international place for the NGO community. This is an initiative that should be followed with interest, and not least because there is certain to be a significant element in the NGO community which feels distinctly uneasy about claiming a

rightful place at the top table with governments. This element may fear co-optation by government and agency opinion. Be that as it may, there is no doubt that the increasingly influential international NGO community deserve to make their own position clear on the WCEFA follow-up, and can be expected to contribute to follow-up activities in many different ways.

See further: 'Proposal for the development of an education for all network', obtainable from NGO-liaison committees attached to UNICEF, UNESCO, World Bank etc.

Early childhood education

Both Robert Myers and Fred Wood felt we could have been a bit more generous to the extraordinary progress of Early Childhood Education and Development in the context of the World Conference on Education for All. Indeed, we did note that this 'subsector' had come in from the cold, and had achieved the status of being one of the 6 suggested targets in the general area of basic education.

Early childhood educators will be glad to see that in the Bank's Primary Education, paper preschools feature. Viz:

Preschool*. Research in both industrial and developing countries demonstrates that preschool experience, including attendance at Koranic schools, has positive effects that are often sustained for several years. Targeted preschool programmes, aimed at families with low incomes, have been particularly effective. Publicly financed preschool experience for all children is not feasible for most developing countries, but private and community-supported preschools - including those supported largely by NGOs - should be encouraged. (p.23,1990)

Robert Myers has recently produced a further book on the **ECCD** theme:

Robert Myers, Toward a fair start for children - programming for early childhood care and development in the developing world (UNESCO, 1990)

WORLD BANK POLICY PAPER: PRIMARY EDUCATION 1990

Comment

This policy paper distills options for policy contained in the document distributed at the March 1990 World Conference on Education For All, Improving Primary Education in Developing Countries: a review of policy options. The latter *will* appear as a World Bank publication, authored by Marlaine Lockheed and Adriaan Verspoor.

The policy focus has begun to shift from the quantitative provision of the last two decades, based on the notion that universal primary education could become a reality if the shortage of physical facilities was overcome. Evident now is a closer concern with the actual process of schooling, as the three main subsections show: enhancing the learning environment (promotion of 'effective' learning, and achieving minimum levels of learning); improving the preparation and motivation of teachers; and strengthening educational management.

Despite this shift, the language of the policy document is indicative of its economic approach: simple cause-effect terminology (particularly evident in the opening paragraph of each chapter); cost/benefit, efficiency, achievement, input, output. The World Bank continues to view education as a matter of building human capital, a process which inefficient primary education systems 'jeopardise'. Such glimmers of attention to qualitative issues as there are in the document are welcome, but it remains hard to imagine that the Bank will be able to overcome its own intrinsic character and wholly endorse more qualitative approaches, since the benefits of education in social terms *will* always remain hard to quantify.

Problematic too is the identification of developing nations as a homogenous group. The problems might seem similar but the socio-political conditions that created them clearly are not: what is implied here is the need for a conceptual shift which places educational problems more firmly in context, moving away from the neatly identified, non country specific package of problems which can be put right with an injection of World Bank funds. A detailed consideration of the many environmental factors which brought about national problems in education, and contribute to their continued existence, *will* indicate that many constraints on educational improvements cannot be remedied by financial assistance or external expertise. At present there is a risk that primary education may be singlehandedly expected to answer the need for manpower, unaccompanied by adult literacy programmes of social change. There must be a wariness of imposing impossible demands on one level of the educational system without support from the socio-geographical context.

There are a number of issues with inherent elements of contradiction, inconsistency or incompleteness. One suggested solution to educating more children is the use of double shifts; this might however reduce the length of the school day for each shift, so the school year should be lengthened to compensate. Yet elsewhere the problems of teacher absenteeism, low morale and attrition are noted, so the notion that undermotivated teachers should want to work longer hours bears no apparent relation to what has already been identified as problematic. Pre-primary education is recommended, yet difficulties of motivating parents to send children to school at all have also been noted: the conclusion is not drawn that priority might usefully be given to exploring obviously problematic parental relationships with schooling.

This policy paper notes that primary teacher trainees' academic background is so weak that academic remediation rather than pedagogical skills is the focus of teacher training: an expensive option. The suggested solution is therefore that prospective teachers gain their secondary education in secondary schools, allowing teachers training colleges to concentrate on pedagogical input. This certainly pinpoints a widely perceived weakness in teacher training strategies which needs to be addressed. Here the problem of identifying

is required to improve primary teachers' training is improvement at secondary level, allowing training colleges to mould academically competent secondary graduates into pedagogically and academically sound teachers. If this cost-saving measure is logically followed through, a considerable overhaul of the conduct of secondary schooling would be needed. This would run the risk of creating the opposite effect from what is suggested, by shifting the focus of reform efforts away from the primary sector. Since, as the Bank notes, there has hitherto been a focus on higher educational sectors in many developing countries, this notion potentially deflects attention away from the push towards developmental effort at the primary stage and supports the already favoured development of the secondary level.

It may **anyway be that** the World Bank's enthusiasm for primary education is not shared at present by national governments, who may have other priorities. Although donor preference is mentioned and the Bank's policy makes explicit its commitment to more flexibility, its stated intention to provide 'aggressive support' for primary education does little to reassure that the underlying attitude to aid provision reflects this flexibility. The impression remains that the transfer of knowledge is a one-way process, from North to South, and that only those countries will be sponsored who are already focusing on the Bank's priority areas of cost-effective inputs and institutional strengthening. Paragraphs such as these in the document again undermine its stated aims of withdrawing from its established 'technical expert' status to a more modest position of 'facilitating and analytical support'.

The emphasis in this policy paper towards long-term national primary development programmes, moving away from project-based funding, is ambitious and may ultimately make a greater impact on the educational needs of poor countries. But the World Bank's vision of itself as taking a greater role in underpinning educational development efforts may not accord with Southern countries own worries about taking on further financial dependence. The recommended per capita spending level in developing countries on primary education is derived from a comparison with high-income countries spending; an unsatisfactory yardstick. If the aim is ultimately to reduce dependency on external funding, which is the wish of the countries themselves, this may be an artificial level which further increases that dependency rather than facilitating its gradual reduction. The crucial question is: how truly flexible and responsive to national perceptions of need is a financial institution such as the World Bank prepared to be?

Caroline Dyer,
Edinburgh University

WCEFA BILATERAL FOLLOW-UP

Federal Republic Germany

IDRC (Canada)

The Netherlands

NORAD (Norway)

United Kingdom

Sweden

NORRAG FLASH: Policy update The Netherlands

BILATERAL FOLLOW-UP WCEFA

Introduction

In the closing ceremony of the WCEFA Conference a plea was made to turn the attention to immediate and active follow-up. Some of these follow-ups are reported upon in this section. Especially the Netherlands and Germany reflect on broad campaigns within their constituency to increase the awareness of bottlenecks related to education and literacy for all both in their own societies and in the world at large. This advocacy role was translated into a parliamentary resolution in Germany and in the Netherlands in a remarkable emphasis on education for all, in the policy note of Minister Jan Pronk responsible for development cooperation 'New frameworks for development cooperation in the nineties: A world of difference'. In the United Kingdom, the Jomtien Conference paper 'Educating all the Children' was focal in bringing together representatives of ODA with education authorities (DES), British Council and researchers to discuss implications for research and donor agencies.

It is, however, premature to note significant shifts in priority allocation both financial and in terms of approaches related to education for all. Some, such as IDRC, NORAD and SIDA have a longstanding commitment towards basic education. It would be interesting to know more about shifts in budgetary allocations to EFA, pre- and post Jomtien, also considering that some agencies have been faced with budget cuts. IDRC is exploring collaboration with other donors on a regional basis. In terms of support to primary education, often such cooperation is through co-financing within programmes of the multilaterals. In terms of adult education and eradication of illiteracy such cooperation seems to be less common. NORRAG News will try to assist in providing project and programme -related information which may enhance such cooperation.

wb

FEDERAL REPUBLIC OF GERMANY

1. Follow-ups to WCEFA have to be seen in a broader context and should not be restricted to DSE or GTZ activities.
 - The joint workshop on African Primary School Agriculture organised by GTZ and DSE with financial support of SIDA is one of the follow-up activities to WCEFA. The workshop is due to take place from 19th to 29th of November in Kadoma/Zimbabwe.
 - Under the auspices of the Ministry for Economic Co-operation (BMZ) an inter-agency **committee was formed in order to** discuss main problems of basic education and look into future projects and programmes in this field. The committee comprises governmental as well as non -governmental agencies in the Federal Republic of Germany.
 - Preparations for a new sector paper on basic education commissioned by the Ministry for Economic Co-operation were discussed within the inter-agency committee for basic education. The expected draft of the sector paper will be reviewed in a special seminar with different German experts in the field of basic education. The new sector paper is expected to come out by March/April 1991.
2. Within the context of German reunification, projects within the field of basic education of the former German Democratic Republic are presently worldwide under review. Evaluation missions are looking into the activities of such projects, particularly in Africa in countries like Angola, Ethiopia, Mozambique, etc. Sector reviews and dialogues with the African governments could result in increased activities in those countries in the field of basic education supported by the German government.
3. An independent pressure group called "Initiative Basic Education in Third World Countries" composed of journalists, politicians and educationalists has since the World Conference Education for All increased its activities to create a greater awareness for supporting basic education in developing countries.

Leading officials of the Ministry for Economic Co-operation have now in public statements regarded basic education as one of the most urgent needs in Third World countries and have

stated that basic education has to be seen as a human right in its own. After an intensive hearing members of Parliament of the three main parties have recommended to Parliament to accept a resolution that addresses Government in the case of basic education and is requesting a significant increase of funds for basic education as a consequence of the WCEFA. The resolution was accepted by Parliament end of October 1990. (See: Grundbildung in der Entwicklungszusammenarbeit; Beschlussempfehlung und Bericht des Ausschusses für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit, Deutscher Bundestag, 11. Wahlperiode, Drucksache 11/8083, 08.10.90).

The Parliamentary State Secretary Dr. Repnik of the Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation together with members of the Initiative Basic Education in Third World Countries (Kurt Gerhardt, West German Radio, Dr. Christel Adick, University of Siegen, Dr. Udo Bude, DSE, and Peter Hesse, Peter Hesse Foundation) briefed in a joint press conference on the 8th of November 1990 German journalists of different media on the latest developments in basic education in Third World countries. The Parliamentary State Secretary recognised the importance of basic education within the framework of German aid policy and promised an increase of aid to projects and activities in the field of basic education.

4. DSE prepared a new programme document for basic education in Africa.

Dr. Udo Bude.

IDRC

Several of the concerns emerging from the WCEFA have been for the past several years among IDRC priorities in funding educational research for development. Following Jomtien, the **Population, Education and Society Programme** continues supporting developing country institutions to undertake research that focuses on the determinants, processes and outcomes of basic education and learning. Special emphasis is given to research aimed at bettering the knowledge-base for improved policy and practice in education, and at understanding innovations that lead to the identification of feasible ways of solving problems in basic education.

Since Jomtien, the Programme has initiated and/or funded various types of activities. These include supporting researchers to participate in national and regional EFA follow-up discussions, publishing and disseminating the findings of IDRC-supported research on formal and nonformal basic education, sponsoring country -specific state-of -the art reviews and funding research projects that address key questions about the role, quality and relevance of teaching and learning in basic education among the most disadvantaged groups in the society.

Steps have also been taken to strengthen IDRC's response to developing countries' needs related to Education for All. Programme priorities are being reviewed in all regions to focus more directly on research and research -related activities on basic education and learning from a human and social development perspective. Contacts have been established with regional research institutions in Asia and Latin America which could undertake and co-ordinate studies that better respond to culturally specific settings. Collaboration with other donors is being explored on a regional basis to strengthen the power of joint resources and avoid duplication. IDRC-supported regional research networks in Africa, Latin America and Asia are being encouraged to address EFA issues.

To facilitate its overall EFA thrust, the Population, Education and Society Programme is targeting an important proportion of its education research funds to support projects on basic education issues. Additionally, IDRC has committed special funds from its 1990-1991 budget to be allocated to support WCEFA follow-up initiatives.

Daniel Morales-Gomez, PhD.
Associate Director
Social Sciences Division

NORAD

It has long been a tradition within Norwegian donor policy in the field of education to promote

basic education. Prior to Jomtien major project plans in basic education were initiated in Pakistan and Bangladesh. There was also a major emphasis on support to basic education with Zambia and Tanzania. With regard to Zambia and Tanzania NORAD shifted its support priority to secondary education because this is being viewed as the bottleneck in the system.

In Pakistan the project will only run up to 1995, since a government decret has stated to fade out this country as a main counterpart country, due to its reluctance to use more of its GNP to civic human resource development. Today NORAD supports 3 educational projects in Pakistan. One is in co-operation with the World Bank on erection of schools and production of school books. A NORAD project in the Sind province aims at developing a concept for text-book production in conjunction with the local text-book board- as a case for possible reduplication. The Allama Iqbal Open University project provides support to distance teacher education programme.

In Bangladesh one similarly concentrates on basic education in text-book production together with UNICEF, giving supplementary funds for paper and technical assistance.

A programme on district based basic health and environment education is initiated this year in the Fahiridpor district.

In both countries the funding amounts to around 20 mill Norwegian kroner per year. In addition, the Division for Multilateral Co-operation are also active in the education field and the Department for NGO co-operation.

Tove Nagel,
Institute for Educational Research,
University of Oslo, Norway

THE NETHERLANDS

- The national Delegation to WCEFA reported back. Also CESO and the UNESCO commission published a report, which was offered to the government and distributed to interested parties.
- Various studydays and conferences were organized often focussing on literacy, in the Netherlands but also as a world problem.
- Attention was made to the printed word during the National Library Day on April 21 and the "Third Book Month" in which books written by authors from developing countries were promoted.
- The SVE produced audiocassettes for literacy in a second language for migrant workers. Various exhibitions were organized by private organizations.
- On 17/1/91 closing conference of the International Literacy Year. It is to be expected that recommendations will be made to continue activities in the framework of Education for All for the next decade.
- In 1991, October 14-16 Tilburg University and the National Unesco Commission will organize a conference on Literacy in Tilburg.
- The ideas and recommendations from WCEFA Jomtien found there way into the new policy memorandum by the Minister for Development Co-operation J. Pronk, who in his chapter on Human Resource Development paid special emphasis on basic education, women and culture.
- In its publications CESO paid special attention to basic education, culture and women. Issues in the various CESO series concerned Literacy, Popular theater, Workers Education and Literacy for women.
- With support by HIVOS a seminar was organized in La Paz, Bolivia on Educacion Popular. The report is

basic education was emphasized in the 1989-1990 course on education in developing countries.

Prof. dr. Leo F.B. Dubbeldam

UNITED KINGDOM

"INTO THE NINETIES" *EDUCATION FOR ALL' FOLLOW-UP MEETING HELD AT THE ODA ON 11 OCTOBER 1990

Education Division of the ODA convened this meeting of education advisers and educationists from the academic world to discuss further the implications of "Education for All" following on from the Jomtien conference early this year, and where such considerations might lead ODA education policy. Participants came from a number of institutions including universities, colleges, the British Council, the DES, and NGO field. Including 7 ODA participants, a total of 22 participants attended the meeting.

The first part of the seminar was led by Drs. Colclough and Lewin of IDS, University of Sussex, who gave a presentation on the economic challenge of Education for All, based on their paper for the Jomtien Conference, "Educating all the Children". (See: Research follow-up section)

They demonstrated that Education for All could be possible by the year 2000 if resources were re-channelled as indicated and greater funding was available. The implications of this for developing countries and for donor agencies are very serious.

In the afternoon session, which was a more open discussion, aid, innovation, sustainability and the fruitfulness of research in education were all discussed. Bilateral agencies such as the ODA have a certain amount of leverage both in terms of improving education systems overseas, and in negotiating with multilateral donors such as the World Bank.

The ODA has established a Research and Innovation board which **will** develop a research policy in education and commission proposals from interested parties. One topic for research was put forward at the meeting: critiques of global documents produced by multilateral agencies on for example Sub-Saharan Africa, to examine their applicability to individual countries or regions. It was also felt that at the most basic grassroots level, research into the actual process and product of teaching and learning in classrooms in developing countries would enable bilateral agencies to establish policy dialogues with the ministries of those countries.

The meeting proved to be a valuable exchange of views on the implications of "Education for All". Though no definite answers to problems may have surfaced, an airing of the problems and difficulties of under-resourced education systems, relating them to a bilateral donor agency's education policy, gave much food for thought. ODA responds to overseas governments requests for assistance, and therefore cannot create its policy in a vacuum. However if the Jomtien conference bears fruit in encouraging overseas governments to make basic education for all a high priority for themselves, ODA will now be better prepared to assist them in their efforts.

Myra Harrison
Senior Education Advisor
ODA

SIDA FOLLOW-UP TO THE WORLD CONFERENCE ON EDUCATION FOR ALL

SIDAs support, as a co-sponsor, to the World Conference on Education for All (WCEFA) can be seen as just one strand in a long -established support to basic education in developing countries. Sector support to SIDA "programme countries" is channeled by the Education Division through the ministries of education. Basic education is also supported by Swedish non-governmental

organizations who work through similar organizations in many developing countries.

This tradition of involvement in basic education makes it difficult to define precisely what SIDA activities should be considered as WCEFA follow-up. Has WCEFA had an impact within SIDA? On the whole, the education support is "more of the same", i.e. an emphasis on basic education including support to primary schools, textbooks, primary teacher training, literacy and postliteracy programmes. There is also a continuing support to vocational education. There are some projects, however, which can definitely be seen as the types of "new partnership and alliances" advocated in the WCEFA documents. For example, SIDA is supporting a research programme at IIEP which looks into non-conventional approaches to basic education. The new education support to Bangladesh is channeled through a donor consortium (lead agency is the World Bank) and part of the funding will be channelled to non-governmental organizations, including BRAC, which run non-formal primary education programmes.

At the same time, the WCEFA has stimulated the discussion within SIDA on how to adapt development aid in a period of long drawnout economic crisis. A report on "Swedish Aid to African Countries in crisis (the document is available only in Swedish) has been discussed in many fora within the organization. The authors look at Swedish development aid against the background of the eroded capacity and legitimacy of the state in many of the recipient countries, which problems are in turn related to the economic crisis: debt burden, corruption, increased aid-dependency. The process of structural adjustment is at the same time having a negative effect on social sectors such as education and health. The general conclusion is that for development aid to have an impact, there has to be more attention paid to institution building including the "transfer" and institutionalization of knowledge. Public administration, with its responsibilities for financial and social sector management, must be strengthened, and it is no longer a matter of just training a few individual educational planners or other categories of technical staff. Increased weight also has to be given to questions of democracy, and there should be increased co-ordination and co-operation between donors. For education, the most important conclusion is that there should be increased support to the social sectors. It is too early to say how such an increased support to education will look in practice. It is not expected, however, that it will be an easy task to increase it. **For example, how can Increased support to textbook production make an Impact on educational quality when teachers cannot support themselves** on their salaries? How will underpaid, understaffed and under-resourced ministries of education handle an increased volume of aid, or an increased number of donor missions? The main question within SIDA is, therefore, not whether we should increase support to basic education, but how the support should be implemented.

Christine McNab
SIDA Education Division

NORRAG FLASH

POLICY UPDATE: The NETHERLANDS

New frameworks for development co-operation in the nineties have been presented to Parliament by Minister Pronk responsible for Development Cooperation on September 20, 1990, in his policy note 'A world of difference'.

Subject to Parliamentary approval allocation to development cooperation will be maintained at 1.5% of the National Income. For 1991 about 6.3 billion guilders, an increase of 354 million guilders compared to 1990 figures, has been reserved.

In the nineties, according to the policy note, Dutch assistance to Africa will be increased by 50%.

Public administration and democracy.

Within the education sector support to higher education through International Education, interinstitutional co-operation and fellowships *will* be consolidated. Further support to basic education is pleaded for both within the regular school system, adult education and technical vocational education and training.

Patterns of programme and sector countries for Dutch development cooperation have been modified somewhat :

In Africa four sector regions are distinguished:

1. Region Nile and Red Sea with the countries Egypt, Sudan, Ethiopia and Yemen. 2. Region East Africa with the countries Kenya, Tanzania, Uganda and Rwanda.
3. Region Southern Africa with the countries Angola, Botswana, Lesotho, Malawi, Swaziland, Mozambique, Zambia and Zimbabwe. Also Namibia can count on Dutch support especially related to the strengthening of the economic infrastructure.
4. Region Sahel and other countries in West Africa with Burkina Faso, Mali, the Gambia, Guinea Bissau, Cape Verde, Mauritania, Niger, Senegal, Tsjaad, Benin, Ghana and Cameroun.

In Asia, Indonesia, Bangladesh and Pakistan *will* maintain the status of programme country.

A new programme region the 'Mekong' will equally benefit from Dutch assistance with Thailand, Kampuchea, Vietnam, Laos and Myanmar.

Nepal and the Philippines *will* maintain their status as sector country, while China subject to further normalisation *will* also maintain its sector country status.

In Latin America, besides Surinam, the following two regions *will* be distinguished:

1. The region Central America with Costa Rica, El Salvador, Guatemala, Honduras, Nicaragua and Jamaica.
2. Andes region with Bolivia, Colombia, Ecuador, Peru and Chile.

Research in Dutch policy framework.. A world of difference

The relevance of research in Dutch development cooperation is indicated by high priority to be allocated to strengthening the research capacity in developing countries given unequal access to the body of knowledge. Moreover research is being perceived as relevant in order to provide empirical foundation and directives for Dutch development cooperation policy.

Points of departure for research policy:

- research demand needs to be based on needs of developing countries; hence the necessity to match demand to supply.
- need for concentration of research efforts in terms of countries and themes.
- active involvement of users in developing countries in the research cycle and the deployment of approaches aimed at strengthening research capacity in those countries.

Research will be the central focus of a new spearpoint programme with special emphasis on socio-economic research, environment, agriculture, health, technology development in general and bio-technology in particular.

The spearpoint programme 'Urban Poverty Alleviation' refers to the upgrading of the urban infrastructure in fields such as water supply and sanitation, health and education including vocational training. Emphasis is placed on employment and income-generating forms of activities within the informal sector.

The research programme, however, apart from the spearpoints referred to before will also have an orientation towards other sectors and themes of relevance to policy such as rural development, education for all, health for all and culture and development.

resource base especially in Africa.

A shift of Dutch assistance policy in Asia is noted from support to economic infrastructure to support to human resources (education, social welfare, health, water supply and sanitation).

Priorities for development cooperation with Latin America in the nineties include rural poverty alleviation through socio-economic integration of small farmers and landless workers; urban poverty alleviation based on support to small scale informal and formal enterprises and the development of human resources.

According to the note Netherlands support to education in developing countries is focusing on both formal and non-formal education, general and vocational education, basic, secondary and higher education. Emphasis will be placed on quality improvement and access to education for deprived groups including women. There is preference for support to vocational education rather than general education. Support to basic education concentrates on non-formal education including functional literacy within integrated rural development programmes.

Especially for Africa special attention is being asked for the position of girls in education and the needs for more functional education at lower and secondary level as well as for filling the gaps in university education and research.

The general emphasis on education for all has not yet been operationalised in channels, instruments and programmes of assistance. The programmes of interinstitutional cooperation (SV) and the Programme of Direct support to training institutes in developing countries (DSO) will remain the realm for higher education cooperation. However, there will be important components of human resources development in spearpoint programmes such as Women and Development, Urban poverty alleviation and within the research programme related to technology development and socio-economic research.

From: Nieuwe kaders voor ontwikkelingssamenwerking in de jaren negentig; Een wereld van verschil. Tweede Kamer, vergaderjaar 1990-1991, 21813, nrs.1-2.

Wim Biervliet.

WCEFA RESEARCH FOLLOW-UP

NORRAG
SEARRAG
DICE and CESO
CESO
FRANCE
IDS
IIEP

SHORT RESEARCH OUTLINES

DSE
IIRC
HE
NORAD

WCEFA: RESEARCH FOLLOW-UP

Introduction

This section provides a glance at on-going and planned research related to Education for All, partly initiated as a direct follow-up to WCEFA, partly as in the case of some projects of IIE, Stockholm, mainly funded through SAREC, already long-term and on-going. Some projects reported upon fit well within the need to provide sustained long-term support for national and regional actions through capacity building for research and planning. One of those projects, within IDRC's thrust to support educational research networks in the South, presently under review, will fund a series of activities in Asia, Latin America and Africa, to better understand the concrete economic, political and educational implications of EFA. In order to strengthen the body of knowledge as a basis for policy-making SEARRAG has proposed to do state-of-the-art/state of practice review in all Asean countries related to primary education with focus on access to quality education and compensatory education, on pre-school programmes and on literacy. NORRAG is interested in mobilising its constituency of educational researchers and agency personnel in the North in close interaction with colleagues from Southern RRAG's to do a study on the interactions between national and external agencies on Education for All starting with a pilot-phase in Tanzania. It would be interesting if researchers funded by their own respective agency could be involved in such a project while researchers from the south could play a major role in studying national policies related to EFA.

There are some examples of research related to new partnerships in education such as cooperative plans between DICE and CESO and the planned IIEP casestudies on 'Collaborating for Educational Change'. A fair amount of research studies presented in this issue relates to equity issues of female participation and access of disadvantaged groups to basic education and literacy programmes. Especially with the bilateral agencies, some more research into non-formal education and literacy provision is reported upon than research strictly related to primary education. An interesting shift may be noticed at IIEP, from the successful pre-WCEFA research on effects of literacy programmes to a post-WCEFA inter-regional research project on the improvement of basic education services, following a similar methodological approach. Some interesting EFA related research in the North was noted among others by I.I.E. Stockholm, which was however not incorporated in this issue, because of our emphasis on research in the South.

wb

NORRAG RESEARCH PROJECT

Title: *Education for All: new interactions between national and external agencies*

I. Introduction

NORRAG along with other Southern Research Review and Advisory Groups (RRAGs), was closely involved in commenting on the World Conference documentation, and it participated with Southern RRAGs in a Round Table at Jomtien on 'Basic education: the potential of networking and North-South partnerships'. Since its formation in 1985, NORRAG has been very much concerned with the analysis of agency policies, and with the dissemination of this via NORRAG NEWS to policy makers and researchers in the North and South.

As an extension of this relatively long term concern with agency policy, NORRAG has been encouraged to initiate research on this new agency focus on education for all. The notion of tracking and analysing what is, arguably, one of the largest shifts in thinking about education since the massive interest in non-formal education in the early 1970s is compelling. But the research would not be concerned only with agency policy. In reality such policy is intimately affected by what are perceived to be the attitudes towards basic education in the developing world, and more generally by the deteriorating economic situation in so many developing countries. Consequently, the research will be concerned with the interaction of agency policies and the policies of national governments.

The purpose of the research will be to situate such policies within the traditions and history of different states, but, equally, the research will have a strong formative character; through understanding the character and constraints of both agency and national policies in basic

education, there should be derived inputs for the improvement of decision-making for agency personnel as for planners and policy makers in the developing world.

This present proposal lays out the broad concerns of the entire project but its primary aim is to outline the importance of a pilot phase. During this phase, the feasibility of the larger project will be tested for its application to a single country, Tanzania, and to a small group of the donors involved there.

The proposal has been developed in a highly collaborative manner. Starting from informal discussions with agencies in Jomtien, it has been one of the items on the agenda of meetings in four different centres of NORRAG activity, Stockholm, The Hague, Geneva, and Edinburgh. This has allowed it to be shaped not only by many different individuals and centres in NORRAG's constituency, but also by many agency representatives, bilateral and multilateral, and by the reactions of co-ordinators of Southern RRAG groups.

11. Rationale

In initiating a research project in 1990 on 'Education for all', NORRAG is concerned with developments in agencies and national governments that are several years earlier, than the Jomtien Conference, as well as more recent initiatives that will be enhanced by Jomtien. Over the last decade attention to basic education by agencies and national governments has been very uneven. Some agencies and some countries have maintained, and even strengthened a longstanding commitment to basic education. Others have until recently accorded little importance to these aspects of educational provision. Even with the massive publicity surrounding the World Conference, the impact has been more immediately noticeable in the donor community than in the policy environments of developing countries, and within the donor community, more obvious amongst the multilateral than the bilateral donors.

There are however now, in the wake of Jomtien, a series of countries and agencies that are reassessing their policies in basic education. Initially, the scope and implications of individual country and agency responses to Jomtien were only very sketchily known. Several agencies have, however, begun to review the implications of Jomtien for aid policy, through a series of national seminars and conferences. While in the South, several countries have acted very firmly in support of new policies towards basic education.

This double reaction towards Jomtien provides the core of the NORRAG project. But since it is the interaction between agency and national policy in particular countries that is important, it will be crucial to seek to pursue the analysis collaboratively with researchers from the countries concerned. Ideally, the latter should also be associated with the review of policy shifts in the North, as should Northern researchers with the delineation of policy changes in the South.

In the NORRAG project there will be a particular focus on bilateral agencies and their vision of education for all. This is not single vision. Some bilaterals have had a tradition of support to basic education for many years; others have only operationalised that commitment to basic education in particular countries. And a few bilaterals have just very recently begun fundamentally to reconsider their policies of relatively minimum support to primary and adult education.

It will be essential however for this priority focus on the bilaterals to be situated within a very detailed knowledge of what the main multilaterals are prepared to initiate in the field of basic education. The sheer weight of the multilaterals (World Bank, UNICEF, UNDP and UNESCO) and their impact on some of the developing countries (and upon some of the bilateral agencies themselves) must be part of the backdrop to this research.

Aid policies are inseparable from the countries that receive aid. In selecting countries for inclusion in this research project, however, attention will be given to the levels of national concern with basic education, and not just to the presence of agency projects in that sub-sector.

Particular emphasis will be given to the new mechanisms and modalities which donors are increasingly adopting to respond to the financial crisis in basic education provision in certain countries. How these match with national government policies, where new initiatives on cost sharing, community control and decentralisation are commonplaces, will be important to analyse.

III. Project aims

The overall aim of the project is to contribute to the understanding of the changing role of educational aid in its relations to developing country policies in education. It will concentrate on developments in the sphere of basic education, and in particular on the area of interaction between agency and national policy in education projects and programmes. More specifically the project will:

1. examine recent changes in the social and economic foundations for support to basic education in both South and North, and will analyse the way these relate to the traditions, history, and the role of the state in different settings;
2. examine agency-specific and national rationales for involvement in basic education, and, where appropriate, trace over time the emergence of a basic education agenda concerned with universal access and achievement;
3. analyse agency and national responses to economic constraints in developing countries, and agency involvement in structural adjustment programmes as they relate to basic education;
4. identify new project modalities, patterns of resource allocation and partnership designed by agencies to deal with the changed socio economic and educational realities in developing countries, and the impact of these on the countries concerned.
5. identify requirements for and availability of baseline data, and explore methods of reporting upon and monitoring basic education at agency, national and local levels;
6. develop strategies and materials reflecting new approaches to agency- government interaction in the sphere of basic education.

IV. Methods: **General approaches**

In general the NORRAG project will be enriched by interaction with other Southern Rrag projects on different dimensions of follow-up to Jomtien. As in the workshop with Southern Rrag co-ordinators in Geneva (see section on NORRAG), opportunities will be sought regularly to ensure exchanging of information and commentary among the different Rrag initiatives related to Jomtien follow-up. More particularly, however, as was explained above, the *NORRAG* project is based on a collaborative approach, in which it is assumed that the analysis of agency policy will be enriched by the participation of a Southern researcher or planner in the research, and vice versa for the study of policy in the selected developing countries.

The project will start with a review of the literature on 'investment' in education with special emphasis on primary and basic education. It will examine the empirical literature related to the above as well as studies of indicators of educational development. In practice, this analysis will need to be embedded in the history and tradition of different states and the impact of these upon education policies, whether of agencies or of national governments and non -governmental organizations.

The project will collect and analyse a variety of materials produced by aid agencies and national governments, such as policy papers and programme- or project-related documents. They will include country and sector studies, with special emphasis on resource allocation to primary and basic education. Attention will be given to analysing various base-line data used and methods of collecting and reporting.

Case studies will be made of new approaches to agency -government co-operation in basic education. The case study method will also be used to examine new style projects and developments in direct budgetary support.

Interviews will be conducted with key informants in aid agencies and selected ministries in developing countries.

V. **Organization and execution of pilot phase**

1. Planning and pilot phase: 11 months

The planning and pilot phase involves testing the methodology and the conceptual framework in a single country (Tanzania) and with the group of agencies who have been closely associated with education policy in that country. All the principal stages of the research will be represented in the pilot phase, but before proceeding to study a group of five or more countries, it is important to test both the assumptions and the integrated, collaborative research strategy.

Although only one country is being selected in this phase, it has been selected because it would appear to have a strong existing tradition of basic education. It is also a country in which the three types of bilateral involvement can be detected: a) those agencies which have been long committed to basic education, and have supported it in Tanzania, b) those agencies with a tradition of basic education, but without a programme of support to it in Tanzania, and c) those agencies without a history of support to basic education, but who have very recently decided to finance or explore projects in this country.

Many of the European bilaterals are involved with Tanzania, as are several of the multilaterals. The pilot phase will, consequently, allow these to contribute a small part of their Tanzania experience and expertise to the project, and in the process, they will hopefully be able to profit from the project, and reach a judgement about continuing to be involved in the full first phase.

Summary stages of work on the pilot phase

1. Identify (through agency documents) the changing relationships between agency policies on Tanzania in general and support to education in Tanzania in particular. This will be carried out by reviewing the documentation on Tanzania as a 'programme country' as well as the sector studies on education. Particular attention will be paid to the agency literature relating to basic education. The time frame for this review will be the past two decades, but it will be important to examine whether the build-up or follow-up to Jomtien have had a discernible impact on specific agencies. The pilot phase will be seeking to check feasibility by determining the broad thrust of agency policy. The fine detail of the documentation collected will be sifted more thoroughly in the next phase.

In this pilot treatment, it will not be appropriate to elaborate in full detail the particular tradition of each agency's support to education, or how that tradition relates (in the case of the bilaterals) to the character of basic education in the donor country itself. However, because the individual donor traditions of support to education are crucially important to the project, this fuller treatment will be carried out for SIDA, one of the many donors involved with Tanzanian education.

2. Interviews with country desk and sector desk on education policy, within the broader sweep of agency policy towards Tanzania. These interviews (or ideally a single meeting with both geographical and sector specialist) are designed to build on the documentary analysis. They are intended to tease out some of the connections between agency policy and practice on the one hand and the perceived priorities of Tanzania towards education on the other. In addition, they afford an opportunity to discuss the most recent (post-Jomtien) developments, which may well not have yet reached a documentary stage.

3. **Preliminary analysis of agency baseline data.** An important part of the project is to determine how agencies are defining basic **education, and how, within their own** definitions, they are allocating funds to this sub-sector (both to governments and to NGOs). Agencies will be asked for data on the changing proportions of the education budgets attached to basic education, and where this is not readily available to make provisional estimates. Given DAC's concern to disaggregate DAC members' support to the education sector, this analysis at the level of a single country may be helpful.

4. **Fieldwork in Tanzania.** There are two discrete elements of the fieldwork. First, there will be a discussion with the development co-operation offices in Dar-es-Salaam of the interaction between agency policy and government priorities in education. This is not to say that donor policy is different in the headquarters and in the field, but rather that the local development cooperation office is much closer to the realities of project implementation, and is very conscious

of the constraints facing government support to education. The second fieldwork component is to review the national tradition of support to basic education, and within that, to examine the major shifts and changes of the last twenty years.

In parallel to the study of the agency's education tradition, this fieldwork should be concerned with the relevant policy literature, as well as with the Tanzanian assumptions about the role of the state and of voluntary bodies in providing education. Equally, it will examine to what extent, if any, the Jomtien initiative has been accommodated within local policy development. It will also seek to analyse the changing proportions of the education budget allocated to basic education, and the quality of the statistical base for examining participation in basic education. This will be set against the data obtained from the local development co-operation offices and from the UNDP on the extent of external support to basic education.

5. Maintaining a **collaborative approach** to both the Northern and Southern components of the research. It is important both theoretically and in terms of the formative emphasis of the project that a Tanzanian researcher or planner participate in some of the agency analysis in the North, and that same researcher should co-operate in the fieldwork components in Tanzania. At the same time a NORRAG researcher should be associated with the Tanzanian fieldwork, while also being involved, along with other NORRAG researchers in the analysis of the agencies.

The series of short agency studies will be carried out by a university-based NORRAG researcher working in conjunction with a NORRAG contact point within the particular agency.

6. Review seminar on methodology and conceptualization. A seminar will be held in Stockholm to draw together the series of short agency reports on basic education in relation to Tanzania with the fieldwork reports from Tanzania. The first portion of this seminar will be attended by the researchers, while in the second part, the results of the pilot will be presented to the participating donors, along with an outline set of implications for the fuller study.

7. **Proposal finalisation.** A draft of the full proposal for the larger study will be completed. The agencies interested in participating and in contributing to the financing of the study will be asked for comments during month 8. These will be built into the final version of the proposal. In parallel, the countries in which the studies will be extended will also be confirmed. A full version of the proposal will be ready by the end of month 10. Work on the implementation will commence in month 12.

VI. Co-ordination and sequencing of pilot phase

The co-ordination of the pilot phase of the research proposal will be provided by the Institute of International Education (HE) in Stockholm.

In this pilot phase, the HE and its director, Ingemar Fagerlind, will be responsible for the execution of the Tanzanian fieldwork, the development of the agency study on SIDA, and the 'thinkpiece' on how the bilateral agency acts as the bridge between two conceptions of the role of the state (in Sweden and in Tanzania). The research team will include two Tanzanian researchers and two members recruited. Based on a successful completion of the pilot phase, the second phase of the project may require a different co-ordination. To an extent this will depend on countries and agencies to be studied, and on the diversification of project funding.

The following sequence is suggested for the different components of the pilot phase.

Month 1-3: Documentary analysis and interviews to be conducted with 5 donors. This will include **NORAD, SIDA, and Swiss** Co-operation, as well as the World Bank and IIEP. Documentary material only will be collected on a small number of further donors, DANIDA, ODA, Italian Cooperation, and GTZ. One of the Tanzanian research team members will play a full part in the analysis of SIDA and NORAD.

Month 6: For one of the participating agencies (SIDA), a thinkpiece will be carried out by HE on the relationship between agency policy and the role of the state in Sweden. SIDA's policies particularly in the sphere of basic education will thus be connected historically with the traditions of **state support to education**. A basis will thus be developed for the relationships between the **Swedish state (via SIDA) and Tanzania**, and for the assumptions about the critical role of adult and primary education in Tanzania. This study will be effected by Ingemar Fagerlind.

Month 7: A meeting to review the findings of the donor studies, and the Tanzanian fieldwork will be held in Stockholm. In the first two days, the focus will be upon the lessons from the donor studies and from the Tanzania fieldwork. Following the collaborative design of the research, Tanzanian researchers will participate thus allowing insights from work with the development cooperation field offices to be viewed within the broader context of policies in the head offices of the agencies. In addition to analysing critically the working assumptions, methods, and conceptualisation of the research, the seminar will provide an opportunity to the participating donors to comment on the emerging patterns of bilateral and multilateral support for basic education.

Month 8: A preliminary draft of the full proposal will be submitted to agencies expecting to participate in the first complete phase of the research.

VII. Outcomes from the planning and pilot phase

The principal outcome of pilot phase will be a full-length report on 'Aid to basic education in Tanzania'. This will for the first time offer an account of the interaction between a whole range of very different agency policies in support of basic education and the basic education policies of a sovereign state. It will distinguish between the field office and headquarters in their interpretations of agency policies. It will provide both for the agencies and for Tanzania some estimate of the proportions of their education budgets going to basic education, and the extent to which, in the case of the donors, a significant proportion of this is channelled through the NGOs. For agencies and for Tanzania alike, there **will** a particular focus also on the impact of Jomtien. This summary report will synthesise the agency studies, the thinkpiece on the state and basic education, and the Tanzania fieldwork.

During the planning phase, there will be at least one executive briefing, specifically on agency-related Jomtien follow-up actions. This will be issued as a form of feedback to the participating agencies.

From the agency studies, it will be possible to provide a full bibliographical profile of agency literature related to education in Tanzania.

The final output of the planning phase will be a full-fledged research proposal discussed with the agencies most concerned. The proposal should indicate a commitment to a form of decentralised funding, with each of the major participating agencies funding their own part of the first year's research.

VIII. Full implementation phase: 21 months

The implementation phase will be executed in up to five countries, and a similar number of donor agencies, bilateral and multilateral.

A cardinal principle in this phase will be the full diversification of project funding from different participating donors. There are already some strong indications of bilateral interest in supporting the major phase of the research.

The final country selection will reflect, to **an extent, the range of donor participation** in different programme countries, but will also take **account of Southern RRAG follow-up to Jomtien**. It is possible that one of the 'prototype' (model) countries receiving support from multilateral and bilateral sources in the official follow-up to Jomtien will be selected for study. Discussions on this are already underway.

NORRAG Research Planning Group;

W. Biervliet (The Netherlands), Michel Carton (Switzerland), Ingemar Fagerlind (Sweden), Kenneth King (Scotland)

SEARRAG Research Project

Status: submitted to IDRC

Background

1. Basic education is a concern in all ASEAN countries, with varying degrees and emphasis. Generally, universal primary education is implemented in all six countries - Brunei Darussalam, Indonesia, Malaysia, Philippines, Singapore and Thailand. Pre-school education is widely implemented in Singapore and Thailand; in Malaysia, the proposed revision of the national Education Act *will* incorporate pre-school into the formal programme of the Ministry of Education. Girls education is well implemented in all the countries, in particular the Philippines, Indonesia, Malaysia and Thailand.

2. In the last two decades, numerous educational projects have been developed and implemented, in particular in the curriculum area. All six countries have implemented major curriculum at both primary and secondary levels of education. These have been accompanied by other development projects, including textbook programmes e.g. in the Philippines and Singapore, decentralization of educational administration e.g. in Malaysia, and provision of support services and materials for teachers, e.g. Cianjur Project in Indonesia.

3. Many educational projects have been conducted in these three major areas: primary education, pre-school education, and girls' education, and were done in different ministries and departments, with funding from varying sources, however, remain undocumented and therefore not available for utilization in policy decisions and programme development. The nineties is a period for consolidation, to take stock of development thus far, so that available information could be best utilized, and a comprehensive plan could be developed to prepare for the twentyfirst century.

SEARRAG Projects

4. During the period 1985 through 1991, SEARRAG would have conducted state-of-the-art or state-of-the-practice reviews on the following areas:

- (1) Teacher Education
- (2) School Management
- (3) Learning Outcomes
- (4) Mathematics and Science Education
- (5) Values Education
- (6) Efforts to Improve Achievement Levels at Primary Level
- (7) Language Education
- (8) Technical and Vocational Education

At the same time, the Southeast Asian Bibliography and Abstracting Service is established, strengthened and expanded, in the first instance to make available to all policy makers, researchers and practitioners in the region up-to-date information and documents on research and projects conducted on various topics on the region. (See: News from SEARRAG)

5. At this juncture, state-of-the-art reviews are considered vital for quality improvement of education in the ASEAN region, so that available projects are collected and reviewed, and policymakers and practitioners know what is going on with regards to specific areas, in their own country and in the region. With this body of information available, policy-makers will be better informed, and so will be better prepared to plan for development and implementation of educational policies.

7. The following are areas of interest identified at the 8th SEARRAG Annual Meeting:

- (1) Illiteracy campaign, and effectiveness of campaigns;
- (2) Expanding educational opportunities to children in age group 6-12 years;

- (3) Provision of pre-school education to children in age group 2-6 years old via kindergarten, day care centres, and play groups;
- (4) Provision of continuing/life-long education (including parents' and women's education);
- (5) Skills' development for primary school children;
- (6) Evaluation, re relationship between assessment and curriculum; and
- (7) Modes and strategies of in-service teacher education for greater teacher effectiveness.

8. On 28 July, the list was narrowed to four areas:

- (1) Primary Education with focus on access to quality education and compensatory education;
- (2) Pre-school programme, with focus on parent education and women's education, include day care centres, play school, play group, nursery schools and kindergarten;
- (3) Literacy (3Rs and Basic Knowledge), to cover the following dimensions: functional literacy, literacy programmes, post-literacy programmes, literacy retention, literacy campaign;
- (4) Environmental Education.

9. It is proposed that topics (1), (2) and (3) be considered priority areas for review, and that each topic be reviewed at the country level, with an accompanying regional synthesis each. All completed set of reviews *will* be discussed at a regional meeting with the participation of educational policy-makers, researchers and practitioners, this meeting to coincide with a SEARRAG Annual Meeting, so that the presentation and discussion could cover a wider audience.

10. Similar reviews could be conducted on other developing countries in REDUC and ERNESA regions, so that these valuable experiences and information could be profitably shared among policy-makers, practitioners and researchers. If other regions conduct reviews on similar topics, then it is proposed that presentation and discussion of reports and synthesis could be open to representatives from other regions too.

Arfah A. Aziz and Zainal Ghani

DICE and CESO

A. The Conference

DICE (Department for International and Comparative Education), London and CESO (Centre for the Study of Education in Developing Countries), The Hague are preparing an international conference on "Education for All: New Partnerships in Primary Education". The conference is planned to take place in London (Institute of Education), 7 - 9 May 1991. The focus *will* be on a small number of projects in Africa and Asia concerned with the improvement of quality in primary education and following innovative approaches that predate the 'new vision' promulgated at the World Conference in Jomtien.

The conference aims to enable key personnel of such projects together with professional colleagues to reflect on the implementation of their programme in the context of specific needs and aims, national policies and priorities and international declarations on Education for All. Furthermore it hopes to review issues related to programme design, resourcing and sustainability; and finally to develop initiatives for continued effective interaction and collaboration between practitioners, researchers and policy-makers involved in primary education projects.

The conference *will* have plenary presentations and discussions, as well as working groups on four themes, which are: (1) strategies to promote quality in learning, (2) programme design, implementation and management; (3) resource allocation and mobilisation; (4) access and equity.

Professional workers and students with a specific interest in approaches and strategies for primary education improvement are invited to participate. Information: Angela Little and Roy Gardner, DICE, and Wim Hoppers, The Hague.

B. The Research

DICE and CESO are also preparing a research project on quality improvement in primary education synthesizing the experiences of a few key innovative programmes in this field. This project will be developed as a collaborative activity with research institutions in the countries concerned. It is likely to become an in-depth study of diverging strategies for quality improvement, allocating different roles and responsibilities to the state support structure for education, to teachers, and to 'new partners' in the education enterprise such as NGOs and communities. The emphasis in the research may be on the actual process of strategy development, its implementation within a wider socio-economic, cultural and administrative contexts, and its influence on the process of teaching and learning. The aim of the project will be to trace the evolution of diverging strategies within the local context, to assess their relative value in improving classroom learning, and to identify critical factors influencing planning, implementation and achievement.

The project will be co-ordinated by Angela Little, DICE, and Wim Hoppers, CESO. Possible forms of Co-operation with the IIEP project on "Collaborating for Educational Change" are being discussed.

CESO

The first phase of the programme study related to research in the field of education and development has just been completed.

The overall objective of the study is to match identified needs for educational research concentrating on the themes 'education, labour market and employment' and 'education and culture' in a few developing countries (demand side) with the capacity of Dutch institutions (supply side) capable of implementing research with institutions in these countries. In a second phase the study is to concentrate on a further elaboration of research needs in Indonesia, Central America and one country in Southern Africa on aspects such as:

- 1) Effects of Basic Education (schools and Literacy programmes)
- 2) Basic education for rural employment and living
- 3) Link between participation of women in formal/non-formal TVET and formal/informal sector employment.
- 4) Research related to science and technology education.

It is envisaged to contract the research need inventory out to educational researchers in the countries concerned.

The results of the need inventories to be fed back in a seminar to educational researchers and policy-makers as a basis for defining critical research requirements.

A detailed inventory of educational research expertise in the Netherlands has been made from which suitable candidates for collaborative research may be selected.

Useful reference:

Inventory of Dutch capacity: the environment for educational research on developing countries in the Netherlands 1985-1989/comp. by W.E. Biervliet, SWIDOC/CESO, Amsterdam, 1990.

FRANCE

Basic education and youth integration in rural areas of french speaking Africa

The French Co-operation Ministry has just launched a review study of out of school basic education and training programmes for rural youth in different french speaking African countries. As rural development is again considered as a key element for the success of structural adjustment programmes, an in-depth analysis of different types of basic education and training activities aiming at skill acquisition *will* allow to define the conditions under which they could be generalized at national level.

The study *will* be based on field missions in specific rural areas of five countries where a whole range of rural and training activities and projects can be found. The missions *will* be carried out by independent experts both from France and African countries.

Contact person: Mr. L. Cousin
Bureau des formations rurales
Ministère de la Coopération

IDS

Educating all the Children: the Economic Challenge for the 1990s

Christopher Colclough and Keith Lewin are working on a final phase of the above project, the first phase of which was reported in a conference paper presented at Jomtien in March 1990. The analysis demonstrates that many countries are now further from the goal of providing a primary school place for each eligible child than they were a decade or more ago. It demonstrates how this trend can be reversed and identifies the conditions necessary for achieving primary schooling for all by the end of the century. The main policy instruments available to expand access in the context of fiscal restraint area assessed, drawing lessons from country case studies of promising reforms, and from the wider research literature. Initially, global estimates of the total costs of achieving EFA by the year 2000 were prepared, together with indications of the extent to which developing countries might be able to meet these costs themselves, and the extent to which resources would be needed from abroad. The second stage of this work is refining this analysis with the addition of further country case study material and with the disaggregation of the modelling exercise to the individual country level. Lessons *will* be drawn for aid policies, for educational policy reform in developing countries and for future educational research. The project is being supported by UNICEF and will be available in book form towards the end of 1991.

Christopher Colclough

IIEP

The most advanced follow-up activity at the International Institute of Educational Planning in Paris is an interregional research project on the improvement of basic education services. Through the implementation of four case studies, the project expects to provide guidance for the formulation of national strategies for improving the quality of basic education, contribute to the improvement of existing information systems in order to ensure an efficient monitoring of basic education services, and strengthen the planning and management capacity at various levels of education administration.

The **basic methodological assumption behind the research design is that the real** problem involved in the functioning of educational institutions can be best understood when these institutions are analysed within their local setting. For this reason, a micro-approach is being used which starts from a careful analysis of the environment in which the educational institutions operate so that differences in results and in interactions between variables can be interpreted on the basis of their meaning within a particular socio-economic context.

The project is being undertaken in four countries: China, Guinea, India, and Mexico. In each of the countries, localities with contrasting development characteristics, ranging from a developed urban zone to a very underprivileged rural area, have been selected for an in-depth analysis of

the functioning of primary schools, the results produced in terms of the acquisition of basic literacy and numeracy skills by the learners, and the major factors which explain drop-outs and more generally the global family demand for education. National seminars are being organised to review the results in each of the four countries.

Co-ordinators of this project are Ta Ngoc Chau and Gabriel Carron. Other IIEP research and training activities relating to the World Conference are currently being organised.

SHORT RESEARCH OUTLINES

DSE

- The preparations for the African Workshop on Primary School Agriculture in Harare (see meeting section) has resulted in a state-of-the-art report, which will be available by the end of this year.

DSE is also reviewing its six-weeks curriculum development course for educationalists from Anglophone Africa after four years of running this course. The results are expected in 1991.

Dr. Udo Bude.

Useful References

- DSE prepares a new publication "Culture and Environment in African Primary Schools."

IDRC

The following research projects related to basic education have been recently approved or are currently under consideration for support by the Population, Education and Society Programme of IDRC:

Project:	<i>Indicators of Quality of Education</i>
Recipient	Oficina Regional de Educacion para América Latina y el Caribe (OREALC Unesco)
Status:	Funded
Region:	Latin America (Argentina, Brazil, Colombia, Ecuador, Venezuela)
Description:	Deterioration in educational quality is an outcome of the general
development	crisis in Latin America. Increasing drop-out and repetition rates and lowered levels of achievement are a direct consequence of the impoverishment of educational quality. Low salaries, the depletion of educational materials, fewer services in rural areas, and the inability of curricula to meet local needs are all contributing factors. To correct these problems, governments and regional organizations need reliable information for planning and
policy	purposes. This project will develop a system to assess educational quality at the primary level which could be used to identify alternatives to monitor educational quality and to improve information bases for educational planning.
Project:	<i>Process and Product in Science and Technology Learning in Kenyan</i>
Schools	
Recipient	DECT. Kenyatta University
Status:	Funded
Region:	Kenya
Description:	Research has indicated that basic schooling has a direct effect on attitudes and behaviours related to economic productivity and health among other
key	areas of human activity. There is little evidence, however, to clarify what aspects of schooling produce the discerned outcomes. This project will attempt to go beyond the question of whether schools make a difference to

one concerning how they make a difference. The aim is to investigate the teaching and learning processes of various aspects of science and technology through the school curriculum, and how this relates to skills, knowledge and behaviours expected later at the workplace.

- Project: *Culture and Education among Quechuan Populations*
 Recipient: Corporacion Educativa MACAC
 Status: Funded
 Region: Ecuador
 Description: Indigenous people are among the most marginalized and least understood social sectors in Latin America. While some progress has been made to make basic education more culturally and socially relevant to the needs of these groups, there remain gaps which hamper the development of education programmes dependent upon inter-cultural exchanges. This project will study the understanding which Quechuan communities hold with respect to the cultural, economic and familial roles of women and the organization of the community in Ecuador. The findings of the study will be used to improve existing education programmes.
- Project: *Basic Education for All Follow-up*
 Recipient: Various - IDRC administered
 Region: Global (East Africa, Asia, Latin America)
 Description: The design and implementation of national and local strategies to meet the EFA challenges in the 1990s will add to the heavy burden developing countries already face in responding to the growing demands for better basic education at a time of limited resources. However, few attempts have been made to understand the concrete economic, political and educational implications of the EFA movement launched at Jomtien. This project *will* fund a series of activities in Asia, Africa and Latin America aimed at studying and better understanding the risks, implications and potential benefits of closely pursuing the EFA principles.

The following projects are under review:

- Project: *A No Drop-out Learning System for Education for All. NODROPS-EFA*
 Proponent: INNOTECH-SEAMEO
 Region: The Philippines - SEAMEO countries
- Project: *Making the First Three Years of Primary Schools Count*
 Proponent: Unit for research on Basic Education (UPPA - USM)
 Region: Malaysia
- Project: *Evaluative Research in Adult Basic Education*
 Proponent: Centro de Educacion y Promocion Popular (CEPP)
 Region: Ecuador

Useful References

- IDRC *Project Profiles 2. Education, Work and Employment*
 IDRC, Canada: Manuscript Report (253e), April, 1990.
- Sanchez-Parga, José *Bibliografía sobre Educacion Indigena-Campesina en America Latina.*
 IDRC, Canada: Manuscript Report (268e), August, 1990.
 Centro Andino de Accion Popular (CAAP), Quito, Ecuador.
- Shaeffer, Sheldon *Educational Change in Indonesia. A Case Study of Three Innovations.*
 IDRC, Canada: Manuscript Report (270e). October, 1990.

The following documents related to basic education are currently under review for publication by IDRC in its *Manuscript Report* series:

Papers commissioned by IDRC for the WCEFA:

Annis, Sheldon

"Towards a Pro-poor Information Agenda at the World Bank"

Torres, Carlos

"Comments on the Education for All Initiative"

Note: In NN 8 reference has already been made to other IDRC commissioned papers for WCEFA.

Daniel Morales-Gomez, Associate Director, Social Sciences Division.

Institute of International Education (HE) Stockholm University, Sweden

Title: *African post-literacy strategies in comparative perspective*
 Status: Funded (SAREC)
 Country: Botswana, Ethiopia, Kenya, Mozambique, Tanzania and Zimbabwe
 Project Leader: Vinayagum Chinapah in association with Anthony Johnston and Christine McNab

The present project aims to analyze adult post-literacy experiences in Eastern and Southern Africa. A comparative perspective is used to derive general conclusions and guidelines, enabling governments and organizations in Africa to evaluate alternative post-literacy strategies in the context of their reality, and thus plan suitable programmes. Four among these six countries in the region will be selected for indepth field studies using both quantitative and qualitative research methods.

Title: *Educational Integration for Children with Handicaps in the Developing Countries: A Four-Country Study.*
 Status: Funded (SAREC)
 Country: Bangladesh, Guinea-Bissau, Nicaragua and Tanzania
 Project Leader: Vinayagum Chinapah, Gary Miron and Geoffrey Nambira

The overall purpose of this project is to provide an assessment of the educational issues, practices, trends and needs of children with handicaps in four developing countries, namely, Bangladesh, Guinea-bissau, Nicaragua, and Tanzania.

More specifically, the aims of the project are: (a) to understand the disposition and status of educational integration in the context of the four countries; and (b) to provide strong and well grounded recommendations concerning the effective educational provision for children with handicaps in these countries. **In seeking to better understand and** develop the notion of educational integration for disabled children, the project focuses on an in-depth analysis of policies, institutional arrangements, educational interventions, programmes and practices designed to serve with handicaps in these countries.

Title: *Women's Career Patterns and Education in Zimbabwe*
 Status: Funded (SAREC)
 Country: Zimbabwe
 Project Leader: Annika Thein

The overall aim of this project is to get a better understanding of how women utilize their access to education after Independence in Zimbabwe and how the society use educated women. The study focuses on a follow-up of a group of female students to investigate the following: (a) How women make their educational and vocational choices; (b) How women form their career and family **patterns; and (c) How** women's career strategies and models are related to general educational policy of the country. Data will be analyzed as to different kinds of rationality in

educational planning and career strategies according to theoretical frame of reference of limited vocational v/s care-taking rationality.

Title: *Exploring the Concept of Successful Programmes in Education with Production*
 Status: Partly Funded (Swedish International Development Authority - SIDA)
 Country: Tanzania
 Project Leader: Elizei B. Temu

The present study attempts to explore the concept of successful programmes in education with production in Tanzania. It intends to identify critical factors which influence the performance of schools academically and in productive activities. Attempts *will* be made to examine why some schools in Tanzania perform better than others in these programmes. Self-administered questionnaires, interviews, documentary studies and participant observations *will* be used to ascertain the factors contributing to success in programmes for education with production in the country.

For further information..

Dr. Vinayagum Chinapah
 Deputy Director
 Institute of International Education (IIE)
 Stockholm University
 S 106 91 Stockholm, SWEDEN
 Tel.: 46-8-16 20 63
 Fax : 46-8-15 31 33

NORAD

A study called "How schools succeed? - Management and change in education" is sponsored together with the World Bank. Countries: Colombia, Bangladesh and Ethiopia on aspects of successful primary school development. Local research institutes have carried out the research which is now going to be compared. It will be published early 1991.

- Zambia. A 1 mill NOK package for research support is presently negotiated with the University of Zambia **to local researchers**. The following research plans are of relevance:

Center for Continuing Education, Adult Education:

- "Participants' perception of non-formal education programmes." - "Investigation into women's participation in adult literacy programmes."

School of Education:

- "Integration of out-school youth in a rural economy. A study of the participation of school-leavers in rice-growing in Nalikwanda, Mongu districts."

Department of Educational Administration and Policy Studies:

- School type, staffing and pupil achievement in maths."

Education Research Bureau:

- "Science and technology relationship with self-reliance of **Grade-9 school-leavers** in Zambia." - "Academic Achievement, self-concept and gender in early primary school."

Latin America:

Central America."

In Nicaragua NORAD has supported a 14 mill NOK text-book production programme.

Tove Nagel,
Institute for Educational Research,
University of Oslo,
Norway

RRAG IN ACTION

NORRAG

SEARRAG

RRAG IN ACTION

Introduction

This section describes actions to structure and foster processes of information exchange and partnership between persons and groups in the North and the South, both policy-makers and researchers committed to contribute to efforts to improve the quality of education.

Feedback is provided to our constituency in the North and colleague networks in the South on a NORRAG meeting organized on the fringe of the ICE Conference in Geneva; on our intentions to reflect on NORRAG's achievements and constraints in the past and to prepare proposals for a sustained and feasible NORRAG programme and coordination in the forthcoming years. In our plans for the future, decentralization, sharing of costs and responsibilities and a strong emphasis on Northern support to strengthening the educational research infrastructure in the South have top priority. The decentralization of NORRAG through a more effective functioning of country clusters consisting of researchers and agency personnel was already assessed in the pre-Jomtien consultations on drafts of the Declaration and Framework for Action. Yet, it proves to be more easy for NORRAG to reach agency staff than university researchers, given constraints for researchers to attend NORRAG piggyback meetings. In order to maintain the essential link within NORRAG between researchers and policy-makers and thus enhance a proper utilization of research results for policy-making, some support to national clusters to be provided by national agencies might be taken into serious consideration. The section includes a report on the national cluster in the United Kingdom in status nascendi.

Through information exchanges in the framework of NORRAG NEWS and several piggyback meetings, NORRAG has assisted in establishing a foundation for joint projects and partnerships across national boundaries. One such partnership consists of a planned ERASMUS programme aiming to provide students in four European countries insight into European co-operation on education in the developing world.

NORRAG was once defined as 'the eyes and ears of the South in the North', which provides NORRAG NEWS with a responsibility for both content relevance related to information requirements in the South and of adequate dissemination in the South.

Yet, there is a growing reciprocity and interdependence between NORRAG and the Southern RRAG's. Hence, the requirement to inform our Northern constituency about developments in the Southern RRAG's. Both SEARRAG and REDUC have established data-bases which provide a good indication of the growing region-specific body of knowledge related to education. In this issue, we focus on SEARRAG and its data-base SEABAS but in forthcoming issues we **will** highlight REDUC and ERNESA and activities within national educational research associations in East and Southern Africa. We also hope to inform you about the Education Research Network of Western and Central Africa (ERNWACA) which planned to focus on efficiency of basic education and quality improvement in a situation of limited funding.

wb

NORRAG MEETING GENEVA, 4-8 SEPTEMBER 1990

1. Agenda

The meeting gave attention to the following issues:

- i. Detailed consideration of 4 RRAG proposals for research or review activities related to Jomtien follow-up;
- ii. Reaction by donor agency representatives to RRAG proposals, during special half -day session;

v. Changing role of NORRAG.

2. Participation

From NORRAG: Kenneth King (co-ordinator) Edinburgh, Wim Biervliet (co-ordinator), The Hague; Michel Carton (host institution, WED), Geneva; Tove Nagel (Univ. of Oslo); Wim Hoppers (CESO), The Hague; Ingemar Fagerlind (Univ. of Stockholm); Nadia Ebel (ILO), Geneva.

From other RRAG groups: Arfah Aziz (co-ordinator, SEARRAG), Kuala Lumpur; Oscar Corvalan (CIDE, representing Patricio Cariola, co-ordinator, REDUC).

Until the last moment it was hoped that Donatus Kornba, co-ordinator of ERNESA, could join the meeting. This proved impossible, but he sent a research outline that was discussed.

Others attending ICE, but participating in one or more NORRAG sessions:

Frank Youngman (Univ. of Botswana); Dan Wagner (Univ. of Pennsylvania); Leo Dubbeldam (CESO), The Hague; Tuija Stenback (FINNIDA), Helsinki; Jeremy Greenland (Aga Khan Foundation), Geneva; Jean-Robert Moret (DDA), Berne; Joe Farrell (OISE), Toronto; Anneli Vanapassi (Univ. of Jyväskylä), Finland; Lavinia Gasperini (Devt. Co-operation, Foreign Affairs), Rome; Gabriel Carron (IIEP), Paris; Jakes Swartland (Commonwealth Secretariat), London.

In a warm welcome, Jacques Forster, Director of the University Institute of Development Studies (IEUD), Geneva, commented on the appropriateness of educational networks like NORRAG considering linkages with the EADI network - the European Association of Development Institutes. Currently there was little or no educational perspective within EADI, but it might be worth NORRAG looking into this, and especially during the time that WED was providing the secretariat for EADI.

3. RRAG proposals related to Jomtien follow-up:

a) NORRAG proposal on 'Education for all'.

A copy of the research proposal is incorporated in the section Research Follow-up to WCEFA. Many of the issues discussed related to the improvement of an earlier draft of the proposal were taken into consideration when drafting the final version.

Justification, research product, and potential audiences

There was a lot of interest in examining rationales for NORRAG initiating some research in this area. It was partly seen as a continuation of its role as analyst of agency actions, and particularly those likely to have a major impact on the South. It was partly also a response to a number of people, including several agency personnel, who had felt there was an important role for NORRAG in some relatively detached commentary upon the agency follow-up to Jomtien. NORRAG's own view of the research was that it should certainly be broader and deeper than analysing the impact of Jomtien. This particular episode needed to be located within a much longer set of changes in attitudes towards basic education. Equally, since NORRAG saw itself partly as an advisory body, there was an interest in considering what instruments or pointers to good practice could emerge from the research. Such pointers could perhaps be of particular use to the local offices of the agencies in developing countries.

There were some tight ropes that NORRAG would walk if it did this research well:

NORRAG wanted to look objectively at the whole Jomtien follow-up activity, and yet it wanted to play a formative/advisory role in terms of briefings and feedback to participating agencies.

NORRAG wanted to look at the autonomy and identity of the bilateral approaches to basic education, but in a context in which the larger multilateral initiatives were also studied.

NORRAG would ideally want to do this work collaboratively with individuals or institutions in

the South, but this would mean early involvement of Southern RRAG (or other researchers) in the design process. Some concern was expressed about the impact of Jomtien follow-up on scarce educational research capacity in parts of the South, and upon the South's implementation of its own broader research agenda. This might also affect the feasibility of NORRAG type North-South collaborative research related to Jomtien follow-up.

b. *SEARRAG proposal*

The SEARRAG proposal reflected a set of agreements already reached in the region about priority reviews. SEARRAG wanted to emphasise the importance to policy makers and practitioners in the region of knowing 'what is going on' in particular areas. Its mandate to do state of the art reviews (or state of practice reviews) prevented it undertaking regular research, but SEARRAG could on occasion play a facilitating role in passing research ideas to affiliate members of SEARRAG. Any such research collaboration would not be SEARRAG's own responsibility however.

The suggestions for reviews on primary education, preschool programmes and on literacy were brought to the NORRAG meeting as the priority programme coming from SEARRAG meetings earlier this year. Other reviews relevant to Jomtien had already been initiated, including work on improving achievement levels in primary education, learning outcomes, and on maths and science education. The time-line for initiating and completing the new set of reviews was very strict, since ideally the completed reviews should be available at the next SEARRAG meeting - early in 1991.

SEARRAG was particularly interested in exploring the possibility of reviews being done in other RRAG regions in similar fields. It would then be possible to reach a more global insight into good practice. This was certainly felt by REDUC to be possible for some of the identified areas, since regional reviews had already been completed e.g. of effective primary education. Equally in the North. As to Africa, both SEARRAG and REDUC wondered if there were mechanisms for South-South co-operation, whereby reviews in Africa could be funded in conjunction with a link to SEARRAG or REDUC.

The SEARRAG Bulletin (vol. 2. no.1) was circulated at the meeting, and was thought to be a valuable instrument for maintaining contact, and for identifying completed and ongoing SEARRAG projects. (See Section on News from SEARRAG)

c. *ERNESA draft outline proposal*

ERNESA's documentation for the NORRAG meeting was very rich in terms of covering the large number of follow-up ideas that had been generated in the region. However, the communication problem had prevented any preliminary discussion about particular priorities in Eastern and Southern Africa. It would be some time therefore before it would be known if there were likely to be any complementarities with SEARRAG's or NORRAG's agendas, and before a plan of action for ERNESA could be evolved. It would clearly be useful for the other regional RRAGs to send to ERNESA their revised, and more detailed proposals. In the case of NORRAG this would mean mentioning in which ERNESA countries its own research on agency policies might be pursued. This had not in fact been finalised, and would not be till the end of the planning phase, but certainly both Tanzania and Zambia had been identified in a preliminary way, as had Namibia. As the NORRAG proposal developed, it would clearly be important to maintain contact with ERNESA's regional and national co-ordinators. Similarly, with the development of ERNESA's thinking after its next regional meeting.

It would be important for other regional RRAGs to know the timing of this next ERNESA meeting well in advance, since they could send to it the revised and more detailed outlines of their proposals.

d. *REDUC proposal*

The REDUC proposal was presented both for its own sake, and as a means of commenting on the NORRAG proposal. It had to be remembered that in Latin America, UNESCO's 'Major Project'

was conceived as setting some of the context for follow-up activities. However, it was hoped that some 12 countries would be involved in the specific REDUC proposal for information exchange, dissemination, and reflection on Jomtien follow-up. It was very important to follow and analyse what was happening in the largest countries in the region - Mexico and Brazil - and not just look at a few of the smaller states.

This same point could be applied to the NORRAG proposal. If for example it only worked in those countries where there were several bilateral aid agencies supporting basic education, the actual countries would be very restricted. Instead NORRAG might for Latin America consider selecting a country or countries where there were NGOs working with funds provided by bilaterals.

Specific suggestions were made about particular countries, and whether they should or should not be considered. A tentative scheme was laid out which distinguished what might be termed 'NGO countries', where bilaterals worked through NGOs; bilateral countries; and finally those where the multilaterals were most in evidence.

4. Donor agency reactions to RRAG proposals

At this session, it was possible to table reactions which had been accumulated from NORRAG contacts in agencies both prior to and during the meeting. The following comments are derived from both sources:

- i. NORRAG had some particular advantage in undertaking 'hands-off review and analysis'. It should ensure that it does maintain a different perspective on the whole follow-up exercise, and distinguish its effort from the various monitoring plans of the Bank, UNICEF, UNESCO etc.
- ii. Several agencies were considering carefully major shifts in their policies towards basic education. In such situations, it would be valuable to have insights from NORRAG's comparative perspective.
- iii. One of the key outcomes from Jomtien must be change at the school level. To what extent would the NORRAG proposal be able to identify good practice in forms of aid that actually impacted on schools, and resulted in change?
- iv. It would be artificial for NORRAG to concentrate only on the donor roles in basic education, and encourage Southern researchers to work on the policy development side in developing countries. The key issue was the interaction between donors and national governments in basic education.
- v. It was important to think through the possible outcomes from this research which would be useful to donors, as well as to examine the potential of the proposal for giving Southern researchers valuable insights into donornational agency interaction. In other words, it would be good to consider the several different audiences and consumers for the research.

5. Work on NORRAG network. new co-ordination issues etc.

The meeting was also invaluable for raising both in formal and informal sessions a series of questions about the changing role of NORRAG. These questions pertain to the special identity of **NORRAG as a network** separate from other organizations involved in research and practice in education, the types of activity that derive from such a position, the scope of NORRAG in terms of its membership and its modalities of interaction. It was also agreed that an occasion should be taken to review the organizational structures of NORRAG and its relations *with* parallel networks in both North and South. Many of these issues were potentially also *worth* discussion by the other RRAGs. As NORRAG changed its co-ordination arrangements, and rethought its dissemination strategy, it would be useful to discuss these with the network.

6. Further planning of NORRAG activities

- i. A draft of a plan for a transitional phase *will* have to be produced to cover the period October 1990 through February 1991. This will be submitted to SIDA. The plan covers one issue of NORRAG NEWS, an editorial meeting and activities to prepare a new plan of NORRAG operations in a next phase as from March 1991. (See: next section NORRAG transition phase proposal).
- ii. It was also agreed that during this period a review of the NORRAG mandate would be timely. The outcome of such a review would be circulated by the co-ordinators, including detail on NORRAG philosophy, evaluation of the last four years, dissemination, activities, and methods of operation. This revised mandate would be discussed at a next NORRAG piggy back meeting.

Kenneth King and Wim Biervliet

NORRAG TRANSITION PHASE: **OCTOBER 1st, 1990-FEBRUARY 28,1991.**

In line with broader discussions concerning new developments in NORRAG and in view of the completion of the first phase of NORRAG activities supported by SIDA, a need was perceived for consolidation and review to be elaborated upon in transitional phase.

A proposal was drafted for such a transitional phase and approved by SIDA (NORRAG coordination activities from Edinburgh, some travel including participation of co-ordinators of Southern RRAG's in a piggyback meeting) and by CESO (involvement of CESO staff in coordination and covering costs of presenting and dissemination of NORRAG NEWS).

1. Objectives of the transition phase:

Overall objective To review the current position and functions of NORRAG and prepare for a second phase of its operations.

Specific objectives

- (1) to develop in close consultations with NORRAGs constituencies a consensus about a new mandate for NORRAG;
- (2) to design a work programme for the next phase (March 1991 - Dec 1992) on the basis of this mandate;
- (3) to develop a mechanism for sharing responsibilities and resource requirements within the network while maintaining effective coordination;
- (4) to work out meaningful and effective mechanisms for interaction and collaboration with researchers in the South;
- (5) to develop proposals for closer interlinkages with other networks such as EPTA;
- (6) to produce one more issue of the NORRAG Newsletter;
- (7) to work out a budget for support to various NORRAG operations during the second phase,
- (8) to negotiate with different donor agencies for support to NORRAG activities.

2. Activities and responsibilities

A. Production of November Issue of NORRAG News

B. Review of NORRAG mandate

- a) Compiling a report on the first phase of NORRAG, assessing achievements and constraints in view of objectives incorporated in the original mandate.
The report *will* also outline modalities for new project activities, diversity of NORRAG functions, participation of and interaction with different constituencies, organisation and coordination; The report *will* be drafted by Kenneth King.
- b) The draft report will be circulated to the NORRAG country cluster coordinators and key NORRAG contacts in agencies together with a small NORRAG inventory questionnaire. The

questionnaire is to solicit views on objectives, network structure, activities including project related activities, as well as interest in direct participation in these activities and role and function of NORRAG vis a vis Southern RRAGs. The questionnaire design, processing of response will be the responsibility of Wim Biervliet.

- c) Based on the report on the first phase of NORRAG and the outcomes of the inventory a new draft NORRAG mandate **Will** be prepared by the joint coordinators. (KK and WB). Equally the report should yield insight enabling identification of activities initiated in the first phase of NORRAG which **Will** be continued (e.g. NORRAG NEWS) and new activities to be undertaken (e.g. NORRAG involvement in research). This **Will** constitute the basis for the development of a preliminary draft of a workplan for a second phase of NORRAG including modes of responsibility and resource sharing.
- d) A review of the inter-regional dimension of RRAG in terms of consultation of Southern RRAG coordinators on the draft mandate and workplan and their assessment of these in view of the perceived supportive role of NORRAG to the South and the potential of inter-regional RRAG co-operation.
- e) NORRAG country clusters will be requested to organise a small meeting to discuss suggested mandate and tentative workplan. If deemed necessary one of the co-ordinators could attend such a meeting.

C. NORRAG MEETING

Full discussion on NORRAG mandate and workplan for the second phase including NORRAG research proposal 'Education for All: New Interactions between National and External Agencies' during NORRAG piggy-back meeting early 1991. Both for the adoption of the new mandate, the workplan and discussions on the progress of the planning of the NORRAG and the southern RRAGs Jomtien follow-up research projects, the participation of Southern RRAG co-ordinators will be absolutely vital.

The NORRAG meeting **Will** yield the transition from the first phase of NORRAG to a second with possibly diversified funding, project-related activities and co-ordination.

Wim Biervliet and Kenneth King

NORRAG GOES ERASMUS

The Department of Cultural Anthropology University of Utrecht (Prof. dr. L.F.B. Dubbeldam), Departamento de Pedagogia, Autonomous University of Barcelona (Dr. J. Domenech), Department of Education, University of Edinburgh (Dr. K. King) and the Institute of International Education, University of Stockholm (Prof. I. Fagerlind) are planning to offer a joint course within the ERASMUS Programme on:

Education for all: New challenges to European and North-South Development Co-operation.
The course is designed to expose students to the implications for Europe and the developing world of the obligation to provide education for all.

The first course is planned to be located at the University of Utrecht as a full-time course from Monday 6th of April till Friday 17th of April 1992.

Description Of the Programme

Rationale:

Currently, courses focusing on education in the developing world are very much affected by the historical experience of different European nationalities (e.g. Spain and Latin America; UK and Anglophone Africa and South Asia; Holland and East Indies; France and Francophone Africa). There is great difficulty, therefore, in students **grasping a European** dimension on education in the developing world, or on the wider character of different traditions of development cooperation, as well as heightening student awareness of European Community strategies and mechanisms for development cooperation.

Specific themes:

To provide a clear focus to the course on development cooperation in education, the challenge of offering Education for All will be adopted as an organizing theme. European Community countries were all signatories of the World Declaration on Education for All in 1990, and the Council of Europe played a key facilitating role. This implies that Europe, in seeking to respond to the much greater challenges of providing basic education in the developing world, will need to know more about its own experience of dealing with illiteracy, and of providing good quality primary education for all.

Sub-themes:

(a) individual national traditions of bilateral support to basic education (from UK, Holland, Sweden, Spain and others); (b) European Community mechanisms for support to education and training in the developing world; (c) Europe's experience of combatting adult illiteracy, and its lessons for the developing world; (d) New challenges to Europe's development cooperation agencies of providing support to education for all, by the year 2000; (e) Challenge to Europe's major non-governmental Organizations (NGOs) in responding to the scale and scope of education for all in the developing world; (f) Consideration of the enlarging boundaries of Europe, and of the implication for development cooperation with countries of Eastern Europe in the educational field.

The outcomes for students on the intensive programme would be the following:

- awareness of the richness and diversity of European support to education and training in the developing world.
- understanding of the European Community's current involvement in educational cooperation with the developing world (ACP countries particularly).
- Lessons from European experience in providing basic education (in Europe) for the challenge of education for all in the developing world.
- Awareness of the role of the NGOs as major partners with the governments and the European Community in supporting education for all.
- New targets and financial implications for development co-operation if the needs of 'the South' as well as of Eastern Europe are to be met.

Curriculum outcome One crucial outcome from the course will be a reader/coursebook on European development cooperation in education and training. This should fill a major gap in the many separate national courses on international and comparative education.

Assessment Within Edinburgh and Stockholm, this intensive course will provide the main basis for a full unit (to be offered for the first time in 1992) on 'North-South educational co-operation: the European dimension' within the Master degree in Education (M. Ed.). For Utrecht it is an additional course to the basic course 'Education in Developing Countries', within the Master Degree in Social Sciences (M.Sc.). For Barcelona this programme will fit into several graduate programmes of the University.

The course is full-time. It will attract credit within the structures of the participating universities. Conversations with universities in Spain, United Kingdom and Sweden have been held that would include them.

Function of the partners: In the first year the host will be the Univ. of Utrecht. Each European country has very different strengths of teaching and of geographical specialization on the Third World. Each will contribute to modules that reflect these strengths. The course will eventually circulate from Holland to Spain, to Scotland, to Sweden, etc.

Students: Proposed number 30 students, coming from partner universities as well as from universities in Spain, Holland, United Kingdom and Sweden which are expected to fully participate in the course from the first year onwards. Admission is open to EEC students in their final stages of undergraduate studies or postgraduates.

News from SEARRAG

SEARRAG had its 8th Annual Meeting from 30 April through 4 May 1990 in Bali, Indonesia. Three sets of review reports were presented to the meeting: Teacher Education, School Management, Efforts to Raise Achievement Levels in Primary Education; all three reviews were conducted on Indonesia, Malaysia, Philippines, Singapore and Thailand.

For the period 1990-91, three sets of reviews will be done in these five countries, (1) Learning Outcomes, (2) Mathematics Education, and (3) Science Education. The project coordinators for these reviews are: Dr. Moegiadi (Indonesia) for review on Learning Outcomes, and Dr. Panom Pongpaibool for reviews on Mathematics Education and Science Education. Planning meetings for researchers working on these projects were held from 11 to 12 September 1990, hosted by the National Education Commission, Bangkok, Thailand.

Dr. Arfah A. Aziz

From: SEARRAG BULLETIN Vol. 2. no. 1.

SEABAS - at last, a reality

At last, a reality, thanks to SEABAS, educational research materials are now readily made available to researchers and scholars at the press of a button!

SEABAS (Southeast Asian Bibliographic and Abstracting Service) situated at the Universiti Sains Malaysia's library, holds the key to unlock the hidden wealth of educational research materials unknown to many for ages in this region.

Inaugurated on July 11, 1989 by the Deputy Education Minister of Malaysia, Dr. Leo Michael Toyad, SEABAS is operated by SEARRAG in co-operation with Universiti Sains Malaysia (USM).

The funding body is the International Development Research Centre (IDRC), Canada.

SEABAS aims to serve as a clearing house for all educational research materials, promote cooperation among member countries in the collection and dissemination of bibliographies and abstracts and provide access to educational research materials in this region.

The contributors of the regional database, SEABAS, are Brunei Darussalam, Indonesia, Malaysia, Philippines, Singapore and Thailand.

The ASEAN co-operative network collects and disseminates information via their national centres (situated in each country) co-ordinated through SEABAS, the central regional clearing house. Each national centre is responsible to identify and index educational literature that is researchbased. These countries receive diskettes periodically from SEABAS to update their databases and vice-versa.

The database uses CDS/ISIS (Version 2.3) developed by UNESCO. It provides bibliographic coverage of literature related to disciplines such as psychology, sociology, philosophy and others. This includes educational research materials published or unpublished in the ASEAN countries. It contains references to journal articles, reports, monographs, conferences, theses and dissertations from 1970 onwards. The language used is English and titles of materials in other languages are translated.

Records from the database are retrieved by using search expressions such as keywords, subject headings and other access points like author, title, year, etc. The keywords are based on the EBE Education Thesaurus and the Thesaurus of ERIC Descriptors.

Those interested in the service can contact:

Dr. Zainal Ghani,
c/o Project INSPIRE,