



# Philanthropy in Education:

Global Trends, Regional Differences  
and Diverse Perspectives

**November 22-24, 2017**

**Maison de la paix**

The Graduate Institute, Geneva  
Switzerland

Organisers



Network for international policies and  
cooperation in education and training  
Réseau sur les politiques et la coopération  
internationales en éducation et en formation

  
SHEIKH SAUD BIN SAQR AL QASIMI  
FOUNDATION FOR POLICY RESEARCH



INSTITUT DE HAUTES  
ETUDES INTERNATIONALES  
ET DE DEVELOPPEMENT  
GRADUATE INSTITUTE  
OF INTERNATIONAL AND  
DEVELOPMENT STUDIES





# Table of Contents

Welcome .....	4
Keynote Speakers.....	6
Conference Schedule	
Day One, November 22, 2017.....	9
Day Two, November 23, 2017.....	12
Day Three, November 24, 2017.....	15
Conference Abstracts	
Day One, November 22, 2017.....	17
Day Two, November 23, 2017.....	25
Day Three, November 24, 2017.....	37
Sponsors and Organisers.....	43

# Welcome



*Dear participants of the Inaugural Symposium on Philanthropy in Education,*

NORRAG is very pleased to welcome you to the Graduate Institute, Geneva to discuss issues related to philanthropy in education. Without any doubt, the topic has gained prominence in the education community at large, but also especially among international cooperation and development agencies. Yet, the role of philanthropy in education is severely understudied. Whereas there is unanimous agreement about the substantial gap in government and donor funds for educational reform in developing countries, there is to date little debate on whether and how private donors should fill the gap. In addition to the principled question of whether the private sector should fund education, which following the tradition of the social welfare state, used to be clearly a government responsibility, a host of questions arise: How does the relationship between the public and private sector change as a result of philanthropic activities? Is there such a concept as socially responsible, equity-driven, and sustainable giving? What is the relationship between philanthropic principles and social impact investment in education? Are there regional and organizational differences in how philanthropies operate? How do motives, rationales and mechanism of philanthropic activities differ with the heterogeneity of private donors? To whom and how are private donors held accountable? What lessons can be learned from other sectors (e.g., health sector) or specific areas within the education sector (e.g., early childhood education and vocational-technical education)? These are but a few questions that seem to be relevant for philanthropy in education and that lend themselves for opening up a constructive and lively debate.

NORRAG's support for research on philanthropy in education is guided by different objectives: (i) provide a platform to present empirical research on philanthropy in education in symposia, publications, and social media, (ii) enhance discussion among those engaged with the topic, notably among researchers, policy analysts, government officials, experts in international agencies, and representatives of private foundations and civil society, (iii) disseminate widely research and promising practice on this topic regardless of whether the authors support or oppose private sector involvement in education, and (iv) facilitate knowledge development and exchange by means of South-South collaboration or in general regional cooperation. An effort is made to ensure the dissemination of critical and differentiated analyses, that is, studies that highlight both strengths and weaknesses, opportunities and limitations, or advantages and disadvantages of philanthropic giving in education.

For NORRAG, the topic of philanthropy in education is part and parcel of its larger portfolio on innovative financing in education, which includes research on public-private partnership in education, alternative financing, impact investment and domestic resource mobilization for education. It is also related and follows-up on NORRAG's work on Global Governance and the emergence of new actors in the global education policy space. This inaugural symposium in Geneva marks the start of a two-year series with regional symposia.

Following the Geneva symposium, other regional symposia in the series Philanthropy in Education are scheduled to take place in Francophone Africa, India, People's Republic of China, North America, Anglophone Africa and Brazil. The series will conclude with a symposium held in Ras Al Khaimah, UAE in 2019. Each symposium is devoted to a theme of particular relevance for the region and will discuss a wide range of forms, practices, and objectives of philanthropy in education. NORRAG will partner with reputable academic institution and private foundations active in the region and invite constructive participation from policy makers. This will enable us to ensure active participation of experts from all sides: academe, civil society, philanthropies, and the government.

We are grateful to the Al Qasimi Foundation for Policy Research for having approached us as partner for the Inaugural Symposium as well the Closing Symposium. The Inaugural Symposium is also co-sponsored by the Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies and the Open Society Foundations and is made possible with support from the Education Network of the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation-SDC. Since NORRAG is an associate program of the Graduate Institute and is clearly embedded in international comparative research and policy analysis, we rely on philanthropies to encourage their peers to participate in the debate and to promote broader participation from the South. We thank the International Education Funder's Group in this respect for the support they have provided for engaging philanthropies from the global South.

We hope that this Inaugural Symposium will enrich the debate on the topic and help set a research agenda for the following symposia of the series.



**Gita Steiner-Khamsi**  
*Director and Professor*



**Joost Monks**  
*Executive Director*



**Arushi Terway**  
*Senior Lead Research Associate*

## Keynote Speaker, Stephen Ball



Stephen J. Ball is Distinguished Service Professor of Sociology of Education at the University College London Institute of Education. He was elected Fellow of the British Academy in 2006, Fellow of the Academy of Social Sciences and Society of Educational Studies, and a Laureate of Kappa Delta Phi. He has honorary doctorates from the Universities of Turku (Finland) and Leicester (UK). He is co-founder and Managing Editor of the *Journal of Education Policy*.

His main areas of interest are in sociologically informed education policy analysis and the relationships between education, education policy and social class. He has written 20 books and published over 140 journal articles. Recent books include *Edu.Net* (Routledge 2017), *Foucault as Educator* (Springer 2017), and *The Education Debate* (3rd Edition) (2017).

---

## Keynote Speaker, Noah Drezner



Noah D. Drezner is an Associate Professor of Higher Education and Program Director of the Higher and Postsecondary Education Program at Teachers College, Columbia University, founding editor of *Philanthropy & Education* (Indiana University Press), and Visiting Professor of Education and Philanthropic Studies at Beijing Normal University. He is internationally known as a leading researcher on educational philanthropy. His research interests include philanthropy and fundraising as it pertains to colleges and universities, including higher education's role in the cultivation of prosocial behaviors. Currently, Dr. Drezner's work is based in identity-based philanthropy. In other words, he is researching how a person's social identities affect their giving to higher education and how colleges and universities can engage

their alumni in more inclusive ways. He is the co-PI for the National Study of Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender (LGBT) Alumni, a multi-institutional mixed methods project, and recently completed a population-based survey experiment, The National Alumni Giving Experiment, that evaluates how a person's social identities affect their propensity to donate and at what level when exposed to different types of fundraising solicitations. Dr. Drezner has published numerous articles, six books, and given several international presentations on related topics.

---

## Keynote Speaker, Maya Ziswiler



Maya Ziswiler is head of Social and Financial Innovation at the UBS Optimus Foundation. She spearheaded the Foundation's pioneering work on the first Development Impact Bond in Education in India and explores the role of non-state actors in education. Maya has also advocated for the importance of innovation and integration in early childhood development. She joined the Foundation from the Global Fund to Fight AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria where she was responsible for managing public-private partnerships. Previously, Maya worked for UNICEF in Peru and Procter & Gamble in the Middle East. Maya holds degrees in International Development from McGill University in Canada, and an MBA from the University of Geneva. She speaks English, French, Spanish, German and some Mandarin.

---

## Speaker, Natasha Ridge

Natasha Ridge is currently the Executive Director of the Sheikh Saud bin Saqr Al Qasimi Foundation for Policy Research. Prior to this, she was the Acting Director of Research at the Dubai School of Government. Natasha has a number of publications, including a book entitled *Education and the Reverse Gender Divide in the Gulf States: Embracing*



*the Global, Ignoring the Local*. Her additional publications include chapters in the World Education Yearbook and in publications of the Emirates Centre for Strategic Studies and UNESCO as well as working papers for the Dubai School of Government and the Al Qasimi Foundation for Policy Research.

Natasha holds a Doctorate of Education in International Education Policy from Columbia University and a Master's in International and Community Development from Deakin University, Australia. She is also a founding board member and former president of the Gulf Comparative Education Society. Her latest research focuses on the role and impact of Arab father involvement, philanthropy and education, and access and equity in the Gulf education sector.

---

## Speaker, Arushi Terway



Arushi Terway directs NORRAG's portfolio on Private Sector Engagement in Education, which includes innovative financing, philanthropy and education, public-private partnerships, and private sector support for the Right to Education movement, with a focus on socially responsible private sector engagement in education. Arushi has worked on education policy, planning, and development for over 12 years with FHI360, Global Partnership for Education, Results for Development Institute, SDC, and USAID. Her analytical and research work involved education finance, innovative finance, comparative analysis of education management policies, secondary education models and youth development.

She holds a doctorate in education from Teachers College, Columbia University and an Ed.M. in International Education Policy from Harvard University.

# Inaugural Symposium Schedule

**Day One: Wednesday, November 22, 2017**

11:00-13:00	<b>Registration Open</b>	Registration Area
13:00-13:10	<p><b>Welcome to Geneva and introduction</b></p> <p><i>Philippe Burrin, The Graduate Institute, Geneva, Switzerland</i></p> <p><i>Gita Steiner-Khamsi, NORRAG, Columbia University, USA and The Graduate Institute, Geneva, Switzerland</i></p>	Auditorium Ivan Pictet A
13:10-14:00	<p><b>Day 1 - Plenary 1: Setting the Stage: Philanthropy in Education Series</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Philanthropy and education: New actors, new partnerships, new roles</b> <i>Natasha Ridge, Al Qasimi Foundation for Policy Research, UAE</i></li> <li><b>Innovative financing for education: New actors and approaches</b> <i>Arushi Terway, NORRAG, India</i></li> </ul>	Auditorium Ivan Pictet A
14:00-15:30	<p><b>Day 1 - Plenary 2: Trends and approaches: Motivations for philanthropic engagement in education</b></p> <p><i>Chair: Gita Steiner-Khamsi, NORRAG, Columbia University, USA and The Graduate Institute, Geneva, Switzerland</i></p> <p><i>Discussant: Olaf Hahn, Robert Bosch Foundation, Germany and ESSA - Education Sub Saharan Africa, UK</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Policy-influence as a core business: Exploring the strategies of the philanthropic sector in the promotion of education reform</b> <i>Clara Fontdevila, Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona, Spain; Antoni Verger, Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona, Spain; Marina Avelar, University College London Institute of Education, UK</i></li> </ul>	Auditorium Ivan Pictet A

## Day One: Wednesday, November 22, 2017

14:00-15:30	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Non-state private sector engagement in basic education: A network analysis of implementers and funders in the Global South</b> <i>Prachi Srivastava, University of Western Ontario, Canada and Robyn Read, University of Western Ontario, Canada</i></li> <li>• <b>Private philanthropy and public good: Towards a framework for comparative analysis</b> <i>Tamo Chattopadhyay, American University of Central Asia, Kyrgyz Republic</i></li> </ul>	Auditorium Ivan Pictet A
15:30-16:00	Coffee Break	Hall Petal 2
16:00-17:30	<p><b>Day 1 - Parallel Session 1: Transnational collaborations in higher education</b> <i>Chair: Noah Drezner, Columbia University</i> <i>Discussant: Bhavani Rao, AMMACHI Labs, Amrita University, India</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Reconsidering development: Rethinking the relationship between American foundations and universities in Africa</b> <i>Fabrice Jaumont, Fondation Maison des Sciences de l'Homme, France and New York University, USA</i></li> <li>• <b>An international philanthropic coalition to support international exchange and online learning</b> <i>Jennifer Laird, RTI, USA; Maysam Ali, The Stevens Initiative, the Aspen Institute, USA; Chris Plutte, Global Nomads Group, USA</i></li> </ul>	Auditorium Ivan Pictet A

## Day One: Wednesday, November 22, 2017

16:00-17:30	<p><b>Day 1 - Parallel Session 2: Effectiveness of partnerships for sustainable development: Innovative models of public private partnerships in education</b></p> <p><i>Chair: <b>Ugo Panizza</b>, The Graduate Institute, Geneva, Switzerland</i></p> <p><i>Discussant: <b>Kate Lapham</b>, Open Society Foundations, UK</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>The private sector and philanthropy in education: Tameer-e-School (school construction) program in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan</b></li> </ul> <p><i><b>Muhammad Idrees</b>, Elementary and Secondary Education Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Promoting philanthropic activities in education through national incentives: The case of the Sultan Qaboos Award for Voluntary Work</b></li> </ul> <p><i><b>Wajeha Al-Ani</b>, Sultan Qaboos University, Oman</i></p>	Auditorium Ivan Pictet B
18:00-19:30	<b>Opening Reception</b>	Hall Petal 1

## Day Two: Thursday, November 23, 2017

9:00-10:30	<p><b>Day 2 - Parallel Session 1: Non-state actors and education policy: Critical perspectives</b></p> <p><i>Chair: <b>Natasha Ridge</b>, Al Qasimi Foundation for Policy Research, UAE</i></p> <p><i>Discussant: <b>Sabina Handschin</b>, Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation, Switzerland</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <b>Philanthropy in education: What's the cost?</b> <i>Nick Waterman</i>, Freelance Consultant, UK</li><li>• <b>The effects of external financial support on the capacities of educational nonprofit organisations</b> <i>Oto Potluka</i>, Center for Philanthropy Studies (CEPS), University of Basel, Switzerland</li><li>• <b>Problematizing corporate social responsibility and science education in Brazil</b> <i>Heitor Santos</i>, Swarthmore College, USA</li></ul>	Auditorium Ivan Pictet B
9:00-10:30	<p><b>Day 2 - Parallel Session 2: Philanthropy in action: Diversity in engagement I</b></p> <p><i>Chair: <b>Alexandra Draxler</b>, NORRAG, France</i></p> <p><i>Discussant: <b>He Jin</b>, Philanthropy Consultant, China</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• <b>How can philanthropy catalyse early childhood development at scale? - Case study of a partnership between the Children's Investment Fund Foundation and Sesame Workshop in India</b> <i>Sashwati Banerjee</i>, Sesame Workshop, India and <i>Peter Colenso</i>, International Advisory Group, Sesame Workshop International, UK</li><li>• <b>Harvesting philanthropy for development and education: Case from Pakistan</b> <i>Sehar Saeed</i>, Idara-e-Taleem-o-Aagahi, Pakistan</li></ul>	Salle S5

## Day Two: Thursday, November 23, 2017

9:00-10:30	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Case study – Turkey and Syria philanthropy for refugee education: Role of philanthropy in public policy</b> <i>Aysel Madra, Education Reform Initiative, Turkey</i></li> </ul>	
9:00-10:30	<p><b>Day 2 - Parallel Session 3: Role of philanthropy in global policy dialogue and financing</b> <i>Chair: Gita Steiner-Khamsi, NORRAG, Columbia University, USA and The Graduate Institute, Geneva, Switzerland</i></p> <p><i>Discussant: Moira Faul, University of Geneva, Switzerland</i></p> <p><i>Panellists: Ewelina Oblacewicz, OECD netFWD, France; Ian Macpherson, Global Partnership for Education, USA; Caroline Arnold, Aga Khan Development Network, Switzerland</i></p>	Auditorium Ivan Pictet A
10:30-11:00	<b>Coffee Break</b>	Hall Petal 2
11:00-12:00	<p><b>Keynote 1: Philanthropy and the changing topology of global education: The economization of the moral</b> <i>Stephen Ball, University College London Institute of Education, UK</i></p>	Auditorium Ivan Pictet A
12:00-13:30	<b>Lunch Break</b>	
13:30-15:00	<p><b>Day 2 - Parallel Session 4: Monitoring the impact of philanthropy: What have we learned?</b> <i>Chair: Gilles Carbonnier, The Graduate Institute, Geneva, Switzerland</i></p> <p><i>Discussant: Ewelina Oblacewicz, OECD netFWD, France</i></p>	Auditorium A2

## Day Two: Thursday, November 23, 2017

13:30-15:00	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Organisational learning requirements for effective monitoring and evaluation (M+E) by philanthropic foundations who finance NGO activities in African low income developing countries</b> <i>Raymond Saner, Centre for Socio-Eco-Nomic Development and Lichia Yiu, Centre for Socio-Eco-Nomic Development, Switzerland</i></li> <li>• <b>Maximising your philanthropic impact: An introduction to research and evaluation strategies</b> <i>Ben Curtis, National Foundation for Educational Research, UK</i></li> <li>• <b>Changing systems and challenging inequalities: Ford Foundation's mission &amp; programs</b> <i>Riham Ahmed Khafagy, College of Humanities and Social Sciences Zayed University, UAE</i></li> </ul>	Auditorium A2
13:30-15:00	<p><b>Day 2 - Parallel Session 5: The catalytic role of philanthropy in early childhood development: International Education Funders Group</b></p> <p><i>Moderator: Bronwen Magrath, International Education Funders Group, UK</i></p> <p><i>Discussant: Peter Colenso, International Advisory Group, Sesame Workshop International, UK</i></p> <p><i>Panellists: Teresa Sguazzin, Comic Relief, UK; Maniza Ntekim, Open Society Foundations, UK</i></p>	Auditorium Ivan Pictet A
15:00-15:30	<b>Coffee Break</b>	Hall Petal 2
15:30-16:30	<p><b>Keynote 2: The global growth of education philanthropy worldwide: Exploring the creation of new cultures of alumni giving</b></p> <p><i>Noah Drezner, Columbia University, USA</i></p>	Auditorium Ivan Pictet A

## Day Three: Friday, November 24, 2017

9:00-10:00	<p><b>Keynote 3: The catalytic role of private philanthropy in building the ecosystem for innovative financing in education</b></p> <p><i>Maya Ziswiler, UBS Optimus Foundation, Switzerland</i></p>	Auditorium Ivan Pictet B
10:00-10:30	<b>Coffee Break</b>	Hall Petal 2
10:30-12:00	<p><b>Day 3 - Parallel Session 1: Filling the gap – How is education philanthropy responding to the financing gap?</b></p> <p><i>Chair: Michel Carton, NORRAG, Switzerland</i></p> <p><i>Discussant: Charles Sellen, French Agency for Development, France</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Philanthropic engagement in education: In support for education for all</b></li> </ul> <p><i>Ahmad Dawood, Punjab Board of Investment and Trade, Pakistan</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Multifaceted interdependence between philanthropy and sustainable development</b></li> </ul> <p><i>Gunay Faradova, Independent Researcher, France</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Harnessing the potential of corporations and foundations for education</b></li> </ul> <p><i>Yuki Murakami, UNESCO Global Education Monitoring Report, France</i></p>	Auditorium Ivan Pictet B

## Day Three: Friday, November 24, 2017

10:30-12:00	<p><b>Day 3 - Parallel Session 2: Philanthropy in action: Diversity in engagement II</b></p> <p><i>Chair: <b>Joost Monks</b>, NORRAG, Switzerland</i></p> <p><i>Discussant: <b>Etienne Eichenberger</b>, Swiss Philanthropy Foundation, Switzerland</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Teach for India – A multi-stakeholder approach of philanthropy in education sector</b> <i>Beena Salim Saji, Abu Dhabi Men's College (Higher Colleges of Technology), UAE</i></li> <li>• <b>Corporate philanthropy/corporate social responsibility in education: A case study of education CSR practices by Nigerian companies</b> <i>Inyang Udo-Umoren, The Education Partnership Centre, Nigeria</i></li> <li>• <b>A will in search of a way: Emerging philanthropic education models in Peru</b> <i>Matthew Bird, Graduate School of Business, Universidad del Pacífico, Peru and <b>Vicente M. León</b>, Faculty of Economics and Finance, Universidad del Pacífico, Peru</i></li> </ul>	Auditorium A2
12:15-13:00	<p><b>Closing statement and next steps</b></p> <p><i>Joost Monks, NORRAG, Switzerland</i></p> <p><i>Natasha Ridge, Al Qasimi Foundation for Policy Research, UAE</i></p> <p><i>Kate Lapham, Open Society Foundations, UK</i></p>	Auditorium Ivan Pictet B
13:00	<b>End of Symposium</b>	

## Abstracts

November 22, 2017

Day 1 - Plenary 1

### Setting the Stage: Philanthropy in Education Series

#### Philanthropy and education: New Actors, new partnerships, new roles

*Natasha Ridge, Al Qasimi Foundation for Policy Research, UAE*

Over the past 40 years, there has been an explosion in the number of self-identifying philanthropic organization, with many of these operating in the education sector (Sannodal, 2016). While the majority of these are traditional foundations, in that they were established by wealthy individuals from the private sector such as the Michael and Susan Dell Foundation, a new set of philanthropic actors are emerging in the Global South. These new actors have been established by government and semi-government entities but are legally separate entities from national governments. In the MENA region alone, close to 50% of all philanthropic foundations working in education are publically funded to one degree or another (Ridge & Kippels, forthcoming). Two of the largest of these are Dubai Cares in the United Arab Emirates and Education Above All in Qatar, which have combined funds of over USD \$2.2 billion (Education Above All, 2015; Ibrahim & Sherif, 2008).

These state-funded philanthropic organizations are also forming new partnerships with both the private sector (often through CSR initiatives) and international organizations, such as UNESCO and the OECD, in order to leverage funds and grow global influence (GESF, Varkey Foundation, UNESCO, & Dubai Cares, 2015; OECD, 2017; UNESCO, 2011). While increasing academic attention is paid to large individual philanthropic organizations, such as the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation, this presentation examines these new philanthropic actors, the increasing role they are playing in the global education sector, and the possible risks their approach may pose to democratic conceptions of education.

#### Innovative financing for education: New actors and approaches

*Arushi Terway, NORRAG, India*

Given developing countries' growing education financing needs, the decline in global aid to education (which, despite an upturn in 2014, has still not returned to its 2010 peak), and the perceived success of innovative financing in health, various organizations have started to explore innovative financing mechanisms for education, in order to raise additional investment, spend existing resources more effectively and find novel approaches to education challenges. While innovative financing in the development sector, especially health and climate change, have raised substantial funding, education has yet to access very much of these funds. One of the attractions of innovative financing is its ability to attract new sources of funding as they are perceived to be more commercially oriented and utilize business-like and impact-oriented management approaches.

As little experience exists in the education sector on utilizing innovative financing mechanisms, this study examines the potential for it along with the arguments in support and against innovative financing in education. Innovative financing here is defined as new or novel ways to generate predictable, additional and sustainable and making these funds 'go further.' The study especially focuses on mechanisms that raise funds from the private financial markets and philanthropies and defines overlapping concepts like philanthrocapitalism, venture philanthropy, and social impact investments.

## Day 1 - Plenary 2

### Trends and approaches: Motivations for philanthropic engagement in education

*Chair: Gita Steiner-Khamsi, NORRAG, Columbia University, USA and The Graduate Institute, Geneva, Switzerland*

*Discussant: Olaf Hahn, Robert Bosch Foundation, Germany and ESSA - Education Sub Saharan Africa, UK*

#### Policy-influence as a core business: Exploring the strategies of the philanthropic sector in the promotion of education reform

*Clara Fontdevila, Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona, Spain; Antoni Verger, Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona, Spain; Marina Avelar, University College London Institute of Education, UK.*

A state-centred approach is no longer appropriate to understand the process and orientation of current education reforms, not only due to the globalization of educational policy agendas and spaces, but also because non-state actors are increasingly active in the policy-making domain. In the current global governance scenario, we observe how the corporate sector, through its philanthropic foundations, has embraced new practices and discourses that transcend conventional forms of giving, and has adopted advocacy and policy influence as key areas of activity. Furthermore, we also witness how corporate and philanthropic actors, in their attempts to influence policy, are transcending conventional forms of lobbying and increasingly resort to less formalized policy channels and to a richer spectrum of strategies. Nonetheless this is an emerging phenomenon that has not been properly analysed and documented yet from an international comparative perspective.

This paper aims at filling this gap by analysing the emerging corpus of operating principles, procedures and strategies deployed by the private sector and, in particular, by philanthropic foundations in education policy-shaping processes internationally. To this end, on the basis of systematic literature approach, the paper systematizes four repertoires of action articulated by the private sector to promote different forms of education reforms, namely knowledge mobilization, networking, engaging with grassroots, and leading change by example. We illustrate each of these strategies with examples coming from a selection of country case studies encompassing different levels of economic development and different political systems.

## **Non-state private sector engagement in basic education: A network analysis of implementers and funders in the Global South**

*Prachi Srivastava, University of Western Ontario, Canada and Robyn Read, University of Western Ontario, Canada*

There is anecdotal evidence to suggest donors and domestic governments are increasingly focused on the potential of philanthropic and philanthropic-type actors in global education to meet shortfalls in education financing and provision. However, there is a dearth of empirical evidence mapping the activities of these actors and resulting trends. Despite the claims in the literature that emerging economies have a concentration of newer actors, concerted research on the engagement of local Southern actors is lacking. This is particularly, the case for those that have strong ties with corporate sector (e.g., corporate philanthropy, consultancy firms, etc.) and/or are 'hybrid' actors,

i.e., blend profit-oriented and social motives and investment strategies (e.g., venture philanthropies, social innovation funders, impact investment funds, social enterprise organisations, corporate social responsibility units).

This paper reports on a comprehensive mapping analysis of the scope and scale of such engagement in education in Asia. We conduct an original network analysis of more than 200 organisations drawn from five regional platforms for non-state private actors. Extracting publicly available data we map the: (1) range of actors and relationships between them; (2) scope and nature of programming areas; (3) sub-sectors of engagement in education; and (4) type of investment strategies. An underlying focus of this exercise is on hybrid actors and investment strategies, particularly those with corporate sector affiliations

Initial results show that hybrid actors, in particular, have a complex array of relationships, and newer forms of philanthropic engagement are prominent. There is also evidence to suggest that such actors focus their activities and draw from funders in the more economically developed countries of Asia, with a concentration in financial hubs (e.g., China, India, Singapore).

## Private philanthropy and public good: Towards a framework for comparative analysis

*Tamo Chattopadhyay, American University of Central Asia, Kyrgyz Republic*

There is already a rich literature that examines the impact of private philanthropic engagement in the education sector with respect to constructs such as education access, quality, equity, choice, efficiency and social cohesion. However, there is limited theorization as to the nature of specific philanthropic dynamics that lead to particular outcomes and impacts. This paper proposes a three dimensional analytical framework of philanthropic endeavours - Sources, Mechanisms and Purposes (or SMP).

Wealth accumulation in capitalist economies is inherently a competitive profit maximization exercise – often at great cost to public welfare. This is increasingly so in a globalized economy where distant lives are interconnected through asymmetric distribution of production and consumption. Consequently, sources of funds should constitute a core dimension of an analytical framework of philanthropic endeavours. From the fund usage size of the “balance sheet”, one could consider two further analytical dimensions in education philanthropy: mechanisms through which such funds are employed, and purposes that such resource employment aims to achieve. Together, the Sources, Mechanisms, and Purposes could potentially serve as a robust framework for comparative analysis of impact of education philanthropy in diverse social and cultural contexts by wide range of local and global actors.

The paper will demonstrate – through specific examples from the North (US, Switzerland) and South (Brazil, India, Emirates, and Kyrgyzstan) - that mapping the sources, mechanisms and purposes of private philanthropic endeavours in education could provide a helpful model for nuanced understanding of the pathways through which the public goods aspect of education is impacted by private philanthropy. In particular, the paper will demonstrate how the same philanthropic endeavour may simultaneously enhance and diminish the public goods aspect of education.

## Day 1 - Parallel Session 1

### Transnational collaborations in higher education

*Chair: Noah Drezner, Columbia University*

*Discussant: Bhavani Rao, AMMACHI Labs, Amrita University, India*

#### Reconsidering development: Rethinking the relationship between American foundations and universities in Africa

*Fabrice Jaumont, Fondation Maison des Sciences de l'Homme, France and New York University, USA*

**Background:** This paper offers a nuanced analysis of U.S. foundations committed to strengthening capacity in higher education in Africa. It looks at conditions under which foundations' efforts were successful in achieving their intent in higher education development in nine African nations. The paper examines the relationship between foundations and universities as both dynamic and complex when it operates within the context of international development.

**Methods:** The paper puts new philanthropic trends into historical context and examines the conditions under which philanthropy can be effective, the impediments that foundations often face, and the novel context in which philanthropy operates today. To capture the conditions of grant distribution that governed these foundations the study examined 13,565 grants made by American philanthropies to Africa between 2003 and 2013 for a total of nearly \$4 billion.

**Results:** Primary findings highlight the foundations' general tendency to make grants to English-speaking institutions. These findings also suggest that U.S. foundations applied a geopolitical strategy of investment and maximization along former colonial lines, in particular former British colonies, although U.S. foundations' geopolitical agenda might not be formulated with specific post-colonial considerations.

**Conclusion:** Donor-recipient relationships are power relations that are unequal and this inequality has a bearing on projects' design, implementation, outcome, sustainability, and ultimately impact on the development agenda. Embedded processes and institutional factors offer plausible explanations for either resistance or openness to change within the partnering institutions. Relevance to philanthropy in education: This study assesses a genuinely important topic while engaging two issues around which there is emerging interest among researchers and practitioners alike: the shifting grounds on which higher education globally is positioned and the role of global philanthropy within those changing contexts.

## An international philanthropic coalition to support international exchange and online learning

*Jennifer Laird, RTI, USA; Maysam Ali, The Stevens Initiative, USA, the Aspen Institute; Chris Plutte, Global Nomads Group, USA*

**Background:** This research paper focuses on how an international public-private partnership (the Initiative), managed by a prominent non-governmental organization, has attempted to scale and improve international opportunities for online collaborative learning and cultural exchange, often called "virtual exchange." The Initiative is supported by several governments, foundations, and leading technology companies. The Initiative funds international education programs that harness the power of technology to provide innovative learning experiences for young people, especially those who do not have access to such opportunities.

**Methods:** The Initiative's external evaluator is employing a developmental approach to analyse the effectiveness of the Initiative's collaborative efforts to grow the field of virtual exchange. Particular attention will be paid to factors that lead to successful adoption of educational methods, and the role of the Initiative in furthering that objective. Initiative staff and a researcher from one of its grantee organizations will contribute observations and lessons learned from their interviews with stakeholders. While evaluation of youth activities involves quantitative and qualitative methods, analysis of the Initiative's broader field-building efforts will be primarily qualitative.

**Results:** The creation of a managing partnership has allowed stakeholders from an array of backgrounds, with a range of priorities, to identify shared goals and areas for cooperation. Early progress includes a multifold increase in funding, the creation of common evaluation tools and metrics, the identification of challenges and knowledge gaps, and steps towards creating a research agenda that can shape the field's growth.

**Conclusion:** Collaborative philanthropic organizations have the opportunity to significantly advance important educational innovations by providing funding and supporting a shared body of knowledge.

**Relevance to philanthropy in education:** This study spotlights challenges and opportunities in education internationalization and the use of technology in education.

## Day 1 - Parallel Session 2

# Effectiveness of partnerships for sustainable development: Innovative models of public private partnerships in education

*Chair: Ugo Panizza, The Graduate Institute, Geneva, Switzerland*

*Discussant: Kate Lapham, Open Society Foundations, UK*

## The private sector and philanthropy in education: Tameer-e-School (school construction) program in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan

*Muhammad Idrees, Elementary and Secondary Education Department, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan*

**Background:** To improve the standard of education in the province Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Tameer-e-School program was launched in April 2014. It is an innovation program for provision of basic facilities missing in Government Schools in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP). Its aim was to construct new facilities and revamp the existing ones by raising funds through donations from the private individuals and organizations. A total of total 1069 schools has been uploaded on website from all districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa schools most of the selected schools lack basic facilities such as toilets, additional classrooms, computer labs, furniture, and boundary walls safe drinking water. A website was developed for the project and all the donations and transactions were made online, to ensure transparency and efficient delivery of work. Any philanthropist could contribute an online. Donors could support an entire school or individual improvements in the selected schools. The financial contribution was used by the schools' Parent Teacher Councils (PTCs) to improve the infrastructure of the target school.

**Questions of the Study:** To identify the challenges and lesson learnt during the implementation of the Tameer-e-School program and to study whether it has achieved its target or otherwise. Why private sector and philanthropist response was not encouraging?

**Methods:** The instrument of data collection for the research was a questionnaires, visit to target schools and interviews with focal persons of the project besides the researcher's observation and his own experience. The researcher conducted a pilot survey and used statistical techniques through which validity and reliability of the questionnaire were verified. The overall research method used was the descriptive analytic method.

**Results:** Total 1069 schools have been uploaded on website from all districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Details progress is given below:

- Total fund raised by philanthropists/private sector in Pakistani Rs= 33.0 M
- No. of Schools fully funded by philanthropists= 55
- No. of Schools fully completed= 42
- Missing Facilities fully funded by philanthropists/private sector= 68
- Facilities completed= 52
- Facilities in progress= 16

**Conclusion:** To improve the standard of education in the province and materialise its claims of change, the Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf-led (PTI) government had launched the project in April 2014, aiming to construct new educational facilities and revamp the existing ones by raising funds. The much-trumpeted 'Tameer-e-School' project of the Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa (K-P) government become political and was lost its direction. Most of was a philanthropists and private sector silently ignored to fund a political program, which was connected with a provincial political Government ,that was in constant confrontation with other main stream political parties in the country. Tameer-e-School Program operates through a system that does not ensures transparent criteria for selection of schools.

## Promoting philanthropic activities in education through national incentives: The case of the Sultan Qaboos Award for Voluntary Work

*Wajeha Al-Ani, Sultan Qaboos University, Oman*

Education is no longer the preserve of conventional, formal educational institutions. Rather, it has become part of the growing social responsibility trend which advocates

community involvement in social development activities. Voluntary work has thus emerged as a means to promote the involvement of civil society organisations as well as individuals in the various areas of social development, including education. However, like any other human activity, voluntary work needs to be sustained through the establishment of an incentive system that can mobilise and motivate volunteers. The purpose of this paper is to highlight the role of the Sultan Qaboos Award for Voluntary Work in promoting philanthropy in social development with a particular focus on aspects related to education.

The study analysed quantitative and qualitative data collected through closed and open-ended questionnaires from 17 participants. All participants are winners of the Sultan Qaboos Award between 2011 and 2014 and their voluntary projects are still active. The findings revealed that the Award had a vital role in motivating the respondents to participate in voluntary work (mean=4.28). The participants pointed out that the Award encouraged them to initiate projects that have a social value added and that such value varied according to different areas. More particularly, the participants highlighted that education-related activities contributed to ease the burden on the ministry of education. Examples of these activities included the establishment of kindergartens, raising cultural and technological awareness among Omani people, and enhancing the knowledge and skills of women in rural and deprived areas. The participants recommended that the Award should focus on creative projects that have a social impact and can contribute to national economy.

**November 23, 2017**

**Day 2 - Parallel Session 1**

## **Non-state actors and education policy: Critical perspectives**

*Chair: Natasha Ridge, Al Qasimi Foundation for Policy Research, UAE*

*Discussant: Sabina Handschin, Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation, Switzerland*

### **Philanthropy in education: What's the cost?**

*Nick Waterman, Freelance consultant, UK*

The New Public Management and the hollowing-out of the state rendered developing countries more susceptible to influences of external policy actors. The New Policy Agenda, in emphasising the importance of alternative service providers to the state

and a “contract culture” facilitated not only gap-filling in service delivery, but also penetration of policy spaces by non-state actors. This paper adopts a critical perspective on the potential impacts of philanthropic support for education on public policy. Utilising examples from developing countries, it concludes that philanthropic activities through Corporate Social Investment, and participation in Global Public Private Partnerships by philanthropic organisations challenge the autonomy of developing countries in conditions of their low national income, few or underdeveloped resources and aid-dependency. Erosion of the sovereignty of the state results from encroachment by external policy actors including research and the “politicisation of expertise”, lobbying and advocacy to influence policy agendas, and provision of service delivery which facilitates bridgeheads for marketisation of public services. Hence, influence on public policy can occur either through coercion or voluntarism on a push-pull basis, whereby philanthropic organisations may push recipients into policy conformity through selective and policy-based funding, or pull recipients to formulate policies that are compatible with their own.

## The effects of external financial support on the capacities of educational nonprofit organisations

*Oto Potluka, Center for Philanthropy Studies (CEPS), University of Basel, Switzerland*

**Background:** Official Development Assistance together with support provided by foundations contribute an immense flow of financial funds to the activities of nonprofit educational organizations (NPOs) in developing countries. Some authors criticize this mechanism of allocation, because NPOs’ capacities are channelled into managing foreign, rather than domestic projects or because it causes crowding out effects in public funding in particular countries. We address the problem of allocative inefficiency with regard to an OECD country that receives a vast inflow of external funding from the European Union: The Czech Republic.

**Methods:** Our analysis concerns NPOs’ financial capacities (size of assets and revenues) as a precondition for their other activities. We applied propensity score matching in combination with the difference-in-differences method to a sample of 633 educational NPOs and their official financial records for 2006-2013 for the Czech Republic.

**Results:** Statistical tests revealed that supported NPOs report higher levels of real assets and real revenues than unsupported NPOs, even before the support started. However, the median values of both revenues and assets of the supported NPOs were directly linked to the EU funding. In 2009, when no new calls for proposals for EU funding were open and the economic crisis hit the Czech Republic, the decline in real revenues

was about 24% for NPOs who received EU funding support, while only 4% for those who did not. A similar trend was also observable for the development of NPOs' real assets.

**Conclusion:** In summary, although EU funding does not reduce capacities in supported educational NPOs' in the Czech Republic, and only appears to have short-term effects, it nevertheless causes NPOs to become dependent on it for revenue.

**Relevance to philanthropy in education:** A greater knowledge about capacity-building regarding local NPOs would make the implementation of foreign assistance more effective and promote sustainability.

## Problematizing corporate social responsibility and science education in Brazil

*Heitor Santos, Swarthmore College, USA*

Brazil is known for its progressive approach to education, inspired by Freirean ideas and put forth by the National Curricular Parameters (PCNs) published by the Ministry of Education in the late 1990s. Over the past two decades, however, the increased influence of the private sector through its initiatives of corporate responsibility has significantly influenced the pedagogy of Brazil public schools, which have started to move from a progressive to a neoliberal understanding of the purpose of education. This paper discusses the role of international private enterprises in shaping the ideology of science education in Brazil, especially through their programs of corporate responsibility. I use the guiding principles provided by the National Curricular Parameters for Science Education, published in 1998 by the Ministry of Education as a lens to assess how, with the increased investment of companies such as Intel, the 3M Company, and TIM, out-of-school programs in science education have increasingly focused, not only on competition, but also on a particular conception of "science" which sees scientific knowledge as a product – a perspective which is not supported by the PCNs.

In order to construct a narrative of how these companies have influenced the panorama of science education in Brazil, I show how the types of science projects that most receive awards in the competitions sponsored by these institutions indicate a preference for projects that use quantitative data and can be easily replicated in other contexts. US-based science fairs have also been perceived as more prestigious than European competitions. These results serve to indicate the increased impact of international philanthropic work in science education, in ways that often contradict the basic principles of a country's education system. These findings should promote further discussion about the influence of international programs of corporate responsibility, especially in the field of education.

## Philanthropy in action: Diversity in engagement I

*Chair: Alexandra Draxler, NORRAG, France*

*Discussant: He Jin, Philanthropy Consultant, China*

### How can philanthropy catalyse early childhood development at scale? - Case study of a partnership between the Children's Investment Fund Foundation and Sesame Workshop in India

*Sashwati Banerjee, Sesame Workshop, India and Peter Colenso, International Advisory Group, Sesame Workshop International, UK*

How can Philanthropy catalyse large-scale and sustainable impact for children? This question is examined through a case study approach in the field of Early Childhood Development (ECD) – an increasing priority for parents, governments, philanthropic investors and the international community – in India. A theoretical framework is established for examining philanthropic investment through four criteria: (i) impact, (ii) scale, (iii) cost-effectiveness, (iv) sustainability. The case study describes a partnership between a philanthropic funder (the Children's Investment Fund Foundation (CIFF)) and an implementing partner (Sesame Workshop India). CIFF funded the repurposing and new production of five series of Galli Galli Sim Sim – the India version of Sesame Street – to be broadcast on national and regional television in seven languages: Hindi, Gujarati, Marathi, Tamil, Telugu, Kanada and Malayalam. The goal of the partnership is to improve children's educational readiness, health and hygiene, and emotional well-being. At the program mid-point, it has reached 13 million children on the national channel Doordarshan alone. Initial evaluative evidence suggests that. The CIFF / Sesame partnership is assessed against the four criteria of the theoretical framework, and broader lessons are drawn for how philanthropy can catalyse educational and ECD impact at scale.

### Harvesting philanthropy for development and education: Case from Pakistan

*Sehar Saeed, Idara-e-Taleem-o-Aagahi, Pakistan*

Philanthropic contribution to CSO's and social causes, especially education, has become bolder and more visible in Pakistan recently. Almost 98% of households contribute

more than Rs 250 billion a year to philanthropic activities while corporate Pakistan gives less than 0.7 % of its profits (Rs 9 billion) back to society. There is no systematic data collection available which quantifies the value of philanthropy in Pakistan but the activity is enormous in terms of reach and impact.

This study intends to explore the impact of philanthropy on three civil society organizations based across Pakistan. Idara-e-Taleem-o-Aagahi (ITA), The Citizens Foundation (TCF) and The Care Foundation are recognized as leading CSO's in education, establishing exemplary schools for the less privileged. A major chunk to sustain these schools is coming from crowd funding and philanthropy while the money is utilized on constructing classrooms, enrolling the less privileged, providing books and stationary etc. These organization together have reached out to children across Pakistan and now making a difference by adopting government schools.

Using data for the last five years, the paper explores the extent to which these organizations have been able to generate from donations and the utilization made to provide good quality education in rural areas of Pakistan. Our results show that together these organizations (through donations) have reached out to 26,000 plus schools and made a difference for more than 250,000 plus children (in terms of learning outcomes, teacher trainings, school infrastructure etc.) Individual case studies will also be shared to highlight the role played by these CSO's in communities and how the funds have been raised and used to make an impact.

In Pakistan, people generally prefer to donate privately to whom they know rather than to CSO's. Still these three CSO's are recognized as leading players and have gained credibility. Therefore, structured interviews with leaders and grant management officials from these CSO's will be undertaken to identify what more needs to be done to provide sufficient information to people to gain their trust. How are they making themselves transparent enough? The papers draws recommendation to highlight challenges and opportunities for philanthropies in education and way forward for civil society organizations.

## Case study - Turkey and Syria Philanthropy for refugee education: Role of philanthropy in public policy

*Aysel Madra, Education Reform Initiative, Turkey*

The "crisis in Syria" has displaced about 1.6 million school-age Syrian children from their homes. Only 52% of these children have access to education, whereas close to 48% remain out of school. 1) In addition to providing humanitarian aid to Syrian refugees, the international community has been emphasizing the importance of development and livelihood support, including the reestablishment and continuity of education for

refugees. Given that there is a funding gap of \$1.4 billion for Syrian refugee education 2) and that around 730,000 Syrian children remain out of school, philanthropic institutions have been playing an increasingly important role in the education of refugee children. 3) Focusing on the case of Turkey which hosts more Syrian refugees than any other country, this paper analyses the role philanthropic institutions play in the education of refugee children. In addition to arguing that educational policies targeting refugee children must be contextualized within an “inclusive education framework” to ensure that all students, native and refugee alike, receive quality education; the paper outlines the ways in which philanthropic institutions can support inclusive education policies implemented at the macro-level. With these actors in mind and adopting a donors’ perspective, it outlines the mainstays of formulating a holistic paradigm and an accompanying frame of action for inclusive education. The paper concludes by pointing out the need for more effective allocation of financial resources and emphasizes the importance of improving coordination between philanthropic institutions, international agencies, and governments as well as amongst philanthropic institutions themselves.

## Day 2 - Parallel Session 3

# Role of philanthropy in global policy dialogue and financing

*Chair: Gita Steiner-Khamsi, NORRAG, Columbia University, USA and The Graduate Institute, Geneva, Switzerland*

*Discussant: Moira Faul, University of Geneva, Switzerland*

*Panellists: Ewelina Oblacewicz, OECD netFWD, France; Ian Macpherson, Global Partnership for Education, USA; Caroline Arnold, Aga Khan Development Network, Switzerland*

Over the last decade, engagement of philanthropies in education has been increasingly expanding beyond traditional forms of philanthropic giving. Global and national level foundations are now a part of various partnership forums engaging in advocacy, research, resource mobilization and policy dialogue. The Sustainable Development Goals-Agenda 2030 has actively involved the private sector and foundations as essential partners in achieving the global development agenda (ex. SDG Philanthropy Platform, Private Sector Advisory Group, etc.). Correspondingly, within the education sectors, the role of philanthropic organizations is no longer perceived to be limited to being a source of programmatic funding but also as major stakeholders in global policy discourse and

agenda-setting as members of partnerships (ex. Global Partnership for Education), initiatives (ex. the Learning Metrics Task Force), and coalitions (Global Business Coalition for Education, International Education Funders Group).

This engagement of philanthropies in global education policy dialogue raises numerous questions for inquiry on the role and impact of philanthropic actors: How do philanthropies differ from other traditional actors in their objectives for engaging in global policy discourse? What are the differences in objectives of philanthropic engagement in funding local programs as compared to investing in setting global policy agenda? How do various philanthropies approach these objectives and how do they measure impact? What lessons can be learned from the experience of global partnerships in managing multi-stakeholder relationships that involve philanthropies?

In this panel, representatives from philanthropies, international organizations, and researchers will discuss the experience of engaging philanthropies in multi-stakeholder partnerships and policy dialogue within the education sector. Panellist will examine the objectives and approaches of such engagement and how partnership stakeholders measure and interpret the impact of philanthropic engagement in global education policy agenda.

## Day 2 - Keynote 1

### **Philanthropy and the changing topology of global education: The economization of the moral**

*Stephen Ball, University College London Institute of Education, UK*

This presentation will explore the impact of impact investing on the forms and modalities of global education, with a particular focus on India and the Michael and Susan Dell Foundation and more specifically still the UNITUS Seed Fund. UNITUS (managed from Seattle and Bangalore) is funded by a group of partners, mainly “technology veterans”, including institutional investors like MSDF, and individual investors like Bill Gates and Vinod Khosla (Sun Microsystems). These are, “high net worth individuals” (part of what Diane Ravitch calls The Billionaires Boys Club). UNITUS funds “early stage start ups focused on low-income customers” in areas of activity that do not attract “grand slam investments”, with risk capital, growth funds, bootstrapping and mezzanine financing. Here various segments, adjuncts and aspects of education in India, and the work of philanthropy, are fully integrated into a global financial infrastructure animated by a global financial super class of investors and technology entrepreneurs and the executives and senior staff of both the investment vehicles and the service providers

are typically business school educated, and the former usually have backgrounds in IT, the latter in banking or investment, often with leading global brands. There are multiple and murky blurrings between the state, the third sector and the economy, between public and private, between philanthropy and profit. The state is enrolled in these processes as an active, facilitative 'audience' and interlocutor. There is in India a receptive policy and political environment, a wide and welcoming 'policy window' for inward investment. There are financial, discursive and arguably social 'returns' achieved here, a commodifying and marketising effect, making education ever more business and market 'ready'. At the same time new spaces of policy are established, inhabited by new kinds of 'authoritative' policy actors who are taking on the moral responsibilities of the state as part of a global architecture of economic and social relations.

## Day 2 - Parallel Session 4

# Monitoring the impact of philanthropy: What have we learned?

*Chair: Gilles Carbonnier, The Graduate Institute, Geneva, Switzerland*

*Discussant: Ewelina Oblacewicz, OECD NetFWD, France*

## Organisational learning requirements for effective monitoring and evaluation (M+E) by philanthropic foundations who finance NGO activities in African low income developing countries

*Raymond Saner, Centre for Socio-Eco-Nomic Development, Switzerland and Lichia Yiu, Centre for Socio-Eco-Nomic Development, Switzerland*

**Background:** Philanthropic organisations are important partners in the SDG context (Goal 17.17). Their contributions are important but their performance and the development impact of their local NGO service providers needs to be better understood. This paper will deepen the understanding of the effectiveness of M+E used by philanthropic organisations in DCs/LDCs and intends to contribute to a refining of M+E in development assistance by Philanthropic Foundations.

**Methods:** The paper will apply a review method that combines a critical review approach with a comprehensive literature search and limited quantitative studies to produce "best evidence synthesis" (Booth, 2009).

**Results:** Promoting quality data with the specific purpose of serving implementers is a challenge for many philanthropic organizations. Developing indicators in cooperation with implementers would improve M+E effectiveness. More training for data collectors could improve data quality. Continuing to encourage implementers to use data throughout the project appears to be another lesson for philanthropic organizations to make sure that data does not sit on the shelves.

**Conclusion:** M+E has traditionally been used as an accountability mechanism for implementing agencies carrying out externally funded projects. Monitoring serves to track and manage data about inputs, activities, and outputs resulting from a project; whilst evaluation looks one stage later in the process, to see if outputs in turn translate into longer-term outcomes and impacts. New thinking in M+E systems is a departure from the traditional model, putting a new focus on experimentalism and learning (Yiu & Saner, 2014). These shifts in the development field generally and M+E specifically point to a new strain of thought about the purpose of M+E for philanthropic organizations engaged in development projects and leverage their experiences to accelerate the SDGs implementation.

## Maximising your philanthropic impact: An introduction to research and evaluation strategies

*Ben Curtis, National Foundation for Educational Research, UK*

A key motivation for global education philanthropy is making a positive impact on the world. But how can we be sure of achieving these goals? Are there ways of spending that could make even more of a difference? And are there lessons that can be learned from similar experiences elsewhere? These are all questions that can be answered by having a robust research and evaluation strategy as an integral part of any education program – whether it is delivered by a government or philanthropist.

This session will provide an introduction to what such a strategy should include, the research methods to adopt, and common pitfalls to avoid. It will cover a range of topics, including needs identification; developing theories of change; utilising existing evidence when designing a program; a variety of data collection and evaluation techniques (including observational and experimental methods); assessing value for money; and using evaluation results to adapt your approach.

The material will be presented in an accessible manner that is suitable for a non-academic audience, and will provide philanthropists, policymakers, and leaders of education programs with practical next steps for how they can begin to more effectively incorporate research and evaluation as a tool to maximising their philanthropic impact.

## Changing systems and challenging inequalities: Ford Foundation's mission and programs

*Riham Ahmed Khafagy, College of Humanities and Social Sciences Zayed University, UAE*

Since the 1950s, Ford Foundation has been one of the most influential international philanthropic actors. Supported by a huge fund, it has educational, economic, and social roles. Throughout its various programs, Ford pays a special attention to the educational and learning process; as appears in its annually allocated grants. Interestingly, it has an extensive domestic as well as global impact.

In this paper, I discuss Ford Foundation's philosophy and vision in influencing the educational and learning process. I argue that the Foundation has a holistic, structural, and sustainable philosophy in this regard. It pursues to changing disruptive systems of learning, fundamentally challenging inequalities of youths' social and economic settings to enhancing their maintainable potentials of learning. Simply, Ford Foundation seeks to change the learning environment and empower educators as well as learners by relevantly challenging inequalities in targeted societies.

I use qualitative analysis of Ford Foundations' programs to trace its role in shaping a creative environment that consequently allowing youths better chances for learning. The paper is divided into two sections. The first explains Ford Foundation's philosophy in terms of its logic and potentials. The second section focuses on the Foundations' related programs and tools in achieving its learning vision.

The primary findings indicate that Ford Foundation intensively work with local community organizations to ensure that not only educational chances are enhanced, but also social perceptions and economic inequalities are improved. Changing learning settings gradually leads to a more sustainable potential of the learning process. I believe that Ford Foundation's philosophy might be more effective in granting main goals of education; empowering youths and leading social change.

## Day 2 - Parallel Session 5

# The catalytic role of philanthropy in early childhood development: International Education Funders Group

*Moderator: Bronwen Magrath, International Education Funders Group, UK*

*Discussant: Peter Colenso, International Advisory Group and Sesame Workshop International, Australia*

*Panellists: Teresa Sguazzin, UK, Comic Relief; Maniza Ntekim, Open Society Foundations, UK*

There is growing interest in the role philanthropic and private grant-makers play in financing education and other areas of social development. But to see philanthropy merely in terms of its financial input to the sector risks overlooking the political and social capital these actors bring to the field. Philanthropic donors are increasingly coming together to form international networks to promote educational norms, to shape and advance global agendas, and to support policy advocacy at national and international levels. The NORRAG Philanthropy in Education Symposium provides an ideal venue to explore how networks of philanthropic donors are increasingly forming what could be characterised as global epistemic communities (Haas, 1992) or transnational advocacy networks (Keck & Sikkink, 1996) that use their field-based knowledge and connections to extend the impact of their financial donations.

In this panel, we will explore a specific case-study of networked philanthropic activity in the early childhood development sector. We will begin by tracing some of the history of philanthropic interest in early childhood development and learn about how private grant-makers have come together in recent years to advance global evidence in early childhood care, stimulation, nutrition and protection; to advocate for the inclusion of ECD-related targets in the Sustainable Development Goal Agenda; and to pool funds at the Global Partnership for Education in order to provide developing countries with ECD support in their education sector planning. Philanthropic donors have joined forces with UNICEF and the World Bank to launch the Early Childhood Development Action Network, which aims to coordinate action and share knowledge across communities and countries in order to improve services and outcomes for young children. Most recently, a coalition of private donors have begun working together to deliver a lasting shift in coverage, quality, and financing of support for young children and families affected by the crisis in Syria – and beyond.

The panellists are drawn from a range of regionally- and globally-active philanthropic organisations that have been closely involved in the initiatives described above. By sharing our experiences as networked actors promoting early childhood development, we hope to advance understanding of the role philanthropy plays in educational advocacy, norm promotion and knowledge production.

## Day 2 - Keynote 2

# The global growth of education philanthropy worldwide: Exploring the creation of new cultures of alumni giving

*Noah Drezner, Columbia University, USA*

The role of philanthropy and fundraising in many institutions of higher education around the world is becoming means to supplement decreases in government support and as a way to strive for prestige. However, while US philanthropic giving is rooted in the establishment of Harvard College in 1636 and a more concerted and systematic fundraising practice in the last 50 years, institutions of higher education throughout the rest of the world are only beginning to ask for alumni, foundation, and corporate support.

As state funding of higher education drops across the world towards more and more institutions will likely need—and in fact are beginning to seek—individual giving to support the needs of the institution and to remain leaders within the academy. With more and more countries, as a result of recent globalization and the increasing adoption of neoliberal policies moving away from funding education as a public good and passing along the cost to educate to students, educational philanthropy is increasing around the world. As such there is an increasing global audience for and research on this topic. Researchers and practitioners are looking to the US for both theoretical and “best-practice” approaches fundraising.

Philanthropy in higher education, let alone in an international and comparative context, is understudied. Foundations are increasingly supporting research and practice on educational philanthropy outside of the US. For example, since 2003 the Carnegie Corporation of New York has donated \$2 million to the Council for the Advancement and Support of Education to help non-American universities build an infrastructure for raising funds to cope with increasing costs and declining government support; as such there is a need for more research devoted to giving in these different philanthropic cultures.

In this keynote address we will explore the existing research on education philanthropy with a focus on individual giving towards higher education with a global perspective. Further, we will set the stage for future research and implications for culturally sensitive fundraising practice.

**November 24, 2017**

**Day 3 - Keynote 3**

## **The catalytic role of private philanthropy in building the ecosystem for innovative financing in education**

*Maya Ziswiler, UBS Optimus Foundation, Switzerland*

With an estimated \$25 trillion annual funding gap to achieve the UN Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), it is becoming increasingly clear that many of the world's most pressing problems cannot be solved without alternative sources of funding.

Private philanthropy can play a catalytic role in closing this gap by linking the development and the financial sectors. It can also help make the case for investing in education: it is critical for long-term economic growth and essential for the achievement of all of the SDGs. A dollar invested in an additional year of schooling generates \$10 in benefits in low-income countries.

Financial innovation has the potential to draw additional private capital to drive positive social change by offering new solutions striking the right balance between risk and reward whilst maximizing social impact. Philanthropy can help build the ecosystem for innovative finance and pilot new instruments such as Development Impact Bonds and other blended finance options. In this session, we would like to discuss 1) examples of philanthropic capital, which has been catalytic in crowding in additional resources for education 2) lessons learned from an innovative finance education pilot.

## Filling the gap – How is education philanthropy responding to the financing gap?

*Chair: Michel Carton, NORRAG, Switzerland*

*Discussant: Charles Sellen, French Agency for Development, France*

### Philanthropic engagement in education: In support for education for all

*Ahmad Dawood, Punjab Board of Investment and Trade, Pakistan*

With the pressure to attain the ambitious targets set by Sustainable Development Goals, to achieve Education for All, there is a clear need to mobilize additional resources to support the provision of quality education in developing countries. This realization for raising more resources has led to tap the potential of private philanthropy and social movements without thinking about the repercussions of these investments. While contributions made through philanthropy are definitely one source of financing social causes, there is little evidence for their support in education while raising concerns for transparency and accountability. This paper thus attempts to map the landscape of foundations/companies engaged in education in South Asian countries based on a review of publicly available data (for last three years) regarding contributions these actors provide. The mapping exercise will cover review of all the available information on philanthropic activities/contributions made to South Asian Countries by private companies, foundations, number of households/individuals. Through rigorous review, the activities will be studied and matched with the objectives set forward by Sustainable Development Goals- either directly or indirectly.

While the education budgets of South Asian Countries continue to stagger, contributions made by philanthropies are providing a window for better engagement with private sector and CSO's, reaching out to most marginalized, scaling up innovative interventions and solutions, advocating for policy reforms etc. However, the findings from the study indicate that these contributions lack coordination and connection with broader Education for All agenda. In order to reap its benefits, private donors/entities must play their role to work strategically while aligning all the actors against the targets. The paper will also constitute of examples of philanthropic engagement in South Asian Countries to better understand their level of engagement and will make recommendations for

encouraging the productive involvement of private philanthropy and social investments to support education.

## Multifaceted interdependence between philanthropy and sustainable development

*Gunay Faradova, Independent Researcher, France*

“If the private sector is the engine of growth, and government is the driver, then education is the fuel that runs the engine.”-World Bank Group President, Jim Yong Kim

One of the various underlying reasons for the shortfall in progress towards the MDGs is insufficient funding. Today, the international community is preoccupied with the implementation of the universal 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and its 17 interrelated goals. Notwithstanding that ODA remains as an important contributor to the sustainable development, all by itself will not suffice to ensure the implementation of the new agenda.

The Addis Ababa Action Agenda highlights the importance of the private sector, in particular, the role of philanthropies and foundations, “as vital members of the global partnerships that are required to meet SDGs”. Hence, it is a substantial step forward in terms of improving funding of SDGs, overlooked for MDGs that overwhelmingly relied on ODA.

The first part of the research is focused on the lessons learned and mistakes to be avoided, while moving towards SDGs. The 2 part highlights the role of the philanthropic sector as a promising contributor to sustainable development and not just as “gap filler” for ODA.

The last part showcased the development of philanthropy in Russia, a BRIC country that went through a transformation period after the collapse of the USSR. About 45 main philanthropic institutions, contributing directly or indirectly to education sector of the country, that fall under the following three groups, are being reviewed:

- Corporate foundations;
- Private foundations;
- Community foundations.

The publicly available reports and aggregated statistical data are used in this study, along with the documents and studies performed by international experts or organizations and the Russian Donors Forum. Given the lack of transparency, self-reporting, systematic statistical data as well as diversity of actors, the information presented in this study is non-exhaustive.

The paper concludes that various philanthropic activities strive to promote the development of education sector in the country. However, these activities are far from supporting the 2030 Agenda and SDG4 in its entirety, as they lack coherence and consistency and do not have a direct link with the global education agenda. There is an obvious potential from philanthropic sources to support SDG4, but to make it happen, they need to strengthen partnerships and cooperation, and to engage into the development of the education sector from a larger perspective.

## Harnessing the potential of corporations and foundations for education

*Yuki Murakami, UNESCO Global Education Monitoring Report, France*

Given the acute need for resources to support the achievement of SDG 4 and the gloomy outlook for international aid filling this gap, philanthropic foundations and corporations are a potential alternative source of finance. Based on publicly available information, this paper provides an update on the contribution of private foundations and corporations to education in developing countries, relative to an earlier estimate made in 2012 equivalent that they accounted for 1% and 4% of education aid from DAC donors, respectively.

### Day 3 - Parallel Session 2

## Philanthropy in action: Diversity in engagement II

*Chair: Joost Monks, NORRAG, Switzerland*

*Discussant: Etienne Eichenberger, Swiss Philanthropy Foundation, Switzerland*

## Teach for India – A multi-stakeholder approach of philanthropy in education sector

*Beena Salim Saji, Abu Dhabi Men's College (Higher Colleges of Technology), UAE*

**Background:** This research is done to develop a model of multi-stakeholder philanthropy, for developing leadership and skills in underprivileged education sections of the society. This model can be replicated in similar situations for skill and leadership development among poor and underprivileged social and ethnic groups in the world. This research focuses on providing insights of work of Teach for India – A not for profit organization in

India which is developing skill and leadership among the children of poor parents in major cities of India using young graduates who volunteer and join the organization to support its initiatives.

**Methods:** Study will use an exploratory approach using existing background data on the work of this non-profit organization and conduct focus interviews with volunteers of this initiative to develop a deeper understanding about the organization which is creating a wave of change in skill development, leadership and confidence among the underprivileged children who seek education.

A qualitative analysis of the data provides a clear understanding of the work and engagement of different philanthropically oriented organizations, youth of India, and personalities behind this initiative.

**Results:** A framework of philanthropy in education for the poor and deprived will be developed based on the data collected using a grounded theory method. The study will also identify altruistic and motivational reasons of these graduates in undertaking such a mission along with an analysis of several philanthropists who are part of this initiative.

## Corporate philanthropy/Corporate social responsibility in education: A case study of education CSR practices by Nigerian companies

*Inyang Udo-Umoren, The Education Partnership Centre, Nigeria*

**Background:** The public sector in developing countries, including Nigeria, continually face several challenges which include insufficient resources for funding education; poor educational infrastructures and amenities; and inability to maintain the required quality of education. Arguably, both the state and the private sector have roles in the development of any nation-state and the benefits of education serves both public and private interests (Adefeso, 2011; Levin, 1999). One of the avenues of private sector engagement in education is corporate philanthropy, often carried out under the aegis of corporate social responsibilities (CSR). This move is pushed on based on the premise that it holds promise of innovative resources to finance global education, particularly within developing countries.

**Methods:** This study adopted a qualitative approach, combining documentary analysis and in depth interviews to ascertain the prevailing areas of focus of CSR initiatives, as well as the motivations of engagement in the education sector. Themes and relationship between the themes identified in relevant existing literature on corporate philanthropy in education was used to develop a conceptual framework, which in turn served as the classification mechanism for analysing data gathered for the study.

**Results and conclusion:** The findings of this study reveal that the major form of CSR contribution to education in by Nigerian companies is financial resource, either directly or indirectly through infrastructural development of learning environment. It was also deduced that the motivations influencing CSR initiatives ranged from altruism to strategic philanthropy. Additionally, the findings of this study suggest that, with the increasing participation of the corporate sector in education, further work in this field may need to address the magnitude of contributions by local companies and how these contributions may be influencing quality and equity in education.

**Relevance to philanthropy in education:** There is a growing call for corporate participation in the financing of education; and while that is not their core practice, several indigenous firms have made contributions to education through their philanthropic divisions.

## A will in search of a way: Emerging philanthropic education models in Peru

*Matthew Bird, Graduate School of Business, Universidad del Pacífico, Peru and  
Vicente M. León, Faculty of Economics and Finance, Universidad del Pacífico, Peru*

As South America's fastest growing economy since 2001, Peru is now considered a middle-income country, which prompted international philanthropies to shift resources elsewhere. Yet its human capital remains that of a lower-income economy and its educational achievements ranks at or near the bottom of the international PISA evaluations. The lack human capital has spurred the creation of new local education-focused philanthropies with as many as 70% of initiatives tackling the early childhood, primary, secondary, and post-secondary sectors, according to our original recent national survey. The capital and the will exist for leading change, but clear strategies have yet to emerge.

This mixed-method study includes qualitative case studies and a survey of 156 philanthropic and social investment entities in Peru's ten largest cities. Our research identifies five models defined by funding approach, mission, transparency, impact evaluation, and collaboration. We then use Rosabeth Moss Kanter's "Even Bigger Change" matrix (2005) to identify gaps and opportunities with the goal of prescribing pathways to scale (Dees et al., 2004, Clark et al., 2014). As part of this analysis we explore at what stage of program development and what level of government philanthropic organizations should engage with the public sector to build capacity for scaling. We conclude by raising questions about the relationship between philanthropy and the State in the Global South, an underexplored area in current literature (Reich et al., 2016).

## Sponsors and Organisers

### About NORRAG



Network for international policies and cooperation in education and training  
Réseau sur les politiques et la coopération internationales en éducation et en formation

NORRAG is a global membership-based network of international policies and cooperation in education, established in 1986. NORRAG's core mandate and strength is to produce, disseminate and broker critical knowledge and to build capacity for and with a wide range of stakeholders. These stakeholders inform and shape education policies and practice, both at national and international levels. By doing so, NORRAG contributes to creating the conditions for more participatory, better informed, and evidence-based policy decisions that improve equal access to and quality of education. NORRAG builds on its distinctive global "brand" and network representing academia, government, NGOs, international organizations, foundations and the private sector. As of 2017, the Network has more than 4,900 registered members in 171 countries, 48% from the global South. The Network shares a vision of education development which conceives education as a life-long process and therefore supports education and vocational skills development in and out of school across a lifespan and in different educative sites; gives equal weight to knowledge and expertise from the global North/West and the global South/East and promotes the "voices of the South" or the "voices of the East" respectively; and bridges policy and research by providing data-based policy advice and by carrying out policy-relevant analytical work and research. More information about NORRAG, including its scope of work and thematic areas, is available at [www.norrag.org](http://www.norrag.org).

### About the Sheikh Saud bin Saqr Al Qasimi Foundation for Policy Research



The Sheikh Saud bin Saqr Al Qasimi Foundation for Policy Research was established in 2009 to aid in the social, cultural, and economic development of Ras Al Khaimah, a northern emirate in the United Arab Emirates. Established through Emiri decree, the Foundation is considered a non-profit, quasi-governmental organization and is the visionary initiative of His Highness Sheikh Saud bin Saqr Al Qasimi, United Arab Emirates Supreme Council Member and Ruler of Ras Al Khaimah.

His Highness places great value on education and research, and the Al Qasimi Foundation was created to generate a world-class body of research on Ras Al Khaimah and the broader United Arab Emirates, develop local capacity in the public sector, and engage the community in its work.

Log on to [www.alqasimifoundation.com](http://www.alqasimifoundation.com) to learn more about our research, grants, and programmatic activities.

## About Open Society Foundations



The Open Society Foundations work to build vibrant and tolerant societies whose governments are accountable to their citizens and open to the participation of all people. Working in more than 100 countries, the Open Society Foundations support justice and human rights, freedom of expression, and access to public health and education. Through its Education Support Program (ESP) and partners, the Open Society Foundations work globally to strengthen the right to education through grant-making, technical assistance and support for research and advocacy. For two decades, ESP has supported efforts that seek to ensure that states meet their obligations to this fundamental right and advance equality and inclusion. The program supports good practices in inclusive education and promotes the participation of grassroots communities and civil society in education policy processes.

## About the Graduate Institute of International And Development Studies



—  
INSTITUT DE HAUTES  
ÉTUDES INTERNATIONALES  
ET DU DÉVELOPPEMENT  
GRADUATE INSTITUTE  
OF INTERNATIONAL AND  
DEVELOPMENT STUDIES

The Graduate Institute of International and Development Studies is an institution of research and higher education dedicated to the study of world affairs, with a particular emphasis on the cross-cutting fields of international relations and development issues.

Through our core activities, we aim to promote international cooperation and make a contribution to the progress of developing societies. More broadly, we endeavour to

develop creative thinking on the major challenges of our time, foster global responsibility and advance respect for diversity.

We are a cosmopolitan community located in the heart of Geneva, an international city and a centre of global governance. By intensely engaging with international organisations, NGO's, governments and multinational companies, we participate in global discussions and prepare future policy-makers to lead tomorrow's world.

## About the International Education Funders Group



The International Education Funders Group (IEFG) is a member-led learning and collaborating network for foundations, donor-advised funds, and other private grantmakers. The IEFG is a diverse group – with over 100 organizational members from wide geographic, thematic and political angles. Established in 2006, we focus on basic education in the Global South, from early childhood up to secondary, formal and non-formal, youth skills and adult literacy (excluding most tertiary). Much of our work contributes to achieving Sustainable Development Goal 4 and we aim for foundations' grant-making, convening, and collaborating activities to have a marked positive impact on global basic education.



Schweizerische Eidgenossenschaft  
Confédération suisse  
Confederazione Svizzera  
Confederaziun svizra

**Swiss Agency for Development  
and Cooperation SDC**

The symposium is made possible with the support from the Education Network of the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC).





## Philanthropy in Education:

Global Trends, Regional Differences  
and Diverse Perspectives

---

### Organisers

**NORRAG**

Network for international policies and  
cooperation in education and training  
Réseaux sur les politiques et la coopération  
internationales en éducation et en formation



**SHEIKH SAUD BIN SAQR AL QASIMI**  
FOUNDATION FOR POLICY RESEARCH



INSTITUT DE HAUTES  
ÉTUDES INTERNATIONALES  
ET DU DÉVELOPPEMENT  
GRADUATE INSTITUTE  
OF INTERNATIONAL AND  
DEVELOPMENT STUDIES



**OPEN SOCIETY**  
FOUNDATIONS